

WB logo

FIRST

WORKING

DRAFT

Street Economy and Public Land in Karachi

Phase 1 : A Scoping Study of Karachi District South

Consultants: Arif Hasan, Noman Ahmed, Mansoor Raza

May - June 2019

Acknowledgements

The consultants would like to acknowledge the contributions of the following organizations and individuals in terms of surveys, field assistance, transcriptions, mapping, insight, writing, and editing without whom this study would not have been possible:

1. All the street vendors who were respondents in this study.
2. Qazi Asifuddin in his capacity as a Field Staff Member of the Department of Architecture and Planning at the Nadirshaw Eduljee Dinshaw (NED) University of Engineering and Technology, Karachi.
3. The Urban Resource Center, Karachi.
4. Architect Nurjehan Mawaz Khan.
5. Hamza Arif, Research Assistant to Arif Hasan.
6. Sara Liaquat, Senior Year student intern from Habib University, Karachi.
7. Duaa Sameer, Junior Year student intern from Habib University, Karachi.
8. Anushay Zehra Rashid, Senior Year student intern from Habib University, Karachi.
9. Faryah Saeed, Research Assistant at the Development Studies Programme at the Nadirshaw Eduljee Dinshaw (NED) University, Karachi.
10. Students of the Development Studies Programme at the Department of Architecture and Planning at the Nadirshaw Eduljee Dinshaw (NED) University of Engineering and Technology, Karachi.
11. Lawyer and Activist Abira Ashfaq.
12. Nausheen H. Anwar and Muhammad Tauheed of the Karachi Urban Lab at the Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi.

This is a preliminary compilation of the work done on the street economy of Karachi, as commissioned by the World Bank. The compilation consists of the following:

1. A summary of the significant issues and findings related to important aspects of the street economy which can, if elaborated help in the formulation of policy, or for promoting an absence of it.
2. **Chapter 3.1.** consists of the findings regarding the scale and manner of functioning of the street economy of District South. This has been put together by Professor Dr. Noman Ahmed.
3. **Chapter 3.2.** consists of the causes and repercussions of the anti-encroachment drive promoted by the Supreme Court of Pakistan and carried out by the KMC Mayor. This study has been put together by Architect Arif Hasan, Hamza Arif, and Architect Nurjehan Mawaz-Khan.
4. **Chapter 3.3.** consists of the investigations carried out in District South by Engineer Mansoor Raza and his team.
5. In addition to these three chapters, there is a list of the 123 people interviewed by the 3 groups, their interview transcripts, relevant maps and photographs of different locations in District South attached as **Appendices 1 - 4** and submitted along with this report.

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AED	Anti-Encroachment Drive
BRT	Bus Rapid Transit
DHA	Defence Housing Authority
EM	Empress Market
GEM	Greater Empress Market (now-demolished)
HRCP	Human Rights Commission of Pakistan
JI	Jamaat-e-Islami
KCR	Karachi Circular Railway
KDA	Karachi Development Authority
KDS	Karachi District South
KMC	Karachi Municipal Corporation
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
KUL	Karachi Urban Lab
KWSB	Karachi Water and Sewerage Board
LEA	Law Enforcement Agencies
MNA	Member of National Assembly
MPA	Member of Provincial Assembly
MQM	Muttahida Qaumi Movement
MQM-P	Muttahida Qaumi Movement - Pakistan

NCHR	National Commission of Human Rights		
NEDUET	Nadirshaw Eduljee Dinshaw University of Engineering and Technology		
PILER	Pakistan Institute of Labor Education and Research		
SBCA	Sindh Building Control Authority		
SMPP	Shahabuddin Market and Parking Plaza		
T2F	The Second Floor		
URC	Urban	Resource	Center

LIST OF ACRONYMS

- 1. Introduction**
- 2. Methodology**
- 3. Findings and Analyses**
 - 3.1.** Group 1: Kharadar, Lea Market, Jodia Bazaar and Environs
 - 3.2.** Group 2: Empress Market & Saddar
 - 3.3.** Group 3: Burns' Road, Sections of M. A. Jinnah Road (Lighthouse & Pakistan Chowk), Clifton and DHA
- 4. Conclusions**

- 1. Interviews**
 - 1.1.** List of Interviewees
 - 1.2.** Group 1 Interview Transcripts
 - 1.3.** Group 2 Interview Transcripts
 - 1.4.** Group 3 Interview Transcripts
- 2. Photographs**
 - 2.1.** List of Area-wise Photographs
 - 2.2.** Group 1: Photographic Survey of Jodia Bazaar, Lea Market and Kharadar
 - 2.3.** Group 2: Photographic Survey of Empress Market in Saddar and its Surrounding Areas
 - 2.4.** Group 3: Photographic Survey of Clifton, DHA, Pakistan Chowk and Lighthouse (M.A. Jinnah Road)

3. Maps

3.1. Group 1

- 3.1.1. Location of Districts in Karachi
- 3.1.2. Major Roads Network and Areas in Karachi District South

3.2. Group 2

- 3.2.1. Map of the Group 2 Study Area
- 3.2.2. Markets and Transport Situation of Karachi in 1947
- 3.2.3. Settlements and Work Centres of Karachi in 1960
- 3.2.4. Land use around Empress Market and Saddar, 2006
- 3.2.5. Locations of Hawkers and leased markets around Empress Market and Saddar, 2006
- 3.2.6. Trade typology of Hawkers in and around the Empress Market
- 3.2.7. Market trades pre anti-encroachment drive
- 3.2.8. Hawkers' Relocation post anti-encroachment drive
- 3.2.9. Transport connections to and from Saddar and Empress Market to the rest of the city
- 3.2.10. Locations of Interviews conducted by Group 2

3.3. Group 3

- 3.3.1. M. A. Jinnah Road 1: City Courts
- 3.3.2. M. A. Jinnah Road 2: Lighthouse & Adjacent Areas
- 3.3.3. M. A. Jinnah Road 3: Fresco Sweets to Dilpasand Sweets
- 3.3.4. M. A. Jinnah Road 4: Dilpasand Sweets to Khaliqdina Hall
- 3.3.5. Mohammad bin Qasim Road (off Burns Road)
- 3.3.6. Pakistan Chowk (incomplete)
- 3.3.7. Clifton 1: Demarcation of Survey Area
- 3.3.8. Clifton 2: KPT Underpass to Do Talwar (Khyaban e Iqbal)
- 3.3.9. Clifton 3: KPT Underpass to Teen Talwar
- 3.3.10. DHA 1: Gizri Commercial Area (between Clifton and DHA)

- 3.3.11. DHA 2: Embassies between Gizri Flyover and Khadda Market (Phase V)
- 3.3.12. DHA 3: Khadda Market (Phase V)
- 3.3.13. DHA 4: Badar Commercial (Phase V)
- 3.3.14. DHA 5: Commercial Avenue (Phase IV)
- 3.3.15. DHA 6: Baloch Colony Police Station to Awan Road (Phase III)

4. Other Appendices

- 4.1.** An Overview of Street Economies
- 4.2.** Space Consumption of the Vendors in Karachi's Street Economy
- 4.3.** A Timeline of Saddar
- 4.4.** A Case Study of the Empress Market: Its History, Evolution, and Demolition
- 4.5.** Group 3: Selected Typologies of Street Vending and Total Daily Sales
- 4.6.** Eviction Hotspots across Karachi in 2018 -19, as mapped by the Karachi Urban Lab (1)
- 4.7.** Eviction Hotspots across Karachi in 2018 -19, as mapped by the Karachi Urban Lab (2)
- 4.8.** Inside the Meat Market
- 4.9.** *Kohlu*: The Oil Mill

Introduction

This research has been carried out by three researchers and their teams. Their findings point to a number of important issues related to the street economy of District South, Karachi. The study also identifies the space consumption of different types of vendors in the street economy (see Appendix 4.2). In the case of Saddar, the street vendors sell almost everything: prepared street food, fruits and vegetables, dry fruits, groceries, shoes, watches, cloth, readymade clothes, vintage (imported second-hand) clothing, newspapers, toys, electronics, and posters. These items represent a variety of local and imported consumer goods, and since they cater to the average commuter, are also reasonably priced. Affordable amusement is also available on the street in the form of live music, palm-reading, fortune-telling and animal acts. Certain mafias also exert their presence, as they control the begging trade in the city, and have linked to sex-workers activity.

A number of services are provided to the transporters by hawkers and encroachments. These include auto-mechanic, selling and repairing tyres, cleaning of transport vehicles, selling drinking water and cold drinks to bus drivers and commuters and converting bank notes to coins for the commuters for which a charge is made. For an overview of street economies and their significance, refer to Appendix 4.1.

The findings of the three research teams deal with not only the business aspects of the street economy but also its relationships with other sectors, culture and nature of negotiations with each other and the state, which makes its functioning possible.

However, the most important issue perhaps is the scale of the economy and its rapid expansion which is so large that it cannot possibly be ignored. This is all the more important since there are indications that the State wishes to reclaim space that it has lost to the informal street economy and in this process, it is supported both by the courts and also, at least for the time being, by the Karachi Municipal Corporation. There are growing concerns among middle-income settlements and interest groups that natural drainage channels have been built over, public parks and amenity plots have been occupied, pavements have been turned into street markets for various types of businesses. All this is against building regulations and laws and

creates congestion, increases the flooding of the city during the monsoons and denies citizens the right to parks and public places. The street economy operates from many of these amenity areas and public spaces. However, it has to be borne in mind that the role of the street economy in occupying public space and violating rules and regulations is very small as compared to that carried out by formal sectors and elite housing societies.

There are also other factors also that are important. A number of architects are making plans to “reclaim” public space and carry out various levels of gentrification. In some of these initiatives, important citizens of Karachi have organized support for this process. Meanwhile, heritage has become an important issue and is being taught as a subject at various academic institutions and much of Karachi’s street economy is located within or on the precincts of important heritage markets and buildings. There is also the World Bank’s neighborhood improvement program.

Formal recognition has its own problems of defining terms, formulating rules and regulations, creating institutions that implement, manage, and monitor them and deal with the demand for space. In addition, the state is in the process of asserting itself by implementing existing rules and regulations related to health and production of food both at the street and formal level. This is already creating problems for the food-related street economy and for its clientele because as a result, not only has the cost of street food gone up, but also its availability is decreasing. As one interviewee put it, the choices are to eat contaminated food and die or to die of starvation.

These new directions and pressures are in conflict with the culture of the street economy and the manner in which it functions as is shown in Sections **3.1.**, **3.2.** and **3.3.**

The culture of the street economy has evolved from the traditional *bazaar* of Pakistani cities. The businesses have a culture of austerity and minimalism. The whole system functions on *trust*. Business transactions are carried out on credit without any written documents. This includes huge transactions of acquiring dry fruit from Afghanistan or Tea in bulk from Sri Lanka and Kenya. Retailers receive material on credit from wholesalers, and they all lend to their clients. Arrangements are made with local government officials regarding *bhatta* through a give

and take process and are invariably honored. Even where evictions take place, there is always a tacit understanding that there will be renegotiations and businesses will come back.

There are numerous players that come together in the creation of this economy and there is a world of interdependence among them. For a map of the major road network in Karachi District South, refer to **Appendix 3.1.2**. In many locations, shopkeepers want hawkers in front of their shops because they say that their presence attracts customers for them. When hawkers are not present, customers believe the market is closed and don't stop to do their shopping. There is a consensus that hawkers bring benefits to business. The transport sector also has a close relationship with the street economy and invariably tries to locate its informal bus stops where there is a maximum presence of hawkers and street vendors.

There is also a close relationship between important cultural aspects of the city and the street economy. For instance, *Ramzan* night cricket is an important cultural event among most middle-middle to working-class communities. The street economy has an important role to play in supporting these events and in some cases even financing them. The *Urs* or death-anniversary of *Sufi* saints is celebrated at various Karachi shrines. These are yearly events and it is the street economy that provides flowers, *chadars*, and food at these events. Many people wait all year to set up stalls for these events.

Food is another important ingredient of the street economy and the poorer sections of the population would simply not be able to afford food were it not for the hawkers that establish themselves in major commercial areas and recreational areas of the city. Not sitting on a pavement and eating is unthinkable for a Karachiite.

However, the most important function of the street economy is that it makes the necessities of life affordable to the working classes of Karachi both, through cheaper goods and the possibility of acquiring them on credit. The street economy also provides jobs, both part time and full time and helps the poor in beating high inflation rates.

Various forms of hawkers' *bazaars* both, formal and informal exist in the city. The formal ones are organized by the KMC and are usually held on Fridays, Wednesdays, and Sundays, where the working classes can shop in a familiar environment and at reasonable prices. However, over

time, the number of such *bazaars* has diminished, for reasons that are not clearly understood but need to be. There are also book *bazaars* in a number of locations where second-hand books are available for students.

The decision to promote hawkers markets of various forms rests with the provincial and city governments and has to be a part of a larger vision of the city. Irrespective of whether it is promoted or not, culture, need, and a well-established system will see to it that the street economy of Karachi will survive even in a somewhat hostile environment.

The anti-encroachment drive supported by the Supreme Court of Pakistan has also taught us a number of important lessons. As a result of the drive, rents of shops and for hawking in the area have increased manifold. In addition, large scale displacement has also meant that the KMC has supported the people whom it favors in reestablishing themselves. Those whom it does not favor, “it breaks their *rehris*, confiscates stock, and distributes it amongst its preferred people”. There are also serious accusations of ethnic bias in the process. There are claims that until recently there were 6,000 *rehris* around the Empress Market and the KMC annually extorted *rupees* 25 to 30 *crores* from them. According to counts taken by the research teams, there are now no more than 1,500 hawkers in the precinct where the 6,000 existed previously.

Negotiations for rehabilitation continue. However, unlike before, they are unequal because of the support the KMC has from the Supreme Court judgment. In most open spaces around Empress Market, shops have been developed post-demolition both formally and informally. However, the majority of the displaced people cannot afford these shops because of their high cost and hence continue to lose income. It is feared that a more well-to-do section of the population is taking over the precincts of Empress Market.

The book-binders who have been displaced, have suffered since the school season has come and gone but their clients have not shown up since they did not know where to go. Interviews show that the financial loss is huge and those who earned in five figures, now earn in three or less.

There is a general consensus among all those interviewed that the number of visitors to Saddar has sharply declined as a result of the anti-encroachment drive. This is also one of the reasons

for the decrease in commercial activity. Interviewees feel that this process will continue, making it difficult for the street economy to make a comeback in the Empress Market area. What has been lost as a result of the anti-encroachment drive are street markets where every conceivable requirement could be fulfilled in terms of food and gadgetry.

All the above factors will have to be taken into consideration if any policy recommendation is to be made and it has to be understood that in the case of Karachi, laws traditionally have been a source of injustice and deprivation of livelihood.

In the process of research, surveys and interviews of 123 persons in different areas of Karachi District South, a lot of information and maps, attached as appendices to the report, have been developed, which would be useful to a better understanding of the street economy and its various relationships for the next phase of the study. For complete lists of persons interviewed and a list of area-wise photographs please see **Appendix 1.1** and **Appendix 2.1** respectively.

It is the judgements that deal with law and its implementations, however the fact is that this economy has been operating for over 7 decades or even more, and is a part of a larger city culture linked to the economy of the city. The study has not been able to deal with the scale of the economy since it has been limited to district south and one has not been able to deal with the physical and economic displacements that it has caused except through a series of interviews with the affectees. The assimilation of this economy into the larger legal and political aspects of the city needs a far greater understanding which has not been studied by the researchers and it is hoped that in phase two, this will be an important part of the research. In addition, the existing rules, regulations, and procedures whereby space for this activity is made available and sustained have also not been covered, nor have the institutions that deal with encroachment related issues and their duties and constraints been analyzed. What future institutions and regulations might be required for this purpose depends on how this economy is viewed – an integral part of the city culture and history or something subject to law as developed by the legislative authority. If it is to be the former, then public debate on the issue related to this economy and its future has to be encouraged and sustained.

Methodology

1. The street economy in Karachi District South has modelled itself along the needs of the multi-scalar and inter-related economy that is generated here, large: port, warehousing and wholesale, medium: 'formal' retailers of all sizes and small: the mobile, semi-mobile and stationary vendors that comprise the street economy of the region. The consultants were divided in three groups so as to cover the dynamics of different settings, these were headed by Noman Ahmed (Group 1), Arif Hasan (Group 2) and Mansoor Raza (Group 3). In this way, this study covers street economy as prevalent within three distinct commercial environments of Karachi District South (KDS).

The groups agreed to observe and analyse the street economy, and its components, on the basis of 14 parameters. These 14 parameters were followed by all three groups.

1. Locations and advantages/ disadvantages of the enterprise.
2. Review of enterprise (whether suitable for street economy and the public space).
3. Enterprise employing workers/ more working hands.
4. Time zone/ timeline/ time bound factors.
5. Turnover, income, saving, benefit to the vendor.
6. Business model characteristics.
7. Issues of invisible cost.
8. Stability of the enterprise/ possibility of expansion.
9. Characteristics of public space where the enterprise is located, with a review of the services/ amenities/ support available.
10. Existence of mutual associations of similar entrepreneurs.
11. Perception of legality of the enterprise.

12. Understanding and possible response of entrepreneurs towards anti-encroachment drive.
 13. Ideas about relocating.
 14. Political support/ Relations with elected councilors/ MPAs, etc.
2. In all cases the information that has been gathered has been based on interviews of different actors in the street economy: clientele, hawkers, porters, affectees of the anti-encroachment drive, shopkeepers in areas from where hawkers have been removed, wholesalers whose businesses have been affected, heads of market associations and the transport union. There is a Case Study, attached as **Appendix 4.4.**, that explores the myriad relationships and perspectives of the stakeholders that operate in a Saddar area with historically strong linkages to both heavy commercial markets and street economy. causes, repercussions and sociopolitical dynamics of the anti-encroachment drive on
 3. In all, a total of 123 persons have been interviewed and the information gathered is available under **Appendix 1.** The interviews were conducted using the snowball sampling method. The analysis also brings forth the specific circumstances, challenges and issues that arise in the routines of the vendors that operate in these areas. Refer to **Appendix 1.5** for the master questionnaire that provided the basis for all the interviews conducted as part of this study.
 4. Dr. Ahmed's observations and analysis are given in Section **3.1** and consist of a deeper understanding of the complex and rather specific dynamics of the street economy at the busy, high-volume economic zone of the KDS: the port and wholesale markets' areas of District South. Since large sections of KDS have historically remained of mixed (residential and commercial) land usage, the local street economy not only thrives

within the larger economies of scale at work in the area but is also well-knit within the urban fabric. Group 1 conducted interviews in the areas closest to the sea port and warehousing activities at Kharadar, Jodia Bazar and Lea Market. In this area, it was found that for a large section of the population working in areas that host high volume and high turnover business activities, the street economy plays a wide ranging, important role in the provision of food and (other) services.

5. Group 2 investigates the parameters with respect to the causes and repercussions of the Anti-Encroachment Drive (AED) conducted at the Empress Market and its environs in the Saddar area. It is here, and especially at the Greater/ Empress Market and its surroundings that the warehousing and wholesale activities in the study area of Group 1, intersect with mass-retail and the traditional and particular household shopping patterns as they have developed in the area. Group 2 analysed the multi-modal interactions between the wholesale, medium- and small-scale shopkeepers, hawkers and service providers. The documentation of the AED at Empress Market includes a summary of the Supreme Court judgements that led to the demolition of the Greater Empress Market, the processes of removing encroachments and the post-encroachment removal policies (or lack of them) of the City and Provincial Governments and the response of the affectees and the market in providing alternatives. For the detailed documentation refer to **Appendix 4.4**. In addition, Group 2 has looked into the socio-political role of the media, the response of civil society and the multiple impacts of displacement on buyers and sellers at the Empress Market, before and after the anti-encroachment drive. Findings include the steep hike in real estate prices (as they shot up post-demolition), the decrease in the number of people going to Saddar since and the subsequent drop in vendors' average income, the displaced persons efforts to relocate within the same area as before and a better understanding of the multiplicitous connections within the formal and informal markets.

6. The research team for Group 3 consisted of NED Students and faculty members who were first briefed on the objectives of this research. The planning for the research process started in mid April and the survey continued till the first week of May 2019. The primary tool of the survey is a list of minimal questions that need to be asked with due attention to the fact that the nature of the survey is mostly qualitative. In this case, the response of the interviewees is important twice over, as it can also lead to further questions as they arise from the initial responses.

Types and number of vendors were counted and photographs and maps, attached as **Appendices 2** and **3** respectively, were put together to identify the proximate locations and agglomerations of street enterprises. Meanwhile, two of the team members were assigned the task of photo documentation of the surveyed areas.

7. After the collection of information and data, each group drew its own conclusions. These are given in the fourth and final section of the report under **Conclusions**, and are superseded by a general recommendation.
8. During the study, maps and diagrams have been developed to show the layout, market and transport connections in KDS, as well as the relative locations of hawkers and interviewees in the selected study areas, pre- and post- demolition maps of hawker locations at and around the Empress Market respectively, the number of hawkers at the locations, and are attached under **Appendix 3**.

LIMITATIONS

There was tremendous pressure on the teams to complete the survey before Ramzan (8th May 2019) for two reasons. The market either goes into hibernation in the relay days of Ramzan or changes its modus operandi after the fifteenth of Ramzan.

The team of NEDUET students that volunteered for the survey as part of Group 3, though enthusiastic and passionate, was constrained by the imperatives of their academic schedule and at times, was unable to fully reconcile academic requirements with the fast-paced research at hand.

Akin to the drawbacks faced in most studies, some of the respondents did not agree to talk. The research team thus faced two dilemmas: an extreme level of caution in interviewee articulation or the plain refusal to talk. A plausible explanation for this response is the recent, and still active, anti-encroachment drive that is taking place in different parts of the city. Refer to **Appendix 4.6** and **4.7** for the locations of the anti-encroachment drive. On the one hand respondents got the chance to express their frustrations and on the other, they were rather conscious and a bit wary of the differently dressed, pen-and-paper loaded strangers: probable stooges of the administration or the media looking to collect information as a preamble to an impending onslaught.

The spread of the study is excessively wide. It is not possible to cover all the stakeholders in the limited given time period. Even proper identification, mapping and the establishment of a network diagram of the stakeholders is a separate research to conduct.

The study is not very appreciated by local touts and informers of the police. At certain points in time, the research teams experienced them eavesdropping. In one incident, the student research volunteers from Group 3, were taken to the Clifton Police Mobile only to satisfy the latter's queries.

In a number of cases there was the definite reluctance to reveal the amount of daily sales, turnover of products and profit margins. The reluctance comes from the hawkers' fear of

documentation of their economy and the possibility of incumbent taxes. The responses were vague, evasive, circular, convoluted and far from being accurate. The researchers made conservative estimates to fill the information gaps.

Last but not the least is the bitter fact that there is no authentic data available for reference on the informal vendors of Karachi. Various media reports and estimates are available on the internet, but only in the form of percentages. Census was not performed and no socio-demographic profile of those ever documented. How many are they and what types of business they are in and exactly where, is still fuzzy.

3. Findings and Analyses

3.1. Findings and Analyses of Group 1: Kharadar, Lea Market, Jodia Bazaar and Environs

Parameter 1. Locations, advantages and disadvantages of the enterprise.

Karachi District South (KDS) is considered the oldest amongst----- all other districts. Since Pre-British, British and Post-Independence times, this district has accommodated the sea port, warehousing activity, wholesale and retail markets for the city. As apparent, each of these activities is dependent upon a large flux of people, employing various modes of transport and corridors of movement, to visit these locations. However due to the diversity of trading, manufacturing, warehousing and entrepreneurial activities, most of these locations become very busy sites for longer than the usual stretch of a working day. In many cases, the sites exhibit business activity every day of the week, with very few moments of closure. The overall time period for these activities, especially of vendors and hawkers on the streets and allied public spaces, remain extended. Jodia Bazaar, Lea Market, Kharadar and Empress Market are examples of sites where wholesale and retail activities coexist and protract due to the strong overlap in street based economic and service delivery activities. The relatively newer locations of Clifton and Defence Housing Authority display a close interlinking of retail and street economic activities at various locations.

The vendors, hawkers and street operators, hailing from a number of different vocations, have been integrally connected to these locations for several years. For instance, the Biryani vendor in Kharadar had been selling his food over the past 15 years and has since developed a clientele that frequents his stall for lunch, snacks and even to cater for larger occasions, such as festivals. The kabab and barbecue seller in Kharadar also falls in the same category. Some of the relatively new operators, such as the yoghurt drink seller (*lassi wala*) and lemon drink seller at the Thatta bus stop, near Lea Market, have prospered due to the solid flux of passengers and service providers that flock to this transit point on a regular basis.

Vendors and hawkers, like the tea cabin operator in Jodia Bazaar, often undertake observation-based feasibility exercises to identify ideal locations to run their enterprises. In several cases, the operators have developed links with the shopkeepers, KMC and police officials near their

enterprises, in order to ascertain spaces for running their business. The movement of people, visibility of enterprise, logic of planning props and other articles, as well as the mutual convenience afforded, are some common factors that have been identified as key determinants for hawkers as they identify locations to operate from.

The existence and operation of street based economic activity is consolidated as numerous trade and business activities continue and intensify. Another major convenience observed is the locational benefit to vendors and hawkers, as many of them reported that they reside in the same area, they walk to work and save on commuting costs. Secondly, the merchandise they sell is available at nearby locations and so vendors experience another aspect of cost-cutting. Many showed signs of not only optimizing their incomes but also building up assets for their families. The positive elements of operating at the right location is a huge advantage, which can help street operators to possibly graduate towards the establishment of semi-formal enterprises.

The vendors were generally satisfied with the level of amenities available in the area. As additions to major markets and commercial zones, their access to utilities including electricity and fuel (gas cylinders or normal gas connections) was found to be commonly available. Besides the ready access to transport on site, facilities such as overnight storage and common wash and ward were available. Whereas few vendors mentioned the range of services they utilized, none of them complained about any specific issues. In many cases, the vendors cultivated social linkages in order to acquire the amenities they/their enterprises needed.

Parameter 2. Review of the enterprise (whether suitable for street economy and public space)

The street enterprises documented in Jodia Bazaar, Lea Market, Kharadar and their adjoining areas were set up once the respective entrepreneurs had established a feasibility of the area as well-suited for their operations.

In most cases, these enterprises extend their services to commuters, visitors, passers-by, residents, shopkeepers and even government officials of various ranks and profiles. The busy transit-driven location solicits the need for low-cost beverages for commuters, as they readily opt for the cabins and moving carts vending refreshing lemon drinks or yoghurt drinks. Paan and naswar are consumed by large segments of the customer base, and hence offer a ready business opportunity for the vendors. Food stalls selling biryani or seekh kabab / barbecue, in and around the Lea market precinct, were the go-to lunch and snack option for a very large number of workers in the area. The *pakorey wala* also developed a substantial clientele in the area.

There is an intense demand for motorcycle repair and fancy services and so there is a wide customer base for motorcycle mechanics in the market. Not only visitors, but also an extensive number of shopkeepers, market workers and office employees use motorcycles to travel to their workplaces. Jodia Bazaar is in need of numerous low cost services for the multitude of visitors to the area. Thus the dry fruit sellers, candy / toffee and biscuit selling cabins and other type of stalls, knit well in the retail activity of the area. Given the fact that in the setup and maintenance of hawking, certain expenses were unavoidable, most of these vendors were earning well enough to keep their enterprises financially viable.

In terms of space utilisation, street operators are careful to fit into the bare minimum space, to not invite the undue attention of KMC officials or the police. In addition, where they operated on the arcade / extension spaces of shops or along the footpaths, they attempted to keep the confines of their props to the smallest possible scale.

Many exclusive items are also sold in Jodia Bazaar. A sizeable clientele is generated simply due to the existence of these items. The example of the manual oil mill (*kohlu*) is a case in point. Many households search for an authentic and 'pure' variety of oils extracted from different seeds. Thus, with the help of the *kohlu*, the oil immediately extracted from almonds, mustard and a range of other seeds, for cooking, hair care and other domestic functions, generated a special clientele that kept the enterprise busy (See **Appendix 4.9** for a photograph of the *kohlu* oil mill). Similarly the cabin selling chemicals of various sorts was an exclusive entity. Certain

households would purchase insect repellents and bleaching chemicals from the outlet for the everyday mopping of their house floors.

The scale of hawkers' scale operations did not display a potential of rapid growth. Most have a customer base connected to them through personal associations, allowing for transactions on credit, the supply of commodities and/or extension of services to customers' home or shops without any extra charge and other similar favours. In situations where the hawkers sell merchandise that is also available at the 'formal' shops, there is no real competition between the two, as the shops offer a far more enhanced level of services than the street vendors. For instance, the local chicken (meat) seller can only extend his services to households and passers-by; the scale of his operation does not enable him to supply to restaurants, catering enterprises or larger hotels in the area. Large business contracts are invariably monopolised by large shops and enterprises that have a stronger financial base, the capacity to supply on short- and medium-term credit and a robust mechanism to recover from negative transaction costs.

The limited access to storage space or similar options, forces the vendors to stock only as much merchandise as can be sold over the course of the day. For example, if the biryani vendor decides to prepare three vessels of food, it is due to the calculated sale that he anticipates in the area. The yoghurt drink seller (*lassi wala*) brings just enough material that will be sold by the early afternoon. Most of the material, raw and finished product, comprises of perishable goods which have to be consumed straight away.

Parameter 3. Enterprise employing workers and more helping hands.

Depending upon the nature of the enterprise and the activities conducted, vendors and hawkers employ working hands. The chicken stall in Jodia bazaar has two workers for the tasks of slaughtering and meat preparation respectively. As customers desire quick service, the vendor is compelled to hire and keep the helping hands for the smooth operation of the enterprise. Biryani and seekh kabab stalls also employ workers in order to extend their service to walk in customers or for delivery to nearby clientele. Motorcycle mechanics require helping hands to assist in the different chores pertaining to repair works. The tea stall depends upon

waiters and helpers to deliver or serve tea, take stock of and clean the utensils, tea pots and cups. The chemicals' stalls also require the input of helpers towards the appropriate storage and handling of dry and liquid chemicals. These and several other examples show that the street enterprises also extend employment opportunities to skilled, semi-skilled and even unskilled labourers.

However, many vendors prefer to operate without any assistance. The lemon juice seller and toffees cabins are cases in point. This is done to minimize the input cost and keep the operational overheads under control. In such cases, however, the burden of labour and fatigue also increases for the vendors and operators while the possibility of reaching out to physically distant clientele remains unrealised. Similarly, in situations of packing up and removing merchandise under the threat of bulldozing, the hawkers have to rely on well wishers or friends in the area for assistance. The decision to hire other co-workers entirely depends upon the operator, his calculation of workloads and the rationalization of 'wages to saving' benefits.

Parameter 4. Time-related factors

With the exception of a few vendors, most operators work for more than twelve hours at a stretch. The length of time largely depends upon the type of enterprise and service. The paan cabin opens up very early in the morning and remains open till about midnight. Similarly naswar stalls continues to operate for long hours in response to retail and wholesale requirements. Some joints such as the yoghurt drink spot operate till the time the ingredients for making the drink remain available. The business hours of the biryani and seekh kabab stalls also depend upon the availability of food. The threshold time for some stalls is slightly delayed in the day. For instance, the chemicals cabin, the portable oil mill (*kohlu*) and the chicken seller, start work from 10:00 am to 11:00 am onwards. They continue for the next twelve hours without a break.

It is found that the hawkers and vendors have to work very hard in terms of time stretch. An average of 70-76 hours per week is the usual amount of time the hawkers contribute to running

their enterprises. No one practices a weekly holiday. The only time they take leave are the days of the Eid festival (for some of them) or Moharram, when the mourning processions cause the main markets in the area to close. This tedious time engagement is especially tough for those who manage their enterprises without any breaks. There is no idle time between the need to be observant of incoming clientele and vigilant of petty thieves or pickpockets attempting to steal from the stall.

Parameter 5. Turnover, income, saving, benefits to the vendor

Despite substantial differences in the nature and scale of vendor enterprises, almost all of the individuals interviewed, reported a satisfactory status quo. Interestingly enough, no one reported any chronic loss or extreme intention to shut the enterprise down. Given the fact that not all of the hawker / vendor interviewees revealed complete or clear information, it was found that these enterprises were sufficient for maintaining their household expenses and, in fact, contributed to the accretion of some assets. Enterprises such as the Biryani cabin, Seekh Kabab stall, Chemical cabin, Paan shop, Naswar shop, Yoghurt drink outlet and Dry fruit joints seemingly possessed a stable turn over, regular savings and a clearly defined clientele. The fact that some of them resented certain elements and the overall ambience of their business showed financial strength, is enough to deduce that these are well performing enterprises. The other enterprises such as Tea cabin, Chicken stall, Lemon drink and *Chaat* stalls showed signs of accruing reasonable income. The business acumen of some folks was greater than others which was encapsulated by the former to keep their space clean and inviting, and also in their enhancement of the visibility of their enterprise so as to attract their respective clientele. It appears that they were reasonably aware of the strategic advantage and selling points of their merchandise and/or services. For example, the dry fruit vendor scaled up the quality and quantity of dry fruit during the winter season, which in turn brought them greater revenue. Similarly the lemon drink seller would limit his operations during the short spell of cold in winters so as not to lose on any investment.

Parameter 6. Business model characteristics

The informal trade links between the hawkers, shopkeepers and other stakeholders on site, are useful and effective for their routine operations. Many enterprises operate by acquiring items of merchandise on credit. This relationship is very common not only for vendors but also for shopkeepers. The time and credit limit are usually dependent upon the typology, the goodwill and credibility of the enterprises. For instance, the chemicals' stall vendor, chicken seller, tea cabin vendor etc. acquire material on credit from wholesale points in the area. According to mutually agreed terms and conditions, they pay back the entire or part of the amount on a daily basis. Some vendors such as yoghurt drink and lemon drink seller would acquire material from wholesale joints through pre-payments. They argued that due to this mode, they received a substantial discount. The hawkers and vendors generally made a very careful assessment in pricing their stock towards maximising profit while ensuring acceptable levels of quality. In doing so, they also explore different forms and formats of transactions. For instance, many vendors sell items on credit to the clients they were familiar with. In these cases, the payments were received on a weekly, fortnightly or monthly basis. Some even allowed 'pay as you can' type transactions. The paan and naswar stall operators usually subscribed to this mode. The yoghurt drink seller supplied regular drinks to bus drivers and cleaners and received payments from them on a weekly basis. The entire accounting and stock-taking was done on the reliance of memory and mutual trust. In the case of live chicken supply, a rolling advance was paid by the hawker to the wholesale van. Once the number of chickens worth the amount was delivered, the next tranche was due. This is due to the fact that the wholesale van operator has to make onwards payment to the main poultry farm or supply warehouse. In some cases, vendors also purchased items in bulk for long term storage. Dry fruits procurement is an example.

Parameter 7. Issues in invisible cost

All the vendors and hawkers confirmed that they pay extortion money to the KMC and police officials. They also confirmed that a higher share was paid to KMC officials and the lesser amount was paid to police officials. The vendors and hawkers generally consider extortion money as a financial cost to be necessarily incurred for their operation in different types of public open spaces. However most of them clearly stated that the paying and charging of extortion money is illegal in nature. They lamented the situation and believed that had there been a legal and administrative procedure for them to operate within public space, all of this money would be deposited within the official fund of the KMC or other institutions to improve their situation.

Several vendors were of the opinion that the launch and conduct of the ongoing anti-encroachment drive in different commercial and residential locations was, in fact, an attempt to raise the rates of extortion money. They believe that in the case of threats of demolition, they would be in a position to negotiate for a higher rate of extortion money so as to save them from destruction. Many also held the staff collecting the extortion money as those responsible for liaising with top officials to initiate an anti-encroachment drive to forge a new, higher rate of extortion.

Very few people revealed the actual rates of extortion money. The amounts stated, varied between Rs. 7000 per month (as informed by lemon drink vendor in Jodia Bazaar) and Rs. 8000/- by (the tea stall operator) in the same area. The chicken stall operator informed that the KMC officials collected Rs. 500 per week while police functionaries took Rs. 300 per week. Sometimes the traffic police would also charge money. This fact also proved that public space is definitely managed by municipal staff and other agencies through the instrument of extortion money. Thus the adjustment of public space in the entire area was done through this clandestine financial relationship between the vendors and public officials. Once the extortion money was collected, public functionaries would not bother them in any operational respect.

Parameter 8. Stability of enterprises / Possibility of expansion

As seen in various cases, the vendors and hawkers were running stable enterprises. This stability was visible from various references. The vendors were successful in negotiating a working arrangement with KMC and police officials to operate. There was no incidence found or reported where the vendors were removed or given any kind of eviction notices. The vendors had acquired the trust of those wholesalers and/or shopkeepers from whom they purchased raw materials or bulk articles for retail. As several of these transactions were based on credit, it proved that the vendors possessed reasonable trading credibility which in turn made their operations trustworthy. Furthermore, the clientele that frequented their stalls and bought goods or services from them, also trusted them. They were found selling articles of certain acceptable standards at prices and conditions that had been mutually agreed upon by both parties.

There was a mixed response in the context of vendors expanding their enterprise. In one case, negative ethno-political dynamics limited the possibility for expansion. In other cases, the precarious nature of public spaces (in the context of hawking) for expanding the enterprise was an issue. People believed that if they would expand, the rate of extortion money would increase in lieu of the KMC officials' assumption that the hawkers have become more affluent. Besides, there was no external support, in the form of credit availability or technical guidance, to make them think beyond the current setup.

Parameter 9. Characteristics of public spaces where the enterprises are located

The locations of vendor and hawker operations displayed a complex but interesting morphology. Jodia Bazaar is a multi-faceted, organic and seemingly congested urban ensemble that comprises wholesale, retail, warehousing and brokerage undertakings. Other urban functions commonly sighted in the area include parking, temporary storage of goods for short periods of time and man-driven and animal push carts. Pedestrians make their way through these activities and obstacles as part of their routine. Due to the enforced proximity of moving pedestrians, vendors and shops, the opportunity for impulse-led purchases increases. People are compelled to pay attention to the vendors they pass by and often decide to buy from them.

Kharadar is a mixed land use location and also one of the oldest neighbourhoods of Karachi. Economic activities are almost instantly penetrated by the urban morphology of the area. Warehousing, wholesale, retail, agency outlets, wholesale and vending options are very visible. The streets in Kharadar have robust economic potential that is visible in many of its sub locations. Narrow, winding lanes provide a shared usage for different types of economic undertakings and service functions. Besides parking, mobility and access, the streets and adjoining spaces also show a range of vendor activities that are inseparably knitted in the local urban fabric. From semi-permanent and immovable enterprises to the fluidity of hawkers, there is a rich mix of vendor functions where small spaces host intense retail and service-oriented activities. Lea Market and its environs display an extension of the spaces and activities that were observed in Jodia Bazaar and Kharadar. Lea Market is a purpose-built retail market dating back to pre-Partition times. Its protracted open spaces, street extensions and adjoining areas offer a mix of wholesale, retail and vending functions. In addition, the Lea Market precinct is a transit hub for multiple modes of transport. The ancillary spaces alongside transport functions provide a ready opportunity for the vendors to set up enterprises that benefit the commuters and transporters alike.

Parameter 10. Existence of mutual association of similar entrepreneurs

The vendors and hawkers from Jodia Bazaar, Kharadar, Lea Market and their respective adjoining areas reported no link to or existence of any trade body or mutual benefit association. The vendors in many locations, however, maintained that they did benefit from their trade associations which acted to safeguard the interests of the shopkeepers. The vendors stated that they had an informal link with the KMC and police officials which streamlined their day-to-day operations. Some time back, these areas were under the influence of various ethno-political groups which targeted and fleeced both shopkeepers and vendors in the form of extortion. A massive security operation successfully halted the activities of these politically-backed extortionists. However, the KMC and police staff continued to draw money and in exchange grant vendors and other stakeholders, the right to operate here. It seems associations were not

formed amongst the vendors here as they hail from different backgrounds and origins and thus found no common ground to come together. In addition, such types of social and trade-based organisations require seed capital to operate and exist. The vendors generally considered any such possibility as a 'waste' of resources and effort. Regardless, it is believed that in the eventuality of any demolitions or mass evictions of vendors in the area, an association of 'affectees' may come into existence. Evidence of such a situation has been found in the case of Empress Market and other locations where demolitions have been carried out in the recent past.

Parameter 11. Perception of legality of the enterprise

Almost all the vendors were clear about the fact that their operations were not legal. They, however, argued this matter from different perspectives. Many vendors believed that they were legitimate in their operation as they paid substantial extortion money to the municipal and police officials. They assumed that it is for the officials to extend de facto protection and assistance to them in the case of any threats of eviction or large-scale demolition. Others believed that an alternative should be developed whereby extortion money could be converted towards formalised 'rent' for the space they occupy. Such an arrangement would save them from constantly being considered illegal or undesirable. A peculiar aspect of this issue is that the KMC does not have any formal policy or regulation to facilitate hawkers and vendors that operate on the streets. While most of these street enterprises have had a very stable presence for several years, no administrative sanctions have been extended to them. It is also important to note that even if an administrative cover is framed for the hawkers, it may not be able to take stock of the existing vendors. The process of any formal tendering or inviting expressions of interest may deprive extant operators from the right to function.

Parameter 12. Understanding the possible response of anti-encroachment drive

The vendors in Kharadar and other surveyed locations had an idea about the ongoing demolitions and anti-encroachment drive. They have mixed responses towards it. Some believed that the demolitions were carried out by the KMC staff in a bid to raise the current rate of extortion money. In their perception, a simple remedy to humanise this approach would be to renegotiate the terms of operation with KMC officials and potentially raise the rate of extortion money. Some vendors cited this approach as effective based upon their past experiences. Others believed that there could be other means by which the effects of demolition drives might be neutralized. The strategic removal of cabins and carts from the area or the vendors' temporary withdrawal from public space were some of the options. Few were of the view that it is impossible to 'fight' the government, as they presumed that one can only adjust in the face of such campaigns. They also did not consider any member of the administration as able to help them out, should such a situation arise.

Parameter 13. Ideas about relocating

For a sizable number of the hawkers and vendors interviewed, the option to relocate was entirely unfeasible. Many cited a long-term association with the area and market here as the reason. Others considered the necessary presence of their clientele and well-wishers in the same precincts. Hence moving away from the area would manifest as a blanket dampening of the economic performance of their enterprise. The vendors in Jodia Bazaar believed that their existence and operations were inseparable from their present location. A tiny number of hawkers, who operated from semi mobile cabins, referred to moving a few blocks away from the area for 'peace' to prevail. However, even this option was offered with great reluctance.

Parameter 14. Relations/ Support from Municipal Councillors / Members of Provincial Assembly

Interviews with vendors and hawkers revealed very little knowledge about the presence and role of MPAs or municipal councillors in their operation context. They could not identify a

specific support role for these elected representatives. While some confessed to know the councillors or noticed their whereabouts in the area, they also criticized their lack of input in the management of the area's affairs. Furthermore, the vendors did not have any hope of the councillors support, in the case that a demolition drive would begin in the area.

*The transcripts for the interviews conducted by Group 1 are attached as **Appendix 1.2**.*

*The photographic survey of Jodia Bazaar, Lea Market and Kharadar is attached as **Appendix 2.2**.*

*The District Map of Karachi and a Map of Karachi District South are attached as **Appendix 3.1**.*

3.2. Findings and Analyses of Group 2: Empress Market, Saddar

Parameters 1, 11, 13. Location, Relocation, and the Perceptions of Legality

Through the years, the Empress Market in Saddar has retained a bustling and diverse commercial character, one that addressed the needs of the people of Karachi and has correspondingly evolved to accommodate the city's explosive population growth. An archetype of Karachi, its people have been frequenting the place for generations. There is a twofold reason for this: the first is the range and affordability of products in the vicinity, allowing the poor access to not only household groceries but also a variety of essential and specialty services. A single location that can check off the entire shopping list, commodities include fish, chicken, red meat, vegetables, fruits, dry fruits, herbs, shoes, *peshawari* and other sandals, and clothes, both new and second-hand. For a trade typology matrix of the vendors at the Empress Market, see **Appendix 3.2.6**. In addition to low prices, shopkeepers at the Empress Market are known to sell, otherwise unavailable small and custom-sized quantities of goods, such as Rs. 5 – 10 of *masalas*, for those who can only afford to buy only so much. The second reason is the location. Saddar is the city's transport hub. Commuters from all areas of Karachi, including *Korangi, Orangi, Lyari, Malir, Landhi, Hub, New Karachi, North Karachi and Keamari*, visit the site – turning it into a point where a significant proportion of working-class people pass through while going to and returning from their places of work, study and day-to-day routines. Refer to **Appendix 3.2.2, 3.2.3, 3.2.4, and 3.2.5**, for the previous connections and land usage of Saddar. For a clearer picture of Saddar's present connections to the rest of the city, please refer to **Appendix 3.2.9**. A testimony to the stability and diversity of the Empress Market are the second and third generation Hindu women seated around it selling dry fruits and *masalas* as well as a third generation *parsi* shopkeeper, B. D. Setna, only to name two of the many examples.¹

Importantly, displaced vendors have relocated within the same area following the anti-encroachment drive, mainly in the buildings formerly used as warehouses, around the Empress Market. The following is a non-exhaustive list of the shopkeepers' and hawkers' relocations, as

¹ See **Appendix 1.3**, interviews with Mohammed Aslam, B.D. Setna, Nawab, and Saeed Rehman

discovered during the survey: those operating within the Empress Market courtyard and the Kite Market and Pan Markets at the now demolished Greater Empress Market have moved to Al-Malik Center, *Bohri Bazaar*, Price Road and Rainbow Center; those hawking fruit along the roadsides of Empress Market (opposite the Rainbow Center) and the Umar Farooq Cloth Market have moved to Price Road; other shopkeepers and hawkers from the Umar Farooq Cloth Market have relocated to Rainbow Center and Mir Karam Ali Talpur Road respectively, while those operating along the New Shahabuddin Market on Shahrah-e-Liaquat and from the Empress Market's fruit market, have been informally relocated to an empty plot opposite the Parking Plaza, while those from the Greater Empress Market's birds' market have moved to the Empress Mall and Al-Burhan Centre and their edges along Mansfield Street, the ice depot vendor shifted to another shop he owned across the Depot Lines, shopkeepers of larger tea and dry fruit shops at the Greater Empress Market that could afford the post-demolition increase in rent, at shops in Rainbow Center and Yasir Complex respectively. The map, attached as **Appendix 3.2.8**, illustrates the sites of displaced shopkeepers' and hawkers' relocation with respect to the Empress Market and their original locations around it.

A significant proportion of demolition affectees have still not been able to arrange alternatives to support their livelihoods. Many hawkers, especially the fruit vendors who have relocated onto the empty plot opposite the Parking Plaza responded saying that they were waiting for the street market to return and were unhappy with their new location. The vegetable vendor who relocated from the Umar Farooq Cloth Market to the New Shahabuddin Market first moved to the rear, but then had to move to its front once again as commercial activity at the back was very slow. In addition to slow business at the new location, its rent is Rs. 60,000 compared to Rs. 16,000 that the vegetable vendor previously paid to the KMC at the Greater Empress Market. As a result of the demolitions, certain shopkeepers have started working as hawkers on daily wages. A shopkeeper who owned 3 shops at the Umar Farooq Cloth Market has resorted to selling his merchandise out of the back of a Suzuki pickup. It is interesting to note that shopkeepers who could, preferred to rent shops close to the Empress Market at exorbitant rates (rents as high as Rs. 70,000 a month and a large amount to be paid in advance for possession of the shop) rather than following up on their allotments (which have only been

made to some of them), in faraway areas such as Khadda Market, Baldia Town, and Lyari to name a few.

The aforementioned areas where allotments have been made are also areas which are already occupied by other shopkeepers (who threaten with violence if the affectees attempt to lay claim on their new shops) or have been turned into garbage dumps. The relocations have led to the loss of an old and regular clientele, resulting in significant losses for all affected hawkers and shopkeepers.

Shopkeepers in the environs of the Empress Market have also been very empathetic towards each other by allowing the affectees to put up their merchandise on the front façade of their own shops, such as in front of the Peshawari Ice Cream shop on Preedy Street where Ibrahim Kaka tried to sell his men's hosiery and in front of the blue building at the corner of St. Patrick's and Mansfield Streets. However, among other reasons, this is not a sustainable solution even for the short-term as the weather does not allow it. The displaced shopkeepers perceive themselves as absolutely legal tenants, as their shops were leased to them by the KMC and all of them were in possession of 'computerized bank receipts', which to them, proved their legality. The hawkers although aware of the illegality of their enterprises, forwarded various arguments justifying their presence in the area. It is important to note here that the affected hawkers and shopkeepers (those who could) chose to relocate within the vicinity of the Empress Market of their own accord, since they believe that there is no other market area like it in the rest of the city².

Following the demolitions, hawkers received absolutely no allotments while some of the shopkeepers did. However, respondents stated that they did not desire to move to any other location and wanted to return to their shops at the Empress Market. Some stated that they were only waiting for the *Ramzan* season to end after which they would move back to their

² See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with Ghulam Siddiq (#44), Hameedullah (#74), Akhtar (#45), Muhammad Rabbani (#47), Naseebullah (#49), Rafiullah (#50), Muhammad Iqbal (#51), Talib (#75), Saeed Rehman (#77), Muhammad Saeed (#76), Imran (#79), Faisal Janan (#80), Munir Ahmed (#52), Mohammed Irfan (#1), Mohammed Khalil (#20), Talha (#20), Niaz Mohammed (#22), Sayed Saaduddin (#23), Mohammed Amanullah (#25), Abdul Rauf (#31), Gulzeb Abbasi (#32), Aftab (#35), Fahad (#36), Ramzan (#40), Sayed Saifuddin (#41), Ibrahim Kaka (#94), and Mansur (#95)

respective villages in Balochistan, KPK, and Kashmir like many other affectees who had already done so.

The police have increased their crackdown on hawkers by the roads and in doing so, the latter have been deprived of consistent locations and are forced to stay on the move. Those along Mansfield Street have been asked to replace their pushcarts with tables to avoid removal from the site. In addition to this, they are only allowed to set up their stalls after 2 pm. Respondents also displayed a sense of frustration at the lack of allotments despite the Parking Plaza being empty. There are concerns amongst hawkers regarding access to their customers who were mainly pedestrians and commuters with the additional problem that being located on a plot of land instead of on the roadside has led to severe losses for their businesses. The fruit hawkers opposite the Parking Plaza said that every 10 out of 50 cars passing by would stop to purchase fruit from them. Apart from this, they also face uncertainty regarding their new locations as they have already begun to receive notices from authorities other than the KMC, such as the KDA, that the plots they are on already belong to someone else.

Shops inside the meat market section of the Empress Market have been allotted shops in Ranchore Lines, Soldier Bazaar, and Lines Area – the majority of them have refused to accept these allotments as they wish to continue their operations from inside the Empress Market, where they have spent their entire lives (See **Appendix 4.8** for pictures of the Meat Market before and after the AED). Shopkeepers also display a serious sense of ownership regarding the area as they believe that ‘this is where our shops have always been and this is where they should be’. Many allotments have also been granted for the New Shahabuddin Market, already occupied by shopkeepers who were evicted from the area behind the Empress Market, where the newly constructed Empress Mall now stands. The shopkeepers of New Shahabuddin Market Block A are to move to the new Empress Mall after Eid, whereas shops for the shopkeepers of New Shahabuddin Market Blocks B and C are yet to be constructed.

Vendors at the *Khori Garden* Market were allotted plots in Sultanabad. They claim that narcotics’ dealers currently occupy these spaces. The Mayor of Karachi had agreed to settle the conflict over allotments in many areas but is said to claim that he is helpless in the matter.

Finally, the major concern of all those who received allotments is that only empty plots are being allotted, the KMC has asked the shopkeepers to sign new tenancy agreements and pay an advance (and bribes) for possession. It is only after this that they will be allowed to construct structures on the plots allotted to them, which they must do without any financial support from the government³.

As per the shopkeepers and hawkers in the area, the spatial organization of the hawkers on the streets of Saddar contributed to the prevalence of three important features to the location. The first is less crime, as since the demolitions, there have been reports of an increased crime rate due to the shift in the ambiance from a place full of people to 'dark and silent'. The second feature is that of cleanliness, as in the absence of any cleaning services provided by the KMC, the shopkeepers and hawkers personally contributed towards hiring sweepers who would clean the area they occupied. Similarly, they had also hired security guards together to keep watch over their goods and their customers, which furthered the aforementioned sense of security in the area. The impact the demolitions had on the people working as sweepers and security guards is yet to be studied in detail. The third feature is the relationship that existed, and in some areas still exists to a certain extent, between the shopkeepers and hawkers. Although shopkeepers and pedestrians complain of hawkers taking up too much space or blocking footpaths and roads, shopkeepers and hawkers are both aware of the fact that it is largely because of them that customers are attracted to the site (the reasons for which are yet to be researched in detail), and then the shopkeepers, thus increasing the number of persons visiting any said shop. Assuming that there is very little or no commercial activity in those areas, customers are reluctant to visit areas that do not have an abundance of hawkers. Essentially, it was agreed upon that hawkers contribute to the *raunak* or liveliness of the area and that they

³ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with Ghulam Siddiq (#44), Hameedullah (#74) , Akhtar (#45), Abdul Qayum (27/EMA-27), Naseebullah (#49), Muhammad Iqbal (#51), Rafiullah (#50), Talib (#75), Muhammad Saeed (#76), Bashir Ahmed (#53), Mohammed Israr (#26), Shaukat Khan Kakar (#27), Ali (#29), Gulzeb Abbasi (#32), Mohammed Ali (#33), Fahad (#36), Mohammad Sami (#37), Amanullah and Abdul Zahir (#38), Ibrahim Kaka (#94), Iqbal Kakar (#97), and Liaquat (#98)

just need to be properly situated, so that they do not block access to routes and parking spaces⁴.

There also seems to be a power vacuum and/ or an institutional/ overlapping jurisdictional conflict between the multiple political and bureaucratic authorities operational in the area, which has resulted in confusion and economic anxiety for the shopkeepers and hawkers in the environs of the Empress Market. This is illustrated via the following examples:

1. The MQM has put up banners on the gates of the Empress Market asking the shopkeepers to support them in their rallies so that they can get allotments/their rights. There are also reports of MQM workers asking shopkeepers to join their party so that they can get their shops back⁵.
2. In his meeting with displaced shopkeepers, a KMC official stated that if they were to be removed from the Empress Market they would be allotted shops in the New Shahabuddin Market. This market is however already occupied and administered by the KDA, leaving the KMC no control over such decisions⁶.
3. During the pre-demolition protests, organised by the shopkeepers of the Empress Market, two of them stated that in their communication with senior KMC and Sindh Government officials, they were told that they would immediately be granted shops at the Parking Plaza or at the Saturday *Bazaar* next to it, which led to the fragmentation of the resistance movement. However, the officials were unable to secure permissions for the allotments they mentioned⁷.
4. KMC officials asked the shopkeepers to each pay Rs. 80,000 towards the arrangement for a *kunda*, illicitly-acquired electricity, after which the former would prepare the legal

⁴ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with Naseebullah (#49), Iftikhar (#82), Omar (#55), and Faizan (#56)

⁵ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Rafiullah (#50)

⁶ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Ibrahim Kaka (#94)

⁷ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with Iqbal Kakar (#97) and Liaquat Ali (#98)

documents permitting them to re-inhabit the areas they were evicted from – on the condition that these shopkeepers also share 50% of their profits with said KMC officials⁸.

There exists a lack of hope amongst the hawkers and shopkeepers with regards to compensation from the government, not only because of the time period that has already passed without any compensation but also because of the results of the last major relocation of shopkeepers in the area. This was of the aforementioned Shahabuddin Market, comprising more than 700 vendors that are organised in three blocks: A, B and C. In 2008, the shopkeepers at Shahabuddin Market were promised new shops within 18 months, at the then-proposed Empress Mall, which was to be constructed in the Market's stead. To date however, this commitment has not been met. On Eid-ul-Fitr this year (2019), eleven years since, only the shopkeepers from Block A will be relocated, that too, in an unfinished mall. A building which to onlookers seems abandoned, customers cannot tell that there exists a market inside the Empress Mall. In the case that they do, they still need someone to show them the way to the market⁹. As a result of the Shahabuddin Market relocation, respondents stated that they faced major losses. One *bori* of feed that they would normally sell off in a day, was difficult to sell in a week at their temporary location. It took months to sell all their remaining stock at the new shops, half of which had to be disposed of because it expired¹⁰.

Parameters 2, 3, 5. Issues of Suitability, Employment, and Income

The Empress Market offered a space where all goods were available in a single area, the area being a transport hub for the city, it catered to commuters and residents alike. Its combination of grocery and household retail, as well as specialty retail, meant that it attracted consumer segments from all classes to one area in the megacity that is Karachi. The number of consumers frequenting the market everyday meant that it provided a stable income for vendors (and associated service providers) who had set up carts and shops dealing in the following categories of products: shoes and sandals, fruits, tailor services, *chai* hotels, crockery, collecting/refining

⁸ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Muhammad Iqbal (#51)

⁹ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Mohammed Aslam (#99)

¹⁰ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Mohammed Aslam (#99)

empty pallets, vegetables, flower shops, newspaper stalls, jeans, electronics, porters, dry fruits, wallets, perfumes, *sindh*ihats, men's hosiery, novels and digests, frankincense, snacks and bakery items, weighing machines, plastic ware, rings and precious stones, watch sale and repair, tea, magic paraphernalia, textiles, bed sheets, various drink vendors such as sugar cane juice vendors, restaurants, *shalwar kameez*, meat, oils, dates, birds and animals, kites, *pan*, biscuits, cigarettes, candy, tobacco, fennel seeds, bookbinding services, band-aids, torches, q-tips, *panchsaar*shops, household grocery shops, plastic bags, chewing tobacco, and smoking equipment. Refer to **Appendix 3.2.7** for the sprawling market trades within the Empress Market.

These trades provided employment for several people at a time. A big hotel in the Umar Farooq Cloth Market employed 25 workers¹¹, a crockery shop employed 12 workers¹², a kite shop employed 2 workers¹³, *pan* cabins variably employed up to 3 workers, two large grocery and household goods stores employed 8 workers, one of whom had worked at the store for 40 years¹⁴, a wholesale eggs dealer employed 2 workers¹⁵ and it is generally said that many other shops employed 10 - 12 workers and that many bigger ones employed up to 20 workers¹⁶.

Shopkeepers and hawkers earned stable incomes averaging between Rs. 30,000 and Rs. 200,000 at the Empress Market and in its environs. They have been severely impacted by the anti-encroachment drive. Apart from most incomes having quartered, shopkeepers have lost between 2 months and 6 months of business in the quest for relocation and/or not having been able to relocate. Most business transactions were conducted on credit, where shopkeepers would acquire up to Rs. 4 million worth of stock on credit¹⁷. In one¹⁸, among many other cases, stock worth Rs. 1 million, kept in storage spaces on the Empress Market grounds, was also demolished in the anti-encroachments drive. For another vendor, stock destroyed in this way

¹¹ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Naseebullah (#49)

¹² See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Rafiullah (#50)

¹³ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Hifazat Yar (#34)

¹⁴ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with B.D. Setna (#93) and Liaquat Ali (#98)

¹⁵ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Mansoor (#95)

¹⁶ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Iqbal Kakar (#97)

¹⁷ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Ghulam Siddiq (#44)

¹⁸ *ibid.*

had been worth Rs. 1.5 crores¹⁹. Many shopkeepers have been forced to borrow loans in order to run their households, if not to finance their relocation. Many others have turned from established shopkeepers to daily wage laborers²⁰, some have run away because they were already under debt, while others currently face expenses greater than their incomes²¹. On average, hawkers have faced loss of stock between Rs. 30,000 to Rs. 40,000. An extremely vulnerable segment of hawkers are the porters, who are trusted enough to deliver to customers' homes while they were not home, and who have been in the profession for generations. These porters would easily earn up to Rs. 500 everyday, this has dwindled to hardly Rs. 200 or nothing post-anti-encroachment drive. The number of porters at the Empress Market today is less than half of what it used to be prior to the demolitions.

Parameter 6. Supply Chain

The repercussion of the anti-encroachment drive on the markets that supplied the Empress Market is another topic for further research. This section elaborates upon where the vendors sourced their materials. Jeans, shoes, and sandals were bought from Lea Market and Lighthouse, fruits were bought from the *Sohrab Goth Sabzi Mandi*, crockery was ordered from *Gujranwala*, men's hosiery was bought from Bolton Market, dry fruits, teas, oils, tonics, herbs, elixirs, and grocery items were bought from *Jodia Bazaar*, Balochistan, and Afghanistan, ice for the ice depot was bought from *Korangi*, kites were bought from *Landhi, Korangi, and Lalu Khet*, these are made in *katchi abadis* by lower grade employees (peons, clerks) as a supplementary means of income, and *pan* and tobacco products were bought from *Joona Market*. Evidence suggests that distributors trusted the vendors they supplied to, in one case, when a certain shop burned down²² the distributors re-stocked the shop without asking for an immediate payment. Customers also trusted porters to make deliveries at home even when there were

¹⁹ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with B.D. Setna (#93)

²⁰ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Yahya (#24)

²¹ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with Ibrahim Kaka (#94)

²² See **Appendix 1.3.**, interview with B.D. Setna (#93)

unaccompanied minors/girls alone at home²³. Eggs were bought and sold from and to all over Pakistan.

Parameter 7. Issues of Invisible Costs

Hawkers and some shopkeepers were regularly harassed by the police, the KMC, and the traffic police, who extorted them at varying rates ranging between Rs. 50 to Rs. 300 per day. In many cases, this money is also paid so that hawkers can continuously avail electricity on *kunda*. Besides money, police and traffic police also eat from food vendors for free, and ‘confiscate’ goods at their whim. Details of the extortion can be seen in the interviews attached in the **Appendix 1.3.**

Parameters 9, 10. Characteristics of the Public Space, Amenities, and the Existence of Traders Associations

A number of associations were identified, however detailed study on them is still beyond the scope of the current paper and yet needs to be researched, in order to further understand the sociology of the Empress Market, and recommend participatory measures for its upkeep. Iqbal Kakar is the president of the Umar Farooq Cloth Market Association, Hifazat Yar was the head of the Karachi chapter of the Sindh *Anjuman-e-Patangsaaz* since 2005, however, this union has ceased to exist as all its members have scattered following the anti-encroachment drive. This union consists of 10,000 smaller unions and their head office is in Hyderabad²⁴. There was a newspaper union which fell apart following the demise of their last leader²⁵. Mohammed Aslam is the president of the Grand Alliance of the Shopkeepers of Shahabuddin Market²⁶. There also exists an All-Karachi Tajir Ittehad, the details of which are currently unknown to the

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ See **Appendix 1.3**, interview with Sayed Saaduddin (#23)

²⁵ See **Appendix 1.3**, interview with Syed Arif Hussain (#65)

²⁶ See **Appendix 1.3**, interview with Mohammed Aslam (#99)

researchers. Liaquat Ali is the president of the Empress Market Grocery, Vegetable, and Fruit Merchants Cooperative Society.

The activities of these associations are of many kinds. They are involved in bringing together shopkeepers to hire sweepers and security guards. They also organize to hold press conferences to address their concerns. Where no formal associations/unions existed, hawkers and shopkeepers still came together to hire sweepers and security guards as can be learned from the interviews attached as **Appendix 1.3**.

It is important to note that where the KMC has failed to provide public services, the shopkeepers and hawkers arranged for them on their own.

Parameter 12. Perception of Entrepreneurs towards the Anti-encroachment Drive

Respondents in Saddar reported that there is a 50% decrease in the number of visitors frequenting the site, while rents of shops and residences have increased between four and tenfold. Respondents said that they knew well-to-do people who have been reduced to begging on the streets. We were also told that 4 shopkeepers lost their lives due to heart attacks that resulted from states of shock²⁷, while issues of anxiety and depression abound amongst the demolition affectees.

Respondents also mentioned that the loss of the Empress Market is also a major loss to KMC revenues. In speaking to the Express Tribune, KMS's incumbent estate director, Tasneem Ahmed Khan, quoted the figure his department earned from these markets to be Rs. 15 million²⁸. Further, a lot of ethnic tensions have developed as some shopkeepers believe that the anti-encroachment drive was carried out against *pathans*. In one case, a shopkeeper who moved to the basement of the Rainbow Center stated that women, his main clientele, are too afraid to come to his new shop because of the *badmaash pathans* on the ground floor. A serious perception of ethnic conflict is the result of claims that the Empress Market was the

²⁷ See **Appendix 1.3**, interviews with Iqbal Kakar (#97), Amanullah and Abdul Zahir (#38), and Rafiullah (#50)

²⁸ <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1842344/1-operation-clean-clear-saddar-kmc-will-demolish-markets/>

cause of the downfall of the MQM, as it was the only place where all the shopkeepers together resisted its attempts to extort them. It is perceived that the *pathans* were the ones because of whom the MQM was unable to extort the Empress Market and that the anti-encroachment drive was used as an opportunity by the MQM to get back at the *pathans*²⁹.

Concerns of revolution and bloodshed were also shared as the anti-encroachment drive was seen as a direct attack on the resilience of the working class with regards to their livelihoods. Many shopkeepers do not appreciate the idea of turning the Empress Market grounds into gardens, as employment remains an obvious priority for themselves and their children. It is important to note the concerns regarding resistance and political action in order to regain lost shops. It has been stated that ‘those who owned 25 - 30 shops are not taking an interest in relocation, despite not having threats from anyone.’ The drive has been seen as an attack on the poor as respondents stated that only enterprises belonging to the poor were demolished and structures owned by government institutions and big businesses that are also technically ‘encroachments’ have been left alone. Only one respondent stated that the anti-encroachment drive was good because the *pathans* would not allow people to park their cars, however, this respondent also disagreed with the methodology employed to clean up the area³⁰.

There is an overall perception that the Government of Pakistan received money from foreign countries to carry out the anti-encroachment drive. There is also a perception that the contract for the gardens around the Empress Market has been awarded to the Mayor’s who frequently sends the police here to rid the site of hawkers.

The hawkers and shopkeepers protested from the 7th to the 10th of November, demolitions began in the early hours of the 11th. Respondents state that the protests were unsuccessful because the shopkeepers had been divided into groups prior to the encroachment drive by the KMC, via misleading information concerning which shops would be demolished and which shops would remain. They were finally surprised by the mayor on the 9th who informed

²⁹ See **Appendix 1.3**, interviews with Iqbal Kakar (#97), Mohammed Aslam (99), Ghulam Siddiq (#44), and Muhammad Iqbal (#51)

³⁰ See **Appendix 1.3**, interviews with Liaquat (98), Mansur (#95), B.D. Setna (#93), Mohammed Aslam (#99), Shakeel Ahmed (#39), and Aftab (#35)

everyone that all licenses and leases had been revoked, and that all shops would be demolished. Respondents stated that senior members of the government and the KMC used racist and derogatory language towards the hawkers and shopkeepers, criminalizing them³¹.

Parameter 14. Relations/Support from Municipal Councillors/Members of Provincial Assembly

There was a negative response as to whether interviewees received any kind of support from political parties, MNAs or MPAs. However, there was mention of the Jamat-e-Islami party workers participating in the protests held by the hawkers and shopkeepers prior to the demolitions. They were, however, stopped from participating once the LEAs arrived on site and ‘made phone calls’. This was reported by respondents who wish to remain anonymous.

An in-depth case study of the Empress Market tracing its history, evolution, and demolition is attached as **Appendix 4.4**. An outline of the case study is given below.

Section 1 of the case study looks at the market’s inception in 1889 with its range of consumer and specialty products and services that it has continued to provide, along with describing various hawker typologies. It elaborates upon the significance of Saddar not only as the transport hub of the city, but also as a hub for the city’s intellectual life and its entertainment. It further outlines the impact of policies on the area that were undertaken from the 1950s through the 1970s. The section also includes information on the micro-communities that have been functioning in the Empress Market for decades. The historical importance of the site and its role in identity construction within the popular, public imagination is explored in the context of the mutiny of 1857.

Section 2 of the case study covers the socio-political conditions under which the anti-encroachment drive was conducted and those which it resulted in. A summary of the Court judgements that aimed to ‘make a model’ out of the Empress Market for the rest of Karachi and its encroachments is also provided. The section is also a preliminary estimation of the scale of

³¹ See **Appendix 1.3.**, interviews with Iqbal Kakar (#97), Ibrahim Kaka (#94), and Mohammed Amanullah (#25)

the economy in terms of employment, modes of transaction, profitability, and visible and invisible costs paid to authorities. Section 3 looks at the nature of the anti-encroachment drive - this is in terms of the complications resulting from the lack of transparency during the drive and the physical impact on the Empress Market structure and the *kabaaris*. It also includes a timeline of the Market from its inception to the recent demolitions.

Section 4 examines the socio-political situation before the anti-encroachment drive by outlining six key aspects that contributed to the uniqueness and significance of the site. Section 5 analyzes the socio-political situation after the demolitions in terms of the scale of livelihood that has been affected, its impact on the credit system in place, and the supply chain of the street economy. It also looks at the effect of pedestrianization and the now halted construction of the food street on Mir Karamali Talpur Road. It delineates the current process of relocation along with a case study examining the last major relocation in the area - that of the Shahabuddin Market. This section also examines the responses of the state by presenting its narrative and the actions it undertook. Response of the market covers the views of the entrepreneurs regarding the nature of the current commercial activity, its future, the perception of street vendors and their relationships with formal vendors, the ethnic dissonance in the area, and the impact of the demolitions on the clientele that used to and currently frequents the area.

Section 6 looks at the debate on the right to public space in print and online media. Finally, section 7 examines the response of analysts and activists on the anti-encroachment drive around the Empress Market expressed during public forums by important activists and organizations such as the Urban Resource Center, the Pakistan Institute of Labor Education and Research, lawyer and activist Abira Ashfaq, the Karachi Urban Lab, and The Second Floor.

*The transcripts of the interviews conducted by Group 2 are attached as **Appendix 1.3**.*

*The locations of where the interviews were conducted are provided as **Appendix 3.2.10**.*

*A photographic survey of Empress Market and its surroundings is attached as **Appendix 2.3.***

*A series of maps to illustrate land use, transport connections, the presence of markets and hawkers, their trade typology and the market situation before and after the anti-encroachment drive at the Empress Market, are attached under **Appendix 3.2.***

3.3. Findings and Analyses of Group 3: Burns' Road, Sections of M. A. Jinnah Road (Lighthouse & Pakistan Chowk), Clifton and DHA

Group 3 began its survey with walking tours of the selected areas of District South along Burns Road, adjourning and connecting streets and all along MA Jinnah Road to little short of Merewether Clock Tower. Similar method was replicated all along the commercial markets of Clifton and DHA including the seaside of the District South. The observations were documented for further discussions amongst the research team. The team also mapped street vendors present at the sites being studied. For maps of the M. A. Jinnah Road, refer to **Appendices 3.3.1 to 3.3.4**. A map of Mohammad Bin Qasim Road is attached as **Appendix 3.3.5**. A map of Pakistan Chowk currently in process is attached as **Appendix 3.3.6**. Maps of Clifton are attached as **Appendices 3.3.7 to 3.3.9**. Maps of DHA are attached as **Appendices 3.3.10 to 3.3.15**. Finally, selected typologies of street vendors and their total daily sales is also attached as **Appendix 4.5**.

Intertwined with the formal sector, the scale, breadth and penetration of the informal economy is difficult to estimate. The informal sector sources its products from the formal sector and contributes overwhelmingly to the cash flow of the formal sector. Only educated estimates can be made about the typology and the contribution of the informal sector to the city's economy. It seems that instead of a job crisis (which can be attributed to the development plans and economic policies of the country), there is a job-data crisis for Karachi's ever-increasing informal sector. However, it can be safely concluded from the interviews and observations on-site, that despite all odds and uncertainties, the informal sector plays an important role in economic sustenance during normal periods and economic resilience in the days of increasing inflation for the populous low-income groups in the city: compromises by the end user not discounted.

The DNA of the informal sector in the surveyed areas is mostly made up of migrants from various areas of Pakistan, often with low skill sets to earn livelihoods. Hence this perennially-increasing sector helps these vendors to sustain their respective lives. Against the popular perception of the informal sector being marginal to the Karachi's economy, it contributes

substantially to family economy and is proved to be a substantial source of products and services for the low-income groups of the city. The low-income groups, hence, are supported by the birds of the same flock, but in different roles and capacities.

From the interviews conducted, it also came to the fore that clan-based and same-language groups form informal networks for each others' support. The nature of this support varies from sharing accommodation to pooling resources for food, providing labour replacements for one another on off days or vacations and in the mediation of negotiations and conflicts. In this way, the informal economy inadvertently consolidates the ethnic fabric of Karachi.

It was also observed that with the liberalization of global economy and with relative ease of cross border movement of finished goods, the typology of products of street vending has also changed over the years. Fancy toys, refurbished shoes and cheap sunglasses (copied and false versions of famous brands) of Chinese origin are a few cases to mention. The shoes, for instance, are brought to Karachi Port in "containers", taken to "factories" in Shershah for repair and/or to make pairs and if required, to further 'workshops' in Orangi for value addition. At the end of this trip, the shoes come to road side vendors at MA Jinnah Road for immediate sale. The question concerning whether the formal or the informal sector is more active in the sale of counterfeit items, needs to be looked into by academia and policy makers as it is a grossly under-researched area. We only know of the existence of an organized chain that makes space for counterfeit items and the street vendor is the weakest link of that chain, making it an easy target for law-enforcers and media hawks.

The neo-liberal paradigm seen on the streets of District South, cannot work without its complementary Siamese twin of induced demand. The cheap but fancy electronic gadgets as juicers, watches, perfumes and other similar products, are displayed by roaming vendors of Pashtun ethnicity, simultaneously attracting and threatening potential low income customers of a lost opportunity. Similarly, innovations associated with advancing capitalism, have also transformed the required skill set for vending on the streets. For instance, earlier it used to be a wrist watch repair shop run by a *shalwar kameez* clad vendor with a magnifying glass, in possession of a couple of different sized screwdrivers and long nose pliers operating from a shop space of a 2' x 3', often a cabin cum desk, with a derelict table lamp on it. Now, its a mobile phone repair shop serviced by a young boy clad in a shirt/ t-shirt and jeans, bilingual

(mostly Urdu and English), wired to a mobile phone, with digital ampere and voltmeters on the desk, gesturing with a pompous and feigned busyness.

Before the evictions, there used to be a substantial number of pencil-sketchers and paint brush artists near Fresco Chowk, who used to draw sketches and paint pictures, and later, if required by the client, set them in a wooden frame by another artisan employed there. Over the years the painters' work has been replaced by 'imported' Chinese readymade paintings and frames. Economical as they are, they have diminished indigenous art and associated businesses. The recent evictions proved to be the last straw on the camel's back, broken by the administrative apparatus of the city.

And then there is an undocumented economy associated with the sacred dead. One of the shrines at main MA Jinnah road has stretched out vending on wooden tables of incense, flowers, coloured sheets and other items. Generated by those revered dead, the emotional benefits of consolation, gratitude, joy, fidelity, self-abasement or resilience, translates itself into commercial activities at the streets of District South through the vendors. It probably would have been the same throughout the City. Needless to mention, that a shrine is not the only place for faith-based economic transactions. Punjabi and Seraiki males, with a glass top rectangular wooden box hanging from their neck through a usual wide black strip (sometimes adorned with culturally coloured pieces of cloths and mirrors), selling rings and stones is often a spectacular site on the streets of District South. The articulation of those street vendors is around health bonuses from certain gemstones, spiritual practices to restore energy fields, gain peace, and promote love and safety from eternally scavenging evil spirits. .

The street vending is not insulated with effects of advancing technology in day to day business and daily routines. The hawkers received phone calls from house wives making advance bookings of the required items, while pan shop knows through phone that how many cigarette packs are to be put aside and number of pans for a particular customer. The communication of migrant hawkers with family at native place is a call away as every hawker has one or other type of mobile phone. Money is transferred to native place through 'easy-paisa' service and the

day of 'money-order' though national postal service has gone: inefficiency of the staff and time delays are the two prime reasons cited by the vendors.

In normal circumstances the law enforcement on the street vending ranges from tolerance to ruthless drives to share-in-pie efforts and ventures. However, the deteriorating law and order situation and the resulting security measures by the relevant agencies took a toll on the income of some of the types of informal vending. Certain seasonal but regularly occurring stringent measure has reduced the outreach and hence the income of vendors. For instance, water provision to the mourners at the particular day of *Ashura* by *maashki* was a regular feature and was allowed by the city administration. Due to increasing threats and particularly after the bomb last of the year 2009 that was prohibited resulting in the reduced income of the *mashkis* of Burns Road.

It was also noted that street vending is possible only after addressing plethora of issues by the vendors. Issues such as place to vend, continuity to vend, access to infrastructure – both basic (toilets and water) and work-related (shelter and storage) – are among the issues that need to be negotiated. However there are no formal associations and unions of street vendors that can safeguard their interests. The unprotected business of street vending has yet to get official recognition for claims and negotiations³².

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Usman (#100)

Though most of the interviewed vendors were either illiterate or less educated by conventional standards they were found to be in possession of sharp business acumen. And one wonders that had they been a little bit trained, their street smartness would have taken them much further than what they are at the moment. Moreover the lingua franca is street-oriented but the demeanour of politeness and customer attention, it appears, is rooted in mature sales pitch.

³² See **Appendix 1.4.**, interview with Usman (#100)

The above-mentioned were the general deductions from the conducted interviews. The more specifics and pointed outcomes are described in the following sub-sections.

Net working

The results of the analysis show that the street vendors operate with effective networking for collaboration with other groups. The drive to network is dictated by the primary, secondary and tertiary requirements of their respective business. The reasons for networking could be as diverse as from acquiring certain services (water, electricity, toilet facility) to securing their saleable in the night. More effective their networking is more reliable they are granted for any business dealings by complementary businesses as well as by customers. The trust factor is one of the outcomes of the tenure of their business activity in a particular area: longer the tenure more trustworthy they are for others.

Convenient Products

Street vendors prefer to sell less expensive and conveniently purchasable goods for a couple of reasons. It is convenient for the clients as they need to spend less time and don't need to make any search. For vendors the high daily turnover means more profit and secondly the convenient products involve less capital or less credit burden. The sales of specific items also means loyal clientele, hence definite certain sales.

Trade Credit

Interviews with the vendors (both roaming and static) indicated that majority of the vendors obtain goods on credit either from retailers or wholesalers. As mentioned in the previous section that the mechanism of credit works on trust factor and works on verbal commitments between the retailer/wholesaler and vendor. The trade credit also depends on the proximity between the vendor and the retailer/wholesaler. To save transport cost and labour most of the vendors prefer to obtain from the nearby retail markets.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Pattho (#101)

However, the case of daily wage labourer is an exception to the phenomenon. He needs the payment of its services on a daily basis, though the verbal agreement is on turn-key jobs and payments are decided on lump-sum. Similarly the typists alongside the City Court also operate on cash payments.

Parameter 1. Locational Preference/Advantage

It emerged from the interviews and on-site observations that the vendors situate themselves in strategic locations to maximize their sales. Other factors instrumental in deciding about the location includes proximity to residence to save on commute cost, external economies of scale, shelter from vagaries of weather and to mitigate the probability of being in the spotlight of any onslaught by administration.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Mohd. Saeed (#102)

The tenure of informal activity generates a sense of security, comfort of familiarity, social capital and a pool of trust-worthy clients or 'party': A 'party' is a relatively well off customer who pays well and is less demanding. All those factors are pivotal in defining the roaming route for mobile vendors and for fixed it create psychological barriers to move to any other place. For any extension plans, however, this static vending point serves as an epicentre for radiating-out business expansion activities. The vertical and horizontal credit linkages are also supported by the certainty of physical presence of both forms.

It can be safely concluded that like in-formal sector, length of tenure of informal vending at a particular location generates economic and social security(s). Those over-the-years accumulations are vaporized in ill-planned evictions.

Parameter 3. Enterprise employing workers/ more working hands

Single ownership is observed throughout the surveyed area with a couple of exceptions. Low profitability, insecurity of the enterprise and the low-status perception are three main reasons for informal enterprises not employing more working hands.

However, in some of the cases it was observed that an informal enterprise became a family venture either because of the scale of the business or because of the long working hours to make the enterprise profitable and competitive.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Iqbal (#104)

Parameter 4. Timings and Working Hours

It becomes evident from the conducted interviews that working hours of informal sector are prolonged, more than formal sector working, flexible and stretched beyond what is considered as a 'normal working time'. Twelve hours comes out as an average working time for vendors and the timings vary from early morning to late start in the day.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Shahbaz Khan (#103)

The end time also varies from dusk to late in the night. The variation depends on a number of factors which include the typichology of the end user (student, office goers, house wives, maids and others), the kind of the products/services (juice, *paan*, fruits, plants, cobbler and others), the variance of the timings in summers and winters, the religious rituals and the personal commitments and engagements of the vendor.

Parameter 5. Turnover, income, saving, benefit to the vendor

There was a definite reluctance to reveal the amount of daily sales, turn-over of the products and profit margins.

The bandwidth of earning of those interviewed ranges from Rs. 300/day to a maximum of Rs. 2000/day. The defining variables for variance in income are types of products, seasons and the number of working hours on the pavement or road.

It was analyzed that profit margins at up-end markets are more and not very high in the vicinity of old City hence making location a pivot of analysis. Yet at the same time the charges of space for static vendors at the upend market is high with the accompanying sense of security of tenure. As one of the respondents opined,

“Mall k samne jitney bhi fancy cabins hain wo mall ki union k pass register hain and annually 250 sq feets k hisab se tax dete hain, jab ke footpaths or service road wale vendors pe koi charges nahi islye bhi inko hata dia jata hai or hum safe hain”.

Mr. Ali sells a small packet of sweet corn at Rs. 100 and jokingly mentioned that

“ye sweet corns 100 rupay ki Malir me kon lega...???”.

It has also been observed that roaming vendors are of the view that they are able to sell their products competitively because they have overhead charges to bear.

Parameter 7. Issues in invisible cost

Various institutions are involved in collecting money from street vendors, ranging from Karachi Municipal Corporation to police officials. “Bhatta”, “Chai-pani”, “tax”, “...charges”, “license”.

The extortion by police has different forms. Sometimes it is cash and it could range any amount from Rs. 50 to Rs. 2,000 (one-time) as it depends on the type of product a vendor is selling. The extortion is also in-kind and it is mostly instantly consumable perishable items. It was reported that the police patrolling vans usually pick up a pack of cigarettes from pan shop, sun glasses from roaming vendors and in one case flower pot from a mobile vendor.

One of the vendors mentioned that he had to pay both to police and KMC officials. He mentioned that,

“...Rs. 2,000 is collected by KMC from each vendor where police often take Rs. 50 or Rs. 100 or goods from the vendor...KMC collects more than police”.³³

Riding on the saddle of morality, a couple of vendors, however, bluntly denied any amount of money (*rishwat*) giving to any police official.

Parameter 8. Stability of enterprise/ possibility of expansion

The tenure of the stay is one of the parameters to evaluate the security of the enterprise. As evident from the Table in Section One that majority of those have a substantially long tenure of the business in that particular area.

The conducted interviews shows that for any extension plans, static vending point serves as an epicentre for radiating-out business expansion activities. However the capacity to manage and to arrange extra capital for the expansion is not possible majority of those interviewed. Seasonal enterprises, by virtue of the nature of their business activity, did not express any desire to expand.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Zulfiqar (#105)

But the sense of insecurity cannot be discounted on two accounts. One arises from the recent evictions drive and secondly due to the increased inflation. This holds more true for the areas of low-income neighbourhoods. The vendors or the extension show case foot path setups at the up-end neighbourhood of Clifton are exceptions to the phenomenon.

Parameter 9. Characteristics of public space where the enterprise is located + services/ amenities/support

On-site observations and the interviews conducted reveal that the public space is often self-managed by the vendors themselves. It was expected that in absence of any support by local

³³ See **Appendix 1.4.**, interview with Zulfiqar (#105)

government and administration the place should be cluttered and untidy. However, it was observed that the static vendors' first task at start of the day is to clean the environs (foot path/pavement and parts of the street) by sweeping and in some cases sprinkling water to settle the earth dirt. However, any space evaluation cannot be performed objectively by divorcing it from the status of overall cleanliness status of the area.

In most of the cases, the static street vending is on the front front paths of permanent shops. Functionally they may serve as extended showrooms of the permanent shops, manufacturing facility (as in the case of the confectionaries) the outreach outlets for 'fair prices' of the permanent shops for low-paying clients.

The foot-paths vending may take various forms of stalls. It ranges from fixed cabins to wheel fixed cabins from a make-shift arrangement of elongated wooden rectangular tables. The roaming vendors

Parameter 10. No evidence was found to contribute to the possibility of the existence of mutual associations of similar entrepreneurs.

Parameters 11 - 13. Views about recent evictions and Idea about relocating.

Majority of the respondents of the surveyed area considered the evictions' drive "wrong". However, there are some deviations to this response as well and whatever the shades of the responses, most of the respondents articulated that the evictions' drive will contribute to existing unemployment.

Though they do not favour it, the roaming vendors are not fearful about any evictions' drive as they are constantly on the move and haven't occupied any public space per say.

"We regularly move from one place to another. Even if any police mobile ask for favours, we change our place. Every street vendor should have wheels and he should not be

permanent at one place...it reduces cost and a safeguard from evictions...whatever happened at Empress Market was wrong.”

Similarly the daily wage respondent was also not worried as he has a small tool box as his possession. He clearly mentioned that he will move the tools in no time. Other respondents were of the view that the vendors at Empress Market should not have been removed as those used to pay money either to KMC or police or both for tenure security and hence they had the right to do business. Other respondents were of the opinion that the length of doing at a place should be respected by the authorities before taking any such decisions.

See Appendix 1.4. Interview with Jalaluddin Ayub (#106)

A respondent opined about the method of the evictions and was of the opinion that proper notice should have been served with substantial time to the vendors and moreover alternative should have been provided to the displaced. Another respondent was more philosophical in his utterance as he related the lack of employment opportunities to the informality and said,

“[translated by researcher]...Either government should fulfil the basic needs of its citizen, or be strict from the start, otherwise they will start there informal enterprise as only option for living.”

It was also opined by one of the respondents that if locals and permanent shopkeepers support the street vendors then, for officials, to remove the later will be a hard nut to crack.³⁴

Parameter 12. Understanding and possible response of entrepreneurs towards anti-encroachment drive

The probable response of any possible eviction varies from an articulation of helpless to supra confidence of “nothing will happen” and to some mitigation measures.

³⁴ See **Appendix 1.4**, Interview with Zulfiqar (#105)

One of the static street vendors was confident because of his connection with: "high-ups" and as per him he got the permission from the land owning agency: in his case Pakistan Navy. Another respondent opined that he will shift his cabin to some other place where he can avoid the officials and attract the customers

Couple of respondents mentioned that, in such case they will look for job as family is dependent on them. The same respondent has fitted wheels in his cabin and reduces the goods in the cabin. To avoid losses he stores his rest of the stock in a nearby shop in plastic shoppers. As he was an old hand in the area he has the luxury of knowing people and making it to his advantage.

Another respondent at MA Jinnah Road mentioned that the displaced shopkeepers were offered a place at Soldiers' Bazar but,

*"It is not enough "woh lollipop hae ...wahan bijli he naheen hae"*³⁵

One the other hand the same respondent appeared to be inclined to move out for business as once he mentioned

*"kabootar jaal se nikley ga...kaheen na kaheen to basera karey ga".*³⁶

*The transcripts for the interviews conducted by Group 3 are attached as **Appendix 1.4.***

*The photographic survey of Clifton, DHA, Pakistan Chowk and Lighthouse is attached as **Appendix 2.4.***

³⁵ See **Appendix 1.4**, interview with Jalal uddin (#106)

³⁶ See **Appendix 1.4**, interview with Jalal uddin (#106)

*Maps covering hawker locations, typologies and density in the respective areas are attached under **Appendix 3**.*

4. CONCLUSIONS

Given the scale and nature of the Karachi Street Economy, recommendations are not a possibility until a greater understanding of what exists today or what has been established by the study is developed. Formalization has its own problems of definitions, institutions, laws, and procedures. Letting it continue as it is and expanding has problems of congestion, conflict of space, conflict with existing laws, and strong market pressures. In addition to the above factors, there are also close links between social behavior, culture, and norms of Karachi's citizens and the street economy. With the newfound interest of the city government, academia, and the architectural profession with the heritage of the city, there is also a need to see how heritage and the street economy impact each other. Here, a vision of the city and conservation policies and/or understanding have to be developed if any recommendations are to be proposed.

However, the researchers have made a number of tentative proposals that need to be looked at in the context of what has been said above. These proposals are given below.

GROUP 1

1. It will be appropriate if a principled decision is taken to retain the hawkers and vendors within the existing locations. The historical interconnection between hawkers, their clientele, surrounding shop keepers and public space extends the justification for this proposal. In order to make it rational and workable, a location-specific urban design exercises may be done to plot the existing hawkers, legal and administrative limitations wherein vending activity can be accommodated, interface with the mobility characteristics of the area, concurrence with the future transport projects, examining the rights and interests of the stakeholders and future uses of the location. It may be noted that these solutions shall be location specific where no two locations may have the same option applicable. The outputs of such proposals must also be interpreted in maps, plans and visual details to make it communicable for all.

2. These areas do require interventions albeit in a stakeholder friendly manner and with an objective to optimize the commercial potential for an extended clientele. In the initial stage, a soft categorization of the hawkers and vendors may be done. Moving hawkers without a cart, moving hawkers with a cart, static hawkers without storage space needs, static hawkers with storage space needs, hawkers with self-contained services, hawkers dependent upon area based services, hawkers with the additional need of public space usage and the like are some possible categories. Attempts should be made to enable the articulation of public space for maximizing the functional and aesthetic potential without dislocating the existing hawkers/vendors business. By creating a few pilot initiatives and learning from their outcomes, further improvements can be done to these ongoing projects.
3. The vendors and hawkers form a ready livelihood option for the incoming migrants or resident idle labor of various categories. Given the fact that formal jobs and employment options are next to impossible to access for unskilled and semi-skilled laborers, the vendors may be made to link with the existing unskilled laborers more effectively. There are scores of laborers sitting idle on chowks and thoroughfares in search of jobs in construction and repair/maintenance sectors. Many of them are willing to switch the vocation and get employed in any odd occupation. Since the connectivity between the existing vendors and such labor reservoirs is weak and non-existing, a labor resource spot can be created in every market to enable those seeking more helping hands at affordable wages connect with them. This task can be done by any local area vendor if some assistance is extended to him. The local *niswarseller* in Lea Market was found doing this work at a very basic level.
4. Whereas the vendors expressed their satisfaction, the review and analysis of the situation revealed that they operated in an extremely hostile and unfriendly environment with negligible basic services and amenities at their disposal. There was no toilet, washing facility, shaded space for taking a partial rest, or simply a bench to sit. Many of them kept standing for hours without a break. The local mosques provided

them the only option for attending to the calls of nature or taking rest. It may be appropriate the same interdependence between hawkers and the mosque be retained and consolidated. However, through a consultative process, essential street furniture may be designed and added to extend relief to vendors and other users of the public space.

5. The vendors and hawkers can improve their performance and output if linked up with various available financial and support options. Microfinance banks or non-banking microfinance organizations are cases in point. There are many organizations offering technical assistance, savings and credit support and even business guidance to vendors. In order to enable the vendors to improve, secure and expand their work, many of these networks could be useful. Efforts in mobilizing, communications about such options and exposure to entrepreneurs who benefitted from such organizations could be beneficial.
6. The vendors and hawkers may be sensitized to the fact that by negotiating a better deal and relief from the KMC and police officials, they can win over improved working conditions for themselves. For example, by liaising with the shopkeepers and their associations, the general cleanliness, regular lifting of garbage and basic repair of public spaces can be done. Certain vendors such as tea stall holder, *chaatseller*, and other articles are adversely affected due to the poor cleanliness and run down status of public spaces in Jodia Bazaar, Kharadar and Lea Market precincts.
7. There are many opportunities to better organize and optimize the public open spaces along with these three locations. An urban renewal plan can be prepared for these and more locations with an objective to secure public spaces, integrate and expand their linkage with the existing enterprises and users, identify idle spaces for better usage, transform negative and dark spaces for public functions, promote and facilitate pedestrian spaces and movement, provide parking options for different vehicles operating in the area, redeem buried infrastructure and refurbish existing parks and

open spaces. A priority list can be drawn through consultation about the implementation of various components of the plan.

8. The vendors operate in an institutional vacuum. The existing associations of shopkeepers and others are not interested to defend or manage the issues faced by them as vendors are often considered competitors, nor collaborators. This needs to be addressed by mobilizing the vendors in a step by step manner. Initially, a *beesee*-committee or a savings group can be launched with total ownership and management of the vendors. Such groups already exist in many locations but can be expanded to more vendors. The vendors may be motivated to set up a platform for coming together in a meeting space and also digitally. At the initial stage, this group can share important news and developments related to the area and city with a concern to vendors and hawkers. In case of any demolition threat or a similar challenge, this platform can also acquire the form and function of a vendors action committee.

GROUP 2

In conclusion, the shopkeepers of the Empress Market display an awareness of street markets all over the world, how they are well preserved, and how it is possible to do the same for the Empress Market. One respondent, a third-generation Parsi shopkeeper mentioned heritage markets in Turkey, Iran, and Canada. They also mentioned the existence of an Indo-Pak general store for the *desi* diaspora in Houston, Texas by the name of the Empress Market. The shopkeepers of the Empress Market are well aware of what heritage means and how it can be preserved, they are also willing to make personal investments in the structures of their shops to make them more attractive. However, for any of this to occur, it is necessary that there be certainty about their place at the market.

GROUP 3

1. The absence of data about informal workers ranges from typology, scale, locations, and socio-demographic profile. Their contribution to the City's economy and their horizontal and vertical business linkages, hence, cannot be established with certainty. This

uncertainty can interfere negatively with any meaningful urban planning exercise for the city.

2. The entrants to the informal economy, mostly, are low skilled migrants who are devoid of choices and are not accommodated in the formal economy circuit. The low levels of education and low skill set are the biggest impediments of upward social mobility for an otherwise street smart segment of the productive population.
3. The working of the informal sector is marked with flexibility, adaptability, resilience and organic response to a changing market situation as well as to the administrative decisions. However, with all those valuable skills they remain perennially vulnerable as the administrative narrative of informal vending as an eye sore and a nuisance works against them.
4. The recent ambiguous eviction has drawn a mix response, some have acquired mitigation strategy and others have thought of alternatives. However, there is no evidence gathered in the conducted survey that the informal sector is organized enough to resist any such move by the administration.
5. Though the study has seen the informal vending from the lens of vendors, nevertheless, it was evident that the informal vending ventures exist in a symbiotic relationship with low-income groups (clients): mutual survival.

Appendices

INTERVIEW NO.1

A. BASIC INFORMATION

1. Mohammad Irfan
2. Dry Fruit Vendor on Pushcart
3. Murad Khan Road
4. 0343-2280051

B. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

5. There is intense retail and wholesale activity in the bazaar from 10:00 am to 08:00 pm. Sales of dry fruits is at its peak during winters. In other seasons, the dry fruits are used as medicine and in cooking different exotic cuisine.
6. I began this work with my two other brothers. Previously I used to work as an employee in an enterprise.
7. As mentioned earlier, we are three brothers. Such type of work requires more hands.
8. The income is satisfactory.
9. All the merchandise on our pushcart is acquired on credit from various shops. Every week, we weigh the merchandise and pay back to the shop owners. We keep the profit.
10. We have to make regular payments to police personnel and KMC staff. We cannot operate in this area otherwise.
11. No one will give you a correct answer. But we adjust and manage.
12. It is fine. Winters are a better season for our work.
13. Yes sure, everybody does.
14. I have got a lot, goods have been given on credit, what other favour a person can expect.

C. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

15. During my father's life I started working in my childhood at the same place.
16. My father started working hard here, we four brothers used to work in different shops. It was difficult to live and meet both ends. In first place, I bought a cart and then purchased goods on credit from shopkeepers. When shopkeepers believed that we are honest people, then by keeping good margin they gave us goods and we earned good profit from it.

17. There is a lot of benefit from home ration to business activities. Most importantly the biggest market of grains is also Jodia Bazaar.
18. All facilities are available, which are difficult to explain.
19. No
20. It was earlier but not now.
21. Yes for sure
22. No
23. Now don't know

D. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

24. It is happening every day at different places.
25. Yes, it cause mental and financial problems, it affects business.
26. Nothing
27. Never
28. Whatever they do, KMC plus Police do to increase extortion money.
29. No they never come, when they need vote, you see them every day.
30. None
31. No
32. This market has its own: dentity and most importantly this is the biggest market of goods. This biggest market exists because of small retail business like us. By deceiving or forcing us to leave this market will definitely impact the global reputation of this market and our will deprive of this honour. We and our children will be force to die hungry. Please consider this.

INTERVIEW NO.2

A. BASIC INFORMATION

1. Saddam Hussain (Oil Miller)
2. Khor Garden
3. Jodia Bazaar
- 4.

B. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

5. All sort of oil except edible oil, opens with market from 11:00 a, to 08:00, we experience rush hours during the middle of day.
6. Long-time about 15 years.
7. Another brother
8. We earn enough. Households of our two brothers are satisfied Thank God.
9. Oil, almond, cashew and other valuable goods, the cost is too high.
10. Whenever business activities started KMC and Police people come & fixed their weekly extortion money.
11. Normal, no one will speak truth.
12. Nothing special, we have enough fixed customers and we get few new customers, so business goes 12 months.
13. If there is a chance and money then another oil mill can be started.
14. No one help out, often they security inform KMC so that they would increase their extortion money.

C. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE

15. Our father used to work here at someone's place, when he was unable to work due to his old age then we asked him to remain at home and we started our own setup.
16. We started business by taking some credit, loan and selling jewellery. Our raw material is costly and final goods are being sold lately so we have to wait for profits.
17. It is satisfactory, otherwise people would not be working.
18. It is the biggest market customer is available all the time.
19. These are idle people's work. We are busy in earning bread & butter therefore we don't have time for such activities, so we didn't form any group or association.
20. No
21. Yes
22. We give extortion money to Police and KMC.

23. We have no idea about it but govt. should work on it.

D. ANTI ENCROACHMENT DRIVE

24. At every place people's houses and business are demolished in the name of encroachment.

25. Yes it affects mental state and business activates a lot.

27. We don't receive any notice; just our carts are being broken. We have to face this loss at all the times.

29. When they need vote, you will see them everybody or if they want any support otherwise you won't see them.

30. There is no best alternative then this. We won't go anywhere, we will protest, we have our elders who have spent their lives here in this area.

31. Not at all, we will leave this area only after death.

32. If you have sympathy with us and want to do something. Then do tell higher authorities about poor people who earn on daily basis and eat, help them instead of taking their employment. Find out a medium way so that their employment would be saved and other problems would be solved. I have a suggestion, just like in the Musharaf's era, Mustafa Kamal has provided cabins, that were looked good and also they were source of revenue generation for the government why don't such kind action is taken again?

INTERVIEW No. 3

E. BASIC INFORMATION

- 33. Naeem Ahmed (Chick Peas, Burgers)
- 34. Jodia Bazaar
- 35. Chabba Gali
- 36.

F. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 37. We opens at 10am and opens till 08:00 pm. Rush hours are 11:00 am, 01:00 pm till 05:00 pm.
- 38. Working for last 15 years
- 39. I am alone; I can't afford to hire a servant.
- 40. Enough Thank God.
- 41. Started business in 2000, Kiosk is mine.
- 42. KMC and Police extortion money is a necessary part of business.
- 43. Normal, according to the business.
- 44. Yes I am satisfied; it is good in the beginning of the months and slow in the last days.
- 45. No, single person can do only one business.
- 46. No.

G. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 47. Earlier I used to have a cart, when my friend told me that there is no cheap good available here in afternoon then with his help I started this, after deciding extortion money with KMC and Police.
- 48. I have already told you.
- 18. Raw material. I got at wholesale rate, a lot of customer are available, several other things which cannot be explained.
- 19. No, I have to earn money, all these are political activities.
- 20. No, many groups were there earlier.
- 22. No we give extortion money, rent is too much.

23. Our business is a source of income for our kids and we earn for our bread and butter, house rent, kids' education and other thing through this. We consider this legal, what do you think we don't know!

H. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

24. It is happening at money places. In the first place it is said an order of supreme court now it is done for the sake political and ethnic interest at everywhere.

25. Exactly it affects business.

26. What arrangement we can do you fell.

27. We don't get any notice, they suddenly come mostly before, Eid, Ramadan and other occasions.

28. Nothing

29. No

30. Nothing

31. No

32. We have discussed so many things consider any of these to settle the thing to ease our difficulties.

INTERVIEW No. 4

I. BASIC INFORMATION

- 49. Mohammad Sameer (Dates & Toffee Kiosk)
- 50. Jodia Bazaar
- 51. Mordan Khan Road, Street No.3
- 52.

J. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 53. Dates, Toffee Kiosk opens at 10:00 a.m. till 08:00 p.m., business is good during market hours from 11:00 am till night.
- 54. I started work six years ago before that my father used to work.
- 55. Two brothers, I don't trust on workers
- 56. Enough according to the market.
- 57. Bought raw material of Rs. 50,000/-, now our business is running in profit.
- 58. KMC and Police take extortion money at any cost.
- 59. Normal
- 60. Yes, occasionally profit is very high like Eid, Ramadan etc.
- 61. Yes, if I will get the opportunity.
- 62. No support is received.

K. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 63. I used to work earlier and then started business with my brother, yes nothing would happen would support.
- 64. It was difficult to meet both ends even after doing job in the same market for long time; I had to take loan to fulfil other needs. Then with the help of others I started this kiosk and became owner from worker. I thank God.
- 65. We have got the benefits in business, I faced losses in job.
- 66. All sort of facilities are there, I am quite satisfied.
- 67. No, there is no such group neither it is required.
- 68. No
- 22. We pay extortion money to KMC and Police considering it as rent.
- 23. No idea about it, we are just doing hard work.

L. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

24. Everybody knows in Karachi, wherever they want they start.
25. It definitely affects us, it affects all markets. Kiosks sell relatively cheaper goods and people coverage more on kiosks.
27. We get them but we don't take them seriously because the one who issues notice has also taken extortion money.
28. When there will be a change, people will leave asking for extortion money then we will do something.
29. No, they are enjoining after winning, earlier they used to collect money in the form of charity.
30. None
31. No
32. If you want to help us then like Zaibunnissa market which is closed for cars and KMC stalls are rented, same they should be done here so that our children won't die of hunger and the honour of this market will remain as it is in this way this market will become the world's biggest market instead of Asia's biggest market!

INTERVIEW No. 5

M. BASIC INFORMATION

- 69. Salman Qureshi (Dry Fruit Cart)
- 70. Jodia Bazaar
- 71. Rice Market
- 72. --

N. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 73. Dry fruit business, timings are 10:00 am to 08:00 pm. Rush hours are 11:00 am to 07:00 pm.
- 74. I work alone, it is enough.
- 75. I am in business for the last 15 years.
- 76. It is enough, Thank God.
- 77. Some on credit and some on cash. Every evening I have to give account of almost 10,000 PKR.
- 78. If Police & KMC would do anything without taking any bribe, then that would be the last day (In other words, taking bribes is a routine for KMC and Police officials).
- 79. Enough
- 80. Not sure, but in winters or in wedding season, it is high season.
- 81. Yes, if KMC cooperates, the rent of shops is too high.
- 82. I have received substantial support my entire merchandise come on credit. It is sufficient.

O. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 83. Earlier I used to work as labour or in this market, now everybody knows me so I left job and start my own business. Initially I took loan to build this kiosk then later I paid off. Now I am spending a better life.
- 84. It is a long story, will tell you some other time.
- 85. Benefits are more, short comings are less.
- 86. All that we cannot explain.
- 87. No, May God keeps away from such activities.
- 88. No, earlier it was there to harass us.

89. Yes, but now I feel unsecure after your question.

90. KMC and Police is charging rent, extortion is just the name.

91. Our government is not legal that is imposing inflation on us, then how can we be legal.

P. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

92. Off course, even every child knows.

93. It is obvious, it affects everyone.

94. There is no arrangement nothing works ahead of the government.

95. We don't get any notice just extortion money would be increased.

96. We won't do anything, just arrange increased amount of extortion money.

97. No

98. No place, neither we have any alternate place.

99. We don't know God knows.

100. Poor people made this made and would also safe when needed. Don't harass poor people. Rule like disciple of Prophet, where the ruler considers himself responsible even for the death of a dog.

INTERVIEW No. 6

Q. BASIC INFORMATION

- 101. Kamran
- 102. Jodia Bazaar
- 103. Darya Lal Street
- 104. 0322-2612229

R. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 105. We sell Limka (local soda) cold drink. The rush on our stall begins from 11:00 am onwards.
- 106. We have been working for about 10 years.
- 107. I work alone.
- 108. More than Rs. 1000/- per day.
- 109. 20 percent is input cost and 80 percent is profit. It is done to the fact that I work alone. Otherwise the cost will be higher.
- 110. I pay extortion money to Police officials and KMC staff every week.
- 111. The monthly payment of extortion stretches from Rs. 6000/- to 7000/-
- 112. My business thrives when there is rush in the market. This is a whole sale market. There is large scale dealing in food grain. Many people come for trading. Due to rush and heat, my enterprise benefits a lot. It further flourishes during Eid and other festivals.
- 113. I want to expend my enterprise. But different individuals and groups harass me. Due to this reason, I am not able to expand it.
- 114. No one helps. The shop keepers often collude with the KMC and Police. We have to face the consequences as we have to give a higher rate of extortion money.

S. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 115. Our forefathers have been working in this area for generations (in different trades). Now I am working here since ten years.
- 116. I worked as an employee in different places. The income was negligible. I get married. Salary was very low. As space in my parent's home was inadequate, I rented a small house.

As I was unable to meet all the house hold expenses through my salary. I acquired an old cabin and began this work. By the grace of God, I am able to pay my rent, foot the bills of my children's education and other household expenses. I am also able to save a bit.

117. As my home is nearby, I am able to save on transport. The material used in my enterprise is available in the same market on whole sale rates. I am also able to buy daily grocery at cheap rates. Power break down are also rare. So the benefits are several. Earlier, many political-ethnic organizations used to extort money from us on a regular basis. But after the operation by Pakistan Rangers and other government agencies, the situation is fine.
118. All the material is procured from the nearby locations. I walk to work and save money. I use the same money to buy fruits for my children. There are many benefits.
119. We do not have any organization. The shopkeepers have organization but they are against us. We do not expect anything good from them.
120. No, I am not aware of any such group.
121. Yes I am satisfied. But I fear that our area may not fall prey to anti-encroachment drive like Empress Market.
122. Officials of KMC and Police take extortion money without giving us any receipt. Similar extortion was also changed by political ethnic group.
123. We know that our enterprise is illegal- that is operating on the street. But if the government gives us a permit or license to operate, then the sum that we pay to Police or KMC can go to the government which will enhance its revenue. But apparently, the government is helpless in front of its corrupt officers. It is not able to earn a sizable revenue due to this reasons. Different agencies are benefitting from it. Corrupt officials end up earning more than their salaries due to the on-going extortion. Do help us by convincing the government to legalise us. In this way out enterprises will become legitimate.

T. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

124. We are all scared after observing what happened in the Empress Market. When the KMC has to increase extortion, it confiscates our belongings without giving any notice when we negotiate and agree to pay more extortion money. We get our belongings bark.
125. Yes, we have become used to it. Whenever the KMC is about to strike, we come to know of it through our well-wishers. So our losses are nominal.
126. Sometimes notices are also given. But notices are of little value. The actual matter is the rate of extortion.

127. Now we have become used to of it.

128. Nothing

129. When the elections are near, everyone is visible. Nowadays, no one wants to meet us. When we go to their offices, they are reluctant to listen to us.

130. If we leave this place and work, then our condition shall return to the days when I used to be an employee. I cannot be prosperous after leaving this vocation.

131. No other area is in sight. This enterprise has been set up after a long time. Every enterprise requires time to be strengthened.

You are requested to inform people in the government that while development is important, the livelihood of the poor is also an important attribute. So that unemployment is not increased. Some laws and regulations should be made so that people like us can protect our livelihoods and the government can also revenue.

INTERVIEW No. 7

U. BASIC INFORMATION

- 132. Muhammad Asif (Tea Kiosk)
- 133. Napier Road
- 134. Jodia Bazaar
- 135. 0305-2577529

V. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 136. It depends on the market condition. Usually the business is good from 11:00 am to 08:00 pm. It is a tea stall therefore the business runs for 12 months a year.
- 137. I have been operating this stall since past 20 years.
- 138. Three people work with us.
- 139. By Gods' grace, the business is good. After paying the wages and cost of the supplies, I am able to earn well.
- 140. I am able to save 50%. About 50% of the turnover is spent on wages, extortion money and input cost of supplies etc. now the expenses have begun rising so the savings are impacted.
- 141. KMC and Police officers regularly come to collect extortion money. If we do not pay then they send their teams to evict us. Now our matters are 'settles' with them.
- 142. You may consider Rs. 7000/--8000/- per month.
- 143. The city situation was bad due to poor law and order conditions in the past. It has lately improved. Our customers are those hotel or shop owners who come this market for wholesale purchase of goods. Business has improved but rising cost of living has slightly affected our business.
- 144. I thought of expanding earlier. Now the attitude of KMC officials and other agencies is not favourable. I find it difficult to run even one stall. But if conditions improve, I will definitely expand my business.
- 145. People just come and drink tea as our customers. No further help is received. Shop keepers do not like us because they think the front open space as their own territory.

W. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

146. Initially I worked with my elder brother by operating from a plain table. Now I have a stable business. I have also developed working relations with KMC and Police. Therefore they do not unnecessarily bother us.
147. Our people used to do labour work in the market. I would visit them for search of work. I found that in this area, there is no tea stall. I consulted with other stall holders in the space. They had no objection. So we set up a tea stall in the area.
148. This place is near our house so we save on community cost. The merchandise used in the tea stall is available on wholesale rates. Besides we do our domestic grocery from the same market at discounted rates. Our tea stall also flourishes on Jodia Bazaar is a busy market of the city. There are a few losses that are also incurred from time to time. But we are not too much bothered for it.
149. We do got services. The ‘corrupt’ staffs of several government departments also help. However we do not have electricity connection. We bring our own batteries after charging then. We use LED lamps when we work during evenings.
150. No such organization or association exists that would support our cabin operations since the past 20 years. We do not need it. We deal with KMC officials, Police man, shop keepers and others on our own.
151. There were several political groups and parties that extorted money. But the situation now is quite better. Operation by rangers has improved the security and safety conditions.
152. Yes, we are satisfied.
153. As stated earlier, we are paying extortion money to KMC staff and Police officials. This sum may have been deposited in the coffers of the government.
154. We understand that our business is not legal, however we are operating under the patronage of government officials.

X. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

155. We understand that place where people do not extortion money, end up facing demolitions. This is a big city. We learn that it happens some where all the while.
156. We fore see that it can happen. However we are not bothered about it as we are quite used to of it.
157. Mostly this work is done by KMC. It ends up in increasing the rate of extortion money.
158. We do not understand what it means.
159. We will increase the rate of extortion money.
160. The councillor often comes to have a free cup of tea. No one else comes to visit us.
161. Till the time police and KMC staff continue to receive extortion money, things will move on. When someone will try to act 'honestly', things will become very difficult.
162. We are likely to pay extortion money where ever we will go. So why should we leave our stable business from here.
163. If you want to help us, then get our business legalized we will be happy to pay this amount to the government. In this way the revenue of the government will increase.

INTERVIEW No. 8

Y. BASIC INFORMATION

- 164. Muhammad Imran (Chicken Sales)
- 165. Jodia Bazaar
- 166. Napier Road
- 167. 0305-2577529

Z. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 168. We sell freshly dressed chicken. The business is normal on ordinary days. It is high on Fridays and Saturday.
- 169. We are working here since past two years. Previously this contract was used by other people.
- 170. We are two people, one owner and one worker.
- 171. Business is normal during common days; it becomes double or more during Saturday, Sunday and festival days.
- 172. 60 percent of capital is invested to bear the cost – we are able to save about 40 percent.
- 173. We pay extortion to KMC officials (Rs. 500 per week) and police (Rs. 300 per weeks). Sometimes traffic police also extorts money.
- 174. We pay Rs. 5000/- per month as extortion.
- 175. Business proposals do fluctuate – Eid and other festivals cause sales to increase to about four times.
- 176. Everyone wants to expand the business. But then when we try to do so, the KMC officials increase the rate of extortion money. They demand more than what we earn. Rents of the shops is very high. So we are unable to deal with it.
- 177. No one helps. Rather they secretly inform the agencies concerned about our conduct.

AA. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 178. Before I used to work in Kharadar as an employee. Here I have begun my own work. It is working well. Before starting any trade, one has to do a feasibility assessment. Interestingly, the government officials, turn illegal into legal after charging an extortion money.

179. I was a worker with a daily wage of Rs. 400/-. It was difficult to make ends meet. Then I decided to open a shop. But it was very difficult due to paucity of funds. Then someone helped me to put this cabin on the footpath. After developing an 'understanding' with relevant government officials (KMC and Police), the business is running satisfactory.
180. There are more advantages than disadvantages. The main disadvantages were due to (the extortion) of ethnic / political parties which has ended now.
181. The customers are plenty and we buy home grocery conveniently. However our raw material (live chicken) comes from far away locations.
182. No one.
183. No association exists.
184. Yes, I used to be a worker. Now I am an owner.
185. Whatever extortion money is charged by police officials and KMC staff, we consider it as rent.
186. No, we understand that when the government may like, it can remove us. We will not be unhappy about it. But if our livelihood is kept here by the God, than He will protect us.

BB.ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

187. Everywhere it is going on for those who do not pay extortion money, all being removed. While those pay the extortion are timely informed. One should not be worried about it.
188. We do not face any immediate threat. We are also used to it.
189. What can we do. No one can fight the government. Till the time we are able to earn, it is fine.
190. We do not get notices. We get to know news code words, so that no one get affected.
191. What can we do. We will stop our work for some time. We will pay extortion money and then work will begin.
192. They are not of relevance. They act as secret informers for KMC.
193. We can consider locations where there is a market, or residential flats, with some population density. We will work in areas where we can make some money after paying extortion.
194. As above.
195. From this discussion, I do not see any improvement. Government will do whatever it wants. We only desire that we should be given option of livening. The government should consider extending space for setting up commercial enterprise in the informal sector. People will make their own homes.

INTERVIEW No. 9

CC. BASIC INFORMATION

- 196. Irfan (Chemical's Cabin)
- 197. Jodia Bazaar
- 198. Napier Road
- 199.

DD. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 200. The business continues from 11:00 am to 07:00 pm. These are usual rush hours.
- 201. I have been working in the market since childhood. I possess basic education but it is enough for running this work.
- 202. Four people including myself.
- 203. We earn enough, which is sufficient for our self.
- 204. Profit in dry chemicals is less while it is more in liquid chemicals.
- 205. We have to pay the KMC and Police officials appropriate extortion money.
- 206. Leave this matter aside. It is between us and them.
- 207. Our business operates in the same manner throughout the year. We are grateful to God.
- 208. We find it adequate. We can supervise our labour well in one location only.
- 209. Everyone is jealous of us. No one helps.

EE. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 210. This is our ancestral work.
- 211. It is a long story. After migrating from India, our grandfather began this work with very humble beginnings. Initially he worked as a labourer. Later he began his own work. It progressed. Now we are operating it.
- 212. There is no loss. We benefit by the grace of God.
- 213. We have amenities of various kinds.
- 214. No association is present.
- 215. No.
- 216. Yes, we have been working in continuum of our ancestors. Had we not been satisfied, we would have left it.

217. We believe that the extortion many collected by KMC and Police staff is equivalent of the rent for operating in this area.
218. In this country, if you do not pay extortion money, then even legal business can become illegal. If you want to help us then make (fibre glass) cabins as was done by former mayor Mustafa Kamal some years ago. The cabins were formally developed and then distributed. The rent charged must be going to the municipality. It may have reduced the revenue deficit of KMC. Cheap access to self-employment is the answer to this country's economic uses.

FF. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

219. It is going on everywhere. No point to discuss it. Before it begins, one gets the news.
220. Definitely. The stall operators are denied the opportunity to operate in the market. Their work is affected.
221. There is no preparation. We only bank on God.
222. No notice is given. Only secret information is relayed. The rate of extortion money is increased. After it is adjusted everything returns to normal.
223. Nothing, we will only raise the rate of extortion money.
224. We see the councillor some times.
225. As we have not been asked to leave, we have no option.
226. No option.
227. People should be provided with employment opportunities, not to cause dislocations. People will be economically destroyed if demolitions continue. The prime minister becomes famous by not living in the PM house. Everything gets projected in the media. But the poor gets destroyed when the so called anti encroachment drives are started. It appears that the government wishes to destroy and eliminate the poor, not poverty.

INTERVIEW NO. 10

GG. BASIC INFORMATION

- 228. Aqeel Ahmed (General Items, Toffees, Candies, Baby diapers etc)
- 229. Jodia Bazaar
- 230. Chabba Gali
- 231. --

HH. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 232. I operate my cabin from 11:00 am to 10:00 pm.
- 233. This cabin has been running since 30 years. I have been running it since last few years.
- 234. I work alone. Sometimes a friend comes to help. But he is not an employee.
- 235. I am able to earn enough.
- 236. What I sell are all company items. Margin of profit is less. When I have high sale, then I am able to earn better.
- 237. Extortion money is regularly paid to KMC and Police staff. There is hardly any place in the city where extortion money is not charged by staff of these departments.
- 238. We pay more to KMC staff than Police officials.
- 239. Our sales is satisfactory. When the overall market is doing well, our sales are good.
- 240. No. I am alone and have limited capacity to operate. It is difficult to run this work. It will be difficult to expand.
- 241. No, not at all whenever assistance is needed, everyone is funding for one self.

II. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 242. This cabin belonged to my uncle. I used to be an employee elsewhere. I got it from my uncle.
- 243. As I said, it was founded by my uncle. After he died, I got it.
- 244. This place has many benefits. No losses or regrets.
- 245. This place is very convenient. I have access to public transport. Being wholesale market, I got merchandise without any mark-up.
- 246. No, there is no association.
- 247. No.
- 248. Yes.

249. No rent. Only extortion money is paid.

250. I have no idea. It is the responsibility of the government to look after its people.

JJ. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

251. I am aware. It is going on in many places.

252. Karachi is like a human body. If there will be pain in one part of the body, it will be felt by the whole body.

253. Not at all.

254. 'Notice' is of no consequence. Whoever serves the notice also comes and picks up the extortion money. Everything becomes fine thereafter.

255. I believe everything will be done by the KMC and Police. While they get adequate salaries, they receive extortion money four times a month. They will be the real suffers.

256. After becoming the councillor, he shows his face some times.

257. No one.

258. No.

Government should try to end poverty, not the poor. The rules are talking about 'state of Madina' where rulers were concerned even if a dog would die in their jurisdiction. Here the people are dying a dog's death and no one is bothered. Poor people are finding it very difficult to survive.

INTERVIEW NO. 11

KK. BASIC INFORMATION

- 259. Shehzad Ahmed (Lassi, Yoghurt drink – local flavour)
- 260. Lea Market Chowk
- 261. Thatta Bus Stop
- 262.

LL. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 263. We make yoghurt from milk. After adding a tinge of salt, we prepare this drink which is refreshing in summers.
- 264. Since past two years.
- 265. I have two employees.
- 266. This turnover is Rs. 6000/- daily (in summers).
- 267. After deducting the expenses, I am able to save about Rs. 3000/-
- 268. Extortion money is regularly paid to KMC staff and Police officials. We cannot operate otherwise.
- 269. Reasonable.
- 270. We are happy. When it is hot weather and rush hours in the market, the business flourishes.
- 271. Yes.
- 272. No.

MM. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 273. We are from village. We used to visit Karachi regularly. Often the village land lord used to send us to the city to sell vegetables. Right next to this Thatta bus stop, there is a whole sale market of milk. Loads of milk is transacted in wholesale. During summers, if people drink soda lemon or other such drinks, it affects the throat. Therefore we would bring this yoghurt drink and sell here with very low capital, we have become well to do. In comparison terms, we have become financially reasonable.
- 274. I have told above. Other friends helped.
- 275. There are more benefits than losses here.
- 276. Nothing is more beneficial than the livelihood connected to this area.
- 277. No, previously it used to be ANP. Now it is PTI and has brought more disasters.

278. No.
279. Yes.
280. No, we pay extortion money.
281. We are earning our livelihoods, we do not anything else.

NN. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

282. It is going on everywhere in Sindh. It is more in Karachi.
283. No, not significant.
284. No. Officials inform, we temporarily move away and then come back after some time.
285. No.
286. No. we believe that after increasing the rate of extortion money, everything will be all right.
287. I do not know.
288. No.
289. No.
290. Make a better policy for us. Instead of making 5 million houses, save, secure and promote the livelihood of poor people. Otherwise everyone will become a beggar.

INTERVIEW NO. 12

OO. BASIC INFORMATION

- 291. M. Faisal (Lemon drink push cart)
- 292. Lea Market
- 293. Vegetable market
- 294.

PP. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 295. Lemonade is liked by people during the summers. It is liked by all. Rush hours from 11:00 a.m. till evening.
- 296. During the past four years, I sell lemonade in summers and peanuts during winters.
- 297. I work alone.
- 298. It is satisfactory.
- 299. The input cost is also satisfactory. I am able to bear it.
- 300. Everyone pays extortion money.
- 301. I do not want to disclose the amount.
- 302. I earn enough to support my household.
- 303. No.
- 304. No.

QQ. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 305. I used to be a moving cart vendor before. My friends told me that there is a rush of people in and around Lea Market. One can earn enough by standing on one side of the Lea Market. I followed the advice of my friend who is a policeman in the local police station. He helped me setup the cabin.
- 306. I have already told.
- 307. I benefited a lot. There was no harm.
- 308. I got regular customers and merchandise.
- 309. No.
- 310. No. everyone has joined ANP (Awami National Party).
- 311. Yes
- 312. No.
- 313. I don't know.

RR. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

314. I am aware. It is taking place in the city.

315. No, not bothered.

316. No one.

317. No one.

318. I will remove my push cart.

319. I have never seen.

320. No one

321. —

322. Let us earn our livelihood in an honest manner. Otherwise unemployment and crimes will increase.

INTERVIEW NO. 13

SS. BASIC INFORMATION

- 323. M. Khan (Niswar – a local tobacco like article, extensively used in KPK)
- 324. Lea Market Chowk
- 325. Thatta Chowk
- 326.

TT. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 327. We have been supplying Niswar as an ancestral trade our supply is greater than small shop keepers such as cobblers (who traditionally sell it at retail level). The supply is also made to location in interior Sindh at wholesale and retail scale. Our trade continues from 05:00 am in the morning to 11:00 pm.
- 328. As stated, this is our ancestral trade.
- 329. About 6-7 supply agents also work for us on a commission basis.
- 330. One part is input cost while three parts is profit.
- 331. Sales is satisfactory.
- 332. Extortion money is regularly paid to KMC and Police officials.
- 333. Adequate.
- 334. It is adequately spread out. We cannot create more enemies (competitors).
- 335. ---
- 336. Nothing. Everyone around is jealous.

UU. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 337. It was begun by my grandfather who is no more.
- 338. ---
- 339. This location is very favourable. I do not see any problem.
- 340. All amenities are available that may be required by any business.
- 341. I do not subscribe to it. Only idle people can relate to it.
- 342. I do not know.
- 343. Certainly
- 344. Adequate amount of extortion money is given.
- 345. Who so ever takes extortion money shall also provide protection.

VV. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

346. Yes. Everything has been negatively impacted due to the decisions of the new government.
347. Absolutely aware of it. But we believe and bank on God.
348. When anything substantial will move our way, then we will see.
349. No notice is given. But demolitions begin.
350. Nothing.
351. He is not concerned about the situation.
352. This place is a reminder of our ancestors. We do not intend to leave it.
353. Talk about something else.
354. I request you to inform everyone concerned that if our business is affected or uprooted, our families will be affected by poverty and hunger. They may turn to crimes.

INTERVIEW NO. 14

WW. BASIC INFORMATION

- 355. M. Nasir [(Paan) Betal leaf shop]
- 356. Lea Market
- 357. Paan Mandi
- 358. ---

XX. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 359. We sell small sized fully prepared pan. Our cabin is flooded with customers from 09:00 am to 12:00 am mid night. Our shop opens much early.
- 360. We have been working for a very long time in this area.
- 361. Two employees work for us.
- 362. We are able to make the ends meet.
- 363. We got material on credit. We settle the account by evening after earning through our sales.
- 364. Yes, we cannot even think of operating without paying (extortion) to them.
- 365. Sufficient.
- 366. It is not a fixed sale. Ups and downs are experienced.
- 367. No, not now.
- 368. No support is received from any one.

YY. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 369. My father initially started this week. When he became old, then I took over.
- 370. My fathers' friends brought him here. Initially he used to work as a labourer. Income was low. After developing links with the local shopkeepers, he established this cabin. Material was acquired on credit. He also liaised with the KMC and Police officials. I am following in his footsteps.
- 371. There are many benefits. Apparently no disadvantage. Initially the extortionists from the political party (ANP) used to bother us a lot. Now they are gone. So no visible problem found.
- 372. There are many amenities connected to this area. Access to acquiring material on credit to (affordable) residence are some mentions.
- 373. No, we do not subscribe to politics.
- 374. No.

375. Yes.
376. We pay adequate extortion money.
377. This is our livelihood. I believe it is legal. After collecting extortion money from us, the staff (apparently) also gives a share to their officers.

ZZ.ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

378. It is going on everywhere. People tell us.
379. We have become used to of it.
380. No
381. No. Public announcement is made. The staff who draw extortion money has given us assurance that we will not be affected.
382. Nothing.
383. We only see them when the elections are held.
384. No one.
385. No
386. Instead of bothering and destroying the poor, the government should focus on recovering taxes and money from those who have been involved in corruption.

INTERVIEW NO. 15

AAA. BASIC INFORMATION

- 387. Jamil Ahmed (Pakoray Walley)
- 388. Lea Market
- 389. Milk Market (Lea Market)
- 390. ---

BBB. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 391. This is a cabin of pakoray, samosy and other fried snacks. The rush of the customers begins from 11:00 am onwards. The rush further increase during lunch hours. We operate from 10:00 am to 10:00 pm.
- 392. This is our ancestral work. I have been working with my father since thirty years.
- 393. Two employees work for us.
- 394. We work enough.
- 395. We earn about 50 percent profit on a daily basis.
- 396. We pay extortion money to KMC and Police officials. We pay even when the income is negligible.
- 397. It is satisfactory sometimes the KMC and Police staff get our snacks for free.
- 398. Whenever there is rush in the market, our business also benefits.
- 399. No. We get tired with our existing work.
- 400. No. They get jealous.

CCC. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 401. We have been working here since generations. We have seen our elders working here. Whatever my father used to do to manage business, now I am doing.
- 402. Already stated.
- 403. We generally draw benefits. No disadvantage is experienced so far.
- 404. Of all kinds.
- 405. No. Who so ever discusses to form an association, we tend to dissociate from him. When our work is continuing well through 'extortion' to municipal and police officials, why should we indulge into making a party or group.
- 406. No.

407. Yes.
408. No.
409. I don't know. We are only focussed at our work.

DDD. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

410. Yes. They have destroyed the entire city and continuing.
411. No. Not bothered.
412. No.
413. Do you think that a notice is likely to be delivered
414. No one can remove us from here. We are operating at this place since generations.
415. They just come to have free snacks some time.
416. No one.
417. No.
418. Do not scare us. If you want to do anything positive, help feed the hungry. Do not make them lose their livelihood.

INTERVIEW NO. 16

EEE. BASIC INFORMATION

- 419. M. Munaf (Toffees and Chocolate)
- 420. Kharadar
- 421. Chuttan Shah Ghazi Mazaar (opposite to it)
- 422. ---

FFF. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 423. We operate from 07:00 am to 11:00 pm. Most of the articles we sell are of attraction for children. The school hours are rush hours for us.
- 424. We began this work after trying many other options.
- 425. I work alone.
- 426. Reasonable income.
- 427. I began the work with Rs. 20,000/-. Now the income is satisfactory.
- 428. No one can operate without paying extortion money to KMC and police officials.
- 429. Reasonable.
- 430. I earn enough.
- 431. No.
- 432. No.

GGG. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 433. My house is near. I have many hawker friends. I began this work upon their suggestion.
- 434. I do not have time to describe all these details.
- 435. There are many benefits. We are in the older part of the city. There are many whole sale markets nearby. Being near to the house is also a blessing.
- 436. All the amenities that I need.
- 437. No.
- 438. No.
- 439. Yes.
- 440. No.
- 441. I don't know

HHH. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

442. It is going on everywhere.
443. Yes, absolutely.
444. What are we supposed to do.
445. What is it. I don't understand.
446. I cannot say anything with certainty.
447. They just come for seeking vote and asking us to join political processions.
448. No one.
449. Nothing.
450. The Prime Minister should focus on building livelihoods, not houses. People will make houses themselves. Eradicate poverty, not poor.

INTERVIEW NO. 17

III. BASIC INFORMATION

- 451. Abdullah Kitchen (Cabin of Biryani)
- 452. Kharadar
- 453. Pir Chuttan Shah Road
- 454. ---

JJJ. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 455. It is a Biryani point. We open at 11:00 am. Till about 03:00 pm, we are able to sell 3 vessels full of the food.
- 456. We have been operating here since past 15 years.
- 457. I have 3 employees.
- 458. It is Gods' benevolence. I earn about Rs. 25000/- everyday.
- 459. Half of it is profit.
- 460. KMC and Police officials charge extortion money without fail.
- 461. Reasonable.
- 462. We supply our Biryani on various occasions such as religious festivals (Majlis, Niaz) and wedding festivals.
- 463. Yes. But the rent of the shops is very high.
- 464. No.

KKK. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 465. I was an employee in a local restaurant. I had learned to cook well. I used to work hard and long hours but the income was low. On my friends' advice. I began this work on a small scale.
- 466. It is very difficult to narrate.
- 467. We draw benefits. I don't find any demerit.
- 468. Various types of conveniences exist. Useful climate that indulges in such religious practices such as majlis and niaz.
- 469. We do not engage in it.
- 470. No.
- 471. Yes.
- 472. We pay extortion money. That is enough.

473. I don't know.

LLL. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

474. It is going on everywhere. Especially in old town, it is much more.

475. Yes. But we have become used to of it.

476. What can we do. Who can fight the government.

477. What is it.

478. We can enhance the extortion money to twice the rate. But we cannot end our running business.

479. Mr. Councillor is indebted to us. He is not visible since many days.

480. No one.

481. No one.

482. Leave us alone. Please consider giving us the cabins on rent as was done during the times of Mayor Mustafa Kamal. Do not bother us any further.

INTERVIEW NO. 18

MMM. BASIC INFORMATION

- 483. Ali (Mechanic)
- 484. Kharadar
- 485. Next to Kikri Ground
- 486. ---

NNN. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 487. I run a motor cycle mechanic cabin. I operate from 08:00 am to 10:00 pm. Sometimes I have many customers.
- 488. I am working here since 5 years.
- 489. I have two helpers.
- 490. Usually customers come for minor repairs. But sometimes I get customers for full engine over haul. As motor cycle is the most common means of commute, we do get reasonable work.
- 491. ---
- 492. We pay extortion money regularly to KMC and police officials every work.
- 493. Leave it. I cannot answer.
- 494. When the young men decorate their vehicles during Eid and other festivals, our work increase and hence our income.
- 495. No.
- 496. No one helps.

OOO. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 497. I learned this vocation at Akber Road. I live here. After learning the trade and to enhance my income, I began this work close to my home. It took some time to 'settle' the matters with KMC and police officials. After that stage, I have been operating smoothly.
- 498. I have already given the details.
- 499. Being close to the house, there are many benefits. The de-merits are very few.
- 500. There are several.
- 501. No.
- 502. Previously there was Lyari Aman Committee that was very harmful to us. Now it is better.
- 503. Yes.
- 504. No.

505. I don't know.

PPP. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

506. Yes it is going on everywhere.

507. No, nothing especial.

508. What can we do.

509. What is that. I don't know.

510. We will try to pay more extortion money to KMC officials.

511. We see him occasionally. But no direct interaction.

512. No one.

513. No.

514. People have lost their livelihoods. There is a possibility that people can move towards crimes.

The little peace that our city has experienced may disappear. These harsh steps must stop.

INTERVIEW NO. 19

QQQ. BASIC INFORMATION

- 515. Huzaifa (Bar BQ Kabab)
- 516. Kharadar
- 517. Lane No. 1
- 518. ---

RRR. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 519. I have been operating in this area since past ten years. We sell Seekh Kabab, Chicken boti, and related articles. From 11:00 am to 10:00 pm, the rush hours continue.
- 520. We have been operating here since past 10 years. My father, myself and two employees.
- 521. Two employees who help us prepare the material.
- 522. We earn enough on a daily basis.
- 523. One fourth is the input cost while the remaining three fourth is profit.
- 524. We have to pay extortion money to KMC and police officials, irrespective of income and sales.
- 525. Reasonable.
- 526. Our sales are more during the festivals such as Eid. Even otherwise, the sales are adequate. Labour and employees come and have their food here.
- 527. Yes, if we get a chance and conditions remain favourable.
- 528. No. Because of them KMC officials bother us. They are normally jealous.

SSS. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 529. We have done many works before doing this stint. It was very difficult to meet the domestic expenses such as house rent, children's education and other expenses. Ten years ago, I began this work which stabilized in six months. Now we are leading a happy life.
- 530. I have already told about it.
- 531. We have many benefits.
- 532. We have all the amenities.
- 533. No.
- 534. No.
- 535. Yes.
- 536. We pay extortion money almost equal to rent.

537. I don't know. But the administration should do something.

TTT. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

538. Everywhere this campaign is going on.

539. It does not matter.

540. It is not easy to fight against the government. What can we do.

541. No.

542. We will increase the extortion money. Notice may be retrieved.

543. I do see him walking around.

544. No one.

545. No.

546. I have said enough.

INTERVIEW NO. 20

UUU. BASIC INFORMATION

- 547. Waqas (Pan Cabin)
- 548. Kharadar
- 549. Tower lane
- 550. ---

VVV. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

- 551. I operate from 11:00 am in the morning to 12:00 mid night. The rush continues till 12:00 mid night.
- 552. I have been operating here since past 10 years.
- 553. I work alone.
- 554. Reasonable.
- 555. Half to the sale proceed is profit.
- 556. KMC and police officials charge an extortion money without exception.
- 557. Reasonable.
- 558. I see average sales mostly. After the ban on 'Gutka', our work has been adversely affected.
- 559. It is not possible now.
- 560. No one helps.

WWW. RELATIONSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE.

- 561. As I live chose by, I was able to observe the potential before starting the work.
- 562. I used to go far away to fetch 'Gutka'. At one point in time I learned embroiling work but it did not succeed. The contractor had made the life miserable for us. I wanted to start a new vocation. After reuniting the situation and consultation with the friends, I began the poor cabin.
- 563. I had many benefits. Though the benefits have reduced but still, there are no disadvantages.
- 564. I have all kinds of benefits. Being near to the house is a huge advantage.
- 565. I do not believe in its usefulness.
- 566. No one.
- 567. Yes.
- 568. No, this is enough that I pay extortion.
- 569. I don't know.

XXX. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

570. It is going on everywhere. People are becoming unemployed due to it.
571. It does not matter.
572. I don't know what to do. You tell us.
573. What is it. I am unaware of it.
574. Nothing. It is quite common.
575. I have not seen who is the councillor.
576. No one.
577. I don't know now. But when the time will come, we will see. We have to work anyway.
578. I request the government to take measures to increase the employment.

STREET ECONOMY AND PUBLIC LAND IN KARACHI

CHECK LIST OF INTERVIEW WITH STREET ENTREPRENEUR

A. BASIC INFORMATION

1. Name
2. Location
3. Contact details (optional)
4. Phone number (optional)

B. INFORMATION ON THE ENTERPRISE

5. Details of the enterprise (type, scale, clientele, timing of operation)
6. Since how long have you been running this enterprise?
7. How many people work for you (staff and / or helpers)
8. What is your daily / weekly / monthly turn over?
9. What is your input cost (including raw material, wages, logistics etc)
10. Do you incur any invisible cost (informal payment to KMC /Cantonment Board Staff, Police or any other agency or individual)
11. If the answer of 10 is yes then how much?
12. Is your business stable? Does it experience any time bound (or other type of fluctuation?) Please identify.
13. Do you intend to expand your business? How are you planning for it?
14. What type of support you receive from your fellow entrepreneur in this area?

C. RELATINSHIP WITH LOCATION / PUBLIC SPACE

15. How did you get access to operate your business from this area? Were you assisted or guided by some one?
16. Please inform about the process of setting up your enterprise in this location.
17. What are the advantages and disadvantages of operating from this area?
18. What type of services / amenities / utilities you access while in this place.
19. Are you a member of any group or welfare association related to this area or your business?
20. Does such an association or group exist in this area?
21. Are you satisfied to run your business from this area?
22. Do you pay any rent or other type of charges to operate from this area? To whom?

23. Do you believe that your business / enterprise is legal and protected by law?

D. ANTI ENCROCHMENT DRIVE

24. Are you aware that there is an anti-encroachment drive that is taking place in the city?
What are your views on it?
25. Do you fore see that this drive will also affect you directly or indirectly?
26. What pre cautionary measures have you taken individually or collectively?
27. Have you been served any notice for removing you enterprise?
28. In case you receive such a notice, what do you intend to do?
29. Did the Councillors, MPAs or any other official come to assure you of any support in case an anti-encroachment drive happen in this area?
30. What are your options in case a re-location becomes inevitable
31. Do you have any alternate location in mind?
32. Any other comments and general observation on this subject.

17.04.19

No. 20	1. Name Mohd. Khalil	2. Residence. PIB Colony
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner (inherited from g/father), gave on rent: Sale of masks, magic paraphernalia. Himself sold tea at adjacent makeshift stall.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop (4x4), addition of tea stall (tbm)
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Market (second streetlight from Mansfield Street/ Shahra-e-Liaquat crossing)		6. Current Location None, working as makeshift parking manager on site
7. Previous Income (Monthly) Comfortably between Rs. 10,000 – 15,000		8. Current Income (Monthly) -
9. Time/ Income Lost 5 months		10. Allotment Yes. Allotment letter for Khadda Market. Already occupied shop (fish market).
11. Notes A Pathan entrepreneur has bribed the Police to allow the razed area to be used as a parking lot, he employed Khalil on the pretext that he has nothing to do now.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -		13. Future Plans -

No. 21	1. Name Talha s/o Iqbal	2. Residence Jacob Lines
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner (inherited from g/father). Khulla cloth and bedsheets,		4. No. of Shops & Size 2 shops (4x4)
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Market		6. Current Location Mir Karamali Talpur Road (dihaari/ re:notes)
7. Previous Income (Monthly) Approximately 50,000		8. Current Income (Monthly) Barely 20,000 (700 – 800/ day)
9. Time/ Income Lost 2 months		10. Allotment No

11. Notes Operated shop, now makeshift spot with brother Yasir. Works for someone else now on daily wages. Operates via parked rehri under new structure, displays own stock (light tents) on the side. Had to return stock, some at home. Household size: 8		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Police, Traffic Police, KMC <i>bhatta</i> and harassment are constants.		13. Future Plans -
No. 22	1. Name Niaz Mohammed	2. Residence Naval
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner (inherited from g/father). Sugarcane juice.		4. No. of Shops & Size 3 shops. Shop no. 54 (sale) Shop nos. 559 & 560 (godown/ cleaning)
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Market. Facing Shahra-e-Liaquat.		6. Current Location Has rented a Suzuki pickup truck (300/ tareekh)
7. Previous Income (Monthly) Approximately 15,000. Higher in the summer season.		8. Current Income (Monthly) -
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months		10. Allotment Yes. Considers void.
11. Notes Younger brother, two sons and helper worked at shop. Has record of all 'official' documents: License, tax, electricity and gas bills.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Police, Traffic Police, KMC <i>bhatta</i> and harassment are constants.		13. Future Plans -

No. 23	1. Name Sayed Saaduddin	2. Residence Near Al-Burhan Centre
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner (inherited). Of the 43 shops, 23 ran as 'hotel'; of the rest, uncles and cousins operated some, others on rent (selling chappals), still others used as godowns.		4. No. of Shops & Size Father + 4 brothers started with 2 shops decades ago – had 43 shops by the time of eviction.
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Market. Kheru Hotel across the Kite Market.		6. Current Location At uncle's hotel on Mir Karamali Talpur Road. Some family members have moved to Baldia.

7. Previous Income (Monthly) Comfortable living, own earnings alongside rent. Personally received rent from two shops at Rs. 10,000/shop.		8. Current Income (Monthly) The difference is huge.	
9. Time/ Income Lost Some weeks, moved in to work at uncles 'hotel' in the vicinity.		10. Allotment Yes. Allotment letters for Khadda Market (only plot) and Baldia.	
11. Notes Lost a lot of stock, esp cold. Part of a large Pashtun (Quetta) clan, collective ownership.			
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -		13. Future Plans -	
No. 24	1. Name Yahya	2. Residence -	
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Tenant, paid Rs. 7000/ month		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 (4'x4')	
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Market. Clothes.		6. Current Location Operates rehri along bldg across the road from Noman Centre.	
7. Previous Income Comfortable living.		8. Current Income Rs. 300/ day	
9. Time/ Income Lost Started work 12 days ago. Time lost is November to April.		10. Allotment Yes. Allotment letter for Khadda Market. Shops pre-occupied.	
11. Notes Was not keen on talking.			
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -		13. Future Plans Is hopeless.	

No. 25	1. <i>Name</i> Mohd. Amanullah	2. <i>Residence</i> -	
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Owner, 60 years, inherited from father. Sold cloth for male shalwar kameez. Now sells second-hand clothes.		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 4 shops (16'x4')	
5. <i>Previous Location</i> Umar Farooq Market.		6. <i>Current Location</i> Has hung his stock on the façade bldg across	

	the road from Noman Centre, empathetic shop owner.
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Very comfortable living.	8. <i>Current Income</i> Barely getting by.
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 3 months.	10. <i>Allotment</i> Yes. Allotment letter for Baldia. Shops are preoccupied. Threat of violence.
11. <i>Notes</i> Had paid his rent till December, evicted in November. Took part in the resistance btw 7 – 10 November. Lost stock in process. Owner of shop where he currently set up his stock has empathetically allowed him to put up his ware on façade.	
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Yes	13. <i>Future Plans</i> -

19.04.2019

No. 26	1. <i>Name</i> Mohd. Israr	2. <i>Residence</i> CIA Center Chowk, Saddar
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Owner since colonial period, inherited from grandfather. Paid KMC 4800/ 6 months.		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 shop (inside)
5. <i>Previous Location</i> Inside the meat market section of Empress Market.		6. <i>Current Location</i> Inside the meat market section of Empress Market.
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Rs. 20,000 – 25,000 per day		8. <i>Current Income</i> Rs. 1000 – 1200 per day
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 3 months.		10. <i>Allotment</i> Yes, in Ranchore Lines. Refused.
11. <i>Notes</i> Has all receipts, dating back to colonial period (19 th century). Allotments have been made in Soldier Bazaar and Lines Area as well. Of the 93 shops inside the Empress Market building, 56 have refused to accept the letter/location of compensation. The KMC has allowed electricity for some shops across and the courtyard, but not for the meat market. Have made repeated requests and pleas to a number of officials, none have responded. The operation broke the netting of the windows, which the shopkeepers have had to repair at their own cost.		

12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Yes	13. Future Plans To stay on in Empress Market, been here since he was 13.
---	--

No. 27	1. Name Shaukat Khan Kakar	2. Residence -
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Dry fruit (wholesaler), oils, dates, tea		4. No. of Shops & Size 14 shops and about 20, 9 kilo carrying pushcarts.
5. Previous Location Along the Pan Market		6. Current Location Inside the courtyard with a single pushcart
7. Previous Income Rs. 25k – 35k per day. Some days even upto Rs. 25 lacs.		8. Current Income Rs. 1000 – 2000/ day. Many times don't sell enough and have to take it home.
9. Time/ Income Lost 2 months.		10. Allotment "Don't care for the allotment, this is where our shops always have been and should be."
11. Notes Paid taxes, rent, electricity bills, etc. Had a very well established set of businesses, esp dry fruit wholesale.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) "Don't care for harassment, what is left anyway?"		13. Future Plans No plans.

No. 28	1. Name Shamu	2. Residence Jogi Mor
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Helper. Works for a shop owner at Birds Market.		4. No. of Shops & Size Did not specify. Answered, several shops since cages require space.
5. Previous Location Bird Market		6. Current Location Empress Mall
7. Previous Income Salaried 300/day (tbc)		8. Current Income Same as before.
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months.		10. Allotment Unaware.

11. Notes The authorities broke our cages, took them away as well. People have fled to Rainbow Centre / Zainab Market / Fire Brigade.	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Yes	13. Future Plans Same as before, only changed location.

No. 29	1. Name Ali	2. Residence -
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner of 2 shops, bought 5 years ago for 25 lacs. Rented 1 shop @ 1 lac advance and rent at Rs.10,000/ month. Sells birds and small animals.		4. No. of Shops & Size 3 shops.
5. Previous Location "Under the tree" at the Birds Market		6. Current Location Empress Mall
7. Previous Income (Monthly) 60,000 – 1 lac		8. Current Income (Monthly) 20,000 – 30,000 after rent payment.
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months.		10. Allotment None.
11. Notes Bought shop at ground floor of Empress Mall, paid Rs.10 lacs as 'advance', Rs.70,000 as monthly rent. Is happy here.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Yes		13. Future Plans Same as before, only changed location.

No. 30	1. Name Mohd Anwar	2. Residence Baloch Colony (1956)
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Birds and small animals.		4. No. of Shops & Size 2 shops, added more area from around the shops.
5. Previous Location Birds Market.		6. Current Location None
7. Previous Income (Monthly) 3 – 3.5 lacs (tbc)		8. Current Income (Monthly) None
9. Time/ Income Lost 6 months (till present).		10. Allotment In New Shahbuddin Market. The KDA does not allow.

11. Notes Has approached Mayor, Commissioner, etc. unable to get through to anyone. Been on site for 60 years, could not imagine this would happen in his lifetime. Has always been ready to move, shift to new place. HH: 29.	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -	13. Future Plans -

23.04.2019

No. 31	1. Name Abdul Rauf	2. Residence tbc
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Inherited from grandfather Akhtar Mohammad. Dry Fruit.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop (No. 47)
5. Previous Location Facing Depot Lines Road		6. Current Location Sells from shop in bldg across previous location. Rents shop 6' x 8' for Rs. 60,000/month and paid an advance of Rs. 15 lacs building across from previous location
7. Previous Income (Monthly) In season Rs. 4 – 5 lacs Off season Rs. 30,000 – 40,000		8. Current Income (Monthly) Rs. 30,000 – 35,000
9. Time/ Income Lost 4 months		10. Allotment None
11. Supply Chain & Notes Buys stock from Jodia Bazaar. HH: 27-28. Don't like getting friendly with Police, they cross the line, no boundaries. "Don't want to fight with nor make friends with the government."		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Notices harassment from his shop regularly		13. Future Plans Keep this shop. Considers good location.

No. 32	1. Name Gulzeb Abbassi	2. Residence Lines Area
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Tenant. Previously paid Rs. 20,000 /6 months (Rs. 3,333/ month) to shop owner, who paid rent to KMC at Rs. 7000/6 months (Rs. 1166/month). Dry Fruit.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop (seems to be more)

5. <i>Previous Location</i> Near Tea Market.	6. <i>Current Location</i> Facing site: Rainbow Centre, ground floor. Pays Rs. 60,000 monthly rent + Rs. 8000 monthly cleaning fees.
7. <i>Previous Income (Monthly)</i> Average Rs. 3 – 3.5 lacs	8. <i>Current Income</i> <i>Didn't specify, claims fraction of past earnings.</i>
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 2 months	10. <i>Allotment</i> None
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Imports dry fruit direct from Quetta, also gets from Jodia Bazaar. Had paid rent up to December for shop on site. Had already purchased the current shop in lieu of evictions.	
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> -	13. <i>Future Plans</i> Will stay in Rainbow Centre, has already invested.

No. 33	1. <i>Name</i> Mohd Ali	2. <i>Residence</i> Pak Colony
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Owner. Originally grandfather's since 1975. Paid Rs. 6666/ 6 months to KMC. Started on the footpath. Kites, string.		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1
5. <i>Previous Location</i> Kites Market		6. <i>Current Location</i> Rainbow Centre, gully. Pays monthly rent of Rs. 10, 000. Friend's acquired shop.
7. <i>Previous Income (Monthly)</i> Rs. 20,000 – 25,000		8. <i>Current Income</i> Barely getting by, sometimes none at all.
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 4.5 months		10. <i>Allotment</i> Letter but no possession of shop in New Shahbuddin Market Section A.
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> ."Each kite seller has 2 – 3 go-to places for his stock, often located in Landhi, Korangi, Lalu Khet." Re: allotment M. Ali has heard that the vendors currently occupying his spot will vacate after making well off the Eid shopping season. They will move to their allotments in Empress Mall, as those shops might also be complete by then (they currently lack clear access or electrification). Considers his own allotment in New Shahabuddin temporary and imagines he will also eventually get a shop in Empress Mall.		

12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -	13. Future Plans Will wait it out for allotment.
---	---

No. 34	1. Name Hifazat Yar	2. Residence Liaquatabad
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Informally 1968 – 1975. Formally since 1976. Kites, dor.		4. No. of Shops & Size Yar Khan Kites. 3 shops (12 x 4)
5. Previous Location Kites Market		6. Current Location Rainbow Centre, g floor, gully, near front (Mansfield St) No rent, friend's shop.
7. Previous Income (Monthly) Rs. 50,000		8. Current Income Barely getting by, sometimes none at all.
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months		10. Allotment Letter but no possession of shop in New Shahbuddin Market Section A.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Kites are made in katchi abadis by lower grade employees (peons, clerks) as a supplementary means of income. Bastis in Landhi, Korangi, behind Jinnah School, Bizerta Lines, North Karachi, etc. The evictions have affected the whole network of makers and sellers. Extremely poor people denied of alternative means of income. Showed papers of allotment, past etc. Yar was the head of the Empress Market/Karachi chapter of the Sindh Anjuman-e-Patangsaaz since 2005. His union has ceased to exist since the evictions, scattered. The head office of the anjuman is in Hyderabad, it has a total of 10,000 smaller unions of which 2000 are registered. There were a total of 15 kite shops at Empress Market. He got lucky with his stock, seeing as a Ranger let him remove his material and made the bulldozer wait understanding that he was old and needed time. Otherwise there was only a notice of 3 hours. "They kept saying to us, its the Supreme Court's order, its the Chief Justice's order, how could we say anything against that? How could we refuse?" Yar had two helpers working with him.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -		13. Future Plans No clue, will wait for allotment. Plans to depend upon kids if all else fails.

No. 35	1. Name Aftab	2. Residence Qayoomabad
-----------	------------------	----------------------------

3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Tenant. Paid 6000/ month to owner. Pan, biscuits, cigarettes, candy.	4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 shops
5. <i>Previous Location</i> Pan Market	6. <i>Current Location</i> Rainbow Centre, basement east, rent 12,000/month.
7. <i>Previous Income (Monthly)</i> Unspecified	8. <i>Current Income</i> Makes less than a quarter of before.
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 3 months	10. <i>Allotment</i> Renters received no allotments.
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Stock from Jodia Bazaar and directly from companies. Had paid rent up to December "KMC is the defaulter, where is my rent?" Some allotments at Old Shahabuddin have been taken up. Keeps shop open till same timings (23:30). None of our clients come to this location, many don't know, lost old clientele. Anti-Pathan sentiment, considers Umar Farooq Market to be the reason behind the evictions. "Emp Mkt will become a park/mall."	
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> -	13. <i>Future Plans</i> Unsure.

No. 36	1. <i>Name</i> Fahad	2. <i>Residence</i> Liaquatabad
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Owner, past 70 years. Inherited shop from grandfather. Paid 5000/ 6 months to KMC. Pan, cigarettes, candy.		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 shop, No. 6, Nawab Pan Shop.
5. <i>Previous Location</i> Pan Market		6. <i>Current Location</i> Rainbow Centre, basement east
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Unspecified		8. <i>Current Income</i> Unspecified
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 3 months		10. <i>Allotment</i> -
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Buys material from Choona Market. "If we had just one month's notice so we could keep our customers informed of our move, find a place when rents had not gone so high, things wouldn't be so bad. Now we're in a basement where the ladies, our main clientele, are too scared to come, especially since theres <i>badmaash</i> Pathans sitting on the ground floor." Had 3 helpers in the shop, apart from self and brother.		

12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -	13. Future Plans Unsure.
---	-----------------------------

No. 37	1. Name Mohd Sami	2. Residence Liaquatabad
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Inherited from father, had shop for 55 years. Initial rent was Rs. 150/month. Most recently paid little over Rs. 1000/month. Pan, tobacco, saunf, rel.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop: Garden no. 3, Shop no. 4
5. Previous Location Pan Market		6. Current Location Rainbow Centre, basement east
7. Previous Income (Daily) Rs. 20,000 – 25,000		8. Current Income (Daily) Rs. 1500 - 2000
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months		10. Allotment Letter yes, possession no. New Shahabuddin.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Jodia Bazaar and Choonaa Market. Ladies, our main clients don't like to come to this location. We could not find/ afford anywhere else and had wasted too much time. "Authorities said that we were going to get possession of the alternative shops within 10 days, it's been six months since." Re: allotment, stated the same as Mohd Ali (#16)		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -		13. Future Plans Unsure.

No. 38	1. Name Amanullah & Abdul Zahir	2. Residence Near Korangi Stop, Saddar
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Bought shop 3 years ago for Rs. 35 lacs. Spent Rs. 1 lac on shop. Paid Rs. 12,000/ 6 months. Tea.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop
5. Previous Location Corner of Pan Mandi		6. Current Location Al-Malik Centre, g floor, in the gully
7. Previous Income (Daily) Rs. 40,000 – 50,000		8. Current Income (Daily) Rs. 2000 - 3000
9. Time/ Income Lost 4 months		10. Allotment Letter yes, possession no. New Shahabuddin.

11. Supply Chain & Notes Jodia Bazaar, purchases in sacks. Managed to save some custom cabinetry and sacks of stock, rest (investment + <i>khulla</i> stock) lost. One helper at the shop, still working with them. "I know some people who were doing so well and are now begging on the street."	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -	13. Future Plans Retain current shop for now.

No. 39	1. Name Shakeel Ahmed	2. Residence Landhi
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner since 1956, 3 generations. Grandfather used to do the same work in Lucknow pre-partition: shop name Student Bookbinding. Father migrated to Pakistan at age 10. Bookbinding, rel. (lamination, stationery)		4. No. of Shops & Size Abdul Ghaffar Book Binding Shop. 2 shops #97 & #99
5. Previous Location Corner of Pan Mandi. "Prior to the creation of the current Urdu Bazaar, our market was the original Urdu Bazaar: Mini Urdu Bazaar."		6. Current Location In brother's shop at g floor, Al-Malik Centre, near end of gully. Previously owned, pays rent at Rs. 10,000/ month. Got the shop during the 1994 eviction scare when Zardari and Lari were going to build a plaza on the EM site. That was halted following the death of Murtaza Bhutto.
7. Previous Income (Daily) Rs. 1000 – 1500 (Rs. 30,000 – 35,000/month)		8. Current Income (Daily) Barely Rs. 150 – 200. Highly irregular.
9. Time/ Income Lost Large cutting machine, made in Lahore by company Jaffrey (1960), was too heavy to remove in the 2 hours pre-eviction. Got badly damaged: working condition sale worth Rs. 1 – 1.25 lac, sold post-eviction damage for Rs. 20,000. 2 smaller perforating machines lost in eviction. Had paid rent up to December 2018. Considers KMC defaulter.		10. Allotment Letter yes, possession no. New Shahabuddin. Showed papers for allotment, in son's and nephew's names.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Buys paper type material from Paper Market at Lighthouse. Owned 4 machines, bore a lot of damage to them in the evictions (Box 9). This is the bookbinder's/ school's season:		

25/03 till 30/04. Notes that the loss of this market is a big loss in revenue for KMC as well, also that Karachi has slowly lost all of its buses. Says he has heard many things re, future plans for EM: Arts Council, Museum, Park. <i>Considers craziness.</i> "Aisi tabdeeli aayi keh hum hee tabdeel ho gaye."	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) -	13. Future Plans Asks for help, does not see hope for his decades old business in the current situation, even as it is an actual need for schoolchildren in the area and beyond.

No. 40	1. Name Ramzan	2. Residence Agra Taj
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Hawker on same site for the past 15 years. Small stock (band-aids, small torches, q-tips)		4. No. of Shops & Size Mobile hawker, small stock
5. Previous Location Regal Stop, Preedy Street		6. Current Location Regal Stop, Preedy Street
7. Previous Income (Daily) Easily Rs. 1000 – saved Rs. 300 - 400		8. Current Income (Daily) Barely Rs. 500 – saves Rs. 150 - 200
9. Time/ Income Lost Income lost due to evictions and subsequent lack of commuters/shoppers.		10. Allotment -
11. Supply Chain & Notes Stocks material on credit, pays at the end of the day. Says the rush of buyers is gone since evictions. Personal earnings have fallen below half. The weekly/ Sunday book bazaar at Regal Stop does not take place since evictions.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Regular		13. Future Plans Will stay on site, says he knows no other job or place like here.

No. 41	1. Name Sayyed Saifuddin	2. Residence Saddar / Shop: Taj Ice Depot, behind Preedy Street
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner. Father started shop here 45 years ago. KMC tenant 6 monthly rent deed. Ice.		4. No. of Shops & Size 2 (of the 3 in total ice) shops in EM.

<p>5. <i>Previous Location</i> Ice Depot (to be marked)</p>	<p>6. <i>Current Location</i> In their third, previously owned shop, Taj Ice Depot, located in the street (leading to/from EM) behind Preedy Street (adjacent to Jahangir Park).</p>
<p>7. <i>Previous Income</i> Current + Rs. 25,000/month</p>	<p>8. <i>Current Income</i> Rs 25,000/ month has been reduced from income.</p>
<p>9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> Income drastically lowered as the consistent clients were the butchers that sat inside EM. They don't supply them anymore.</p>	<p>10. <i>Allotment</i> None.</p>
<p>11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Brings ice from Korangi.</p>	
<p>12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Regular</p>	<p>13. <i>Future Plans</i> Will stay on site, says he knows no other job or place like here.</p>

No. 42	<p>1. <i>Name</i> Abdul Rahman</p>	<p>2. <i>Residence</i> Lyari</p>
<p>3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Been selling oil from portable, oiling <i>chakki</i> for 35 years.</p>		<p>4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 portable oil <i>chakki</i></p>
<p>5. <i>Previous Location</i> Street behind Preedy Street (adjacent to Jahangir Park)</p>		<p>6. <i>Current Location</i> Street behind Preedy Street (adjacent to Jahangir Park)</p>
<p>7. <i>Previous Income</i> -</p>		<p>8. <i>Current Income</i> Claims no difference in income.</p>
<p>9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> Returned after 1 month.</p>		<p>10. <i>Allotment</i> -</p>
<p>11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Buys materials for making and selling oils from Cheel Chowk, Saddar and Jodia Bazar.</p>		
<p>12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Unaffected, moves away and returns</p>		<p>13. <i>Future Plans</i> Will stay on site, says he knows no other job or place like here.</p>

No. 43	1. Name Sheikh Mohd. Anees	2. Residence -
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner, inherited from father. Been sitting in the street, same trade, for 31 years. Father was here for 22 years prior. <i>Panchsar</i> shop since 1966. Has papers.		4. No. of Shops & Size Used to have one shop 6'x6', after breakage of shops moved across street onto rehri, as sans walls, his material did not make sense btw chappal shops.
5. Previous Location Street behind Preedy Street (adjacent to Jahangir Park)		6. Current Location Street behind Preedy Street (adjacent to Jahangir Park)
7. Previous Income Comfortable living.		8. Current Income Says, cannot overstate the magnitude of loss. Does not quantify,
9. Time/ Income Lost Returned after 2 months		10. Allotment None.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Buys material (tonics, medicine, elixirs) from Jodia Bazaar. <i>Dukaan ki aik izzat hoti hai.</i>		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Not for a few weeks.		13. Future Plans Will stay on site, says he knows no other place to go to.

No. 44	1. Name Ghulam Siddiq	2. Residence -
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Shoes and Sandals retailer, the shop was in his family since 1959. His grandfather rented it from the KMC.		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop 4x4
5. Previous Location Inside the empress market		6. Current Location Bohri Bazaar.
7. Previous Income Rs. 40,000		8. Current Income (Daily) Rs. 15,000

<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i></p> <p>Could not find a shop for 4 months, stock would go bad in storage so I sold 40 lakhs worth of stock that I had taken on credit for 10 lakhs. The new shops rent is 40,000 when it was 20,000 previously.</p>	<p><i>10. Allotment</i></p> <p>None. We don't want to go anywhere else. We want our shops at the empress market back.</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i></p> <p>Stock was bought from Leah market and Lighthouse on credit. 30,000 Rs. were spent monthly on employee salaries. Now, only my brother and I work here. Used to receive customers till 1am at the empress market, no longer the case at bohri bazaar.</p> <p>The KMC got money from a foreign government to get rid of the encroachments. A foreign person came to survey the area on 12/11/18 and told the government to get rid of the encroachments. No difference in clientele and sales after the restoration of Jahangir Park.</p> <p>Hawkers have now increased since anyone can now set a cart up for 1000 Rs. a week. If all the hawkers are stopped from working the KMC and police will be forced to shut down.</p> <p>There has been an 80% decrease in the public frequenting Saddar because of the lack of shops now.</p> <p>We have heard rumors of the empress market being turned into a heritage site which Pakistanis will not be able to enter.</p> <p>The hawkers have moved to: opp. Jahangir park, burhan center, opp. Fire brigade, opp. Parking plaza.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>None.</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>Just waiting for the Ramzan season to end after which will move back to Bajaur agency.</p>

No. 45	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Akhtar</p>	<p><i>2. Residence</i></p> <p>Al Malik Center</p>
-----------	-------------------------------------	---

3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner of one Chai hotel + 1 rehri		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 4x4 shop and 1 cart
5. Previous Location Umar Farooq Cloth Market		6. Current Location opp. jahangir park
7. Previous Income Rs. 80,000		8. Current Income (Daily) Rs. 15,000
9. Time/ Income Lost 2 months lost.		10. Allotment None.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Fruits are bought from sabzi mandi.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) 100 rs a day for the cart to the police.		13. Future Plans None. Want the old setup back.
No. 46	1. Name Abdul Qayum	2. Residence Ibran center
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Family owned fruit shops for the last 40 years		4. No. of Shops & Size 2 shops 4x4 and 1 cart
5. Previous Location Adjacent empress market, opp. rainbow center		6. Current Location opp. jahangir park, price road
7. Previous Income upto Rs. 200,000 monthly		8. Current Income (monthly) Rs. 25,000-30,000

<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i> 2 months lost</p>	<p><i>10. Allotment</i> no allotment</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i> Fruits are bought from sabzi mandi. One current cart selling kharbuz.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Used to pay 10,000 Rs. per shop per month previously, currently 100 Rs. per day for cart</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i> None. Want the same setup back.</p>

No. 47	<p><i>1. Name</i> Muhammad Rabbani</p>	<p><i>2. Residence</i> Malik center</p>
<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> owned 1 shop and 1 was on rent, sold fruits.</p>		<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i> 2 4x4 shops.</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i> adjacent empress market, opp. rainbow center</p>		<p><i>6. Current Location</i> opp. jahangir park 'kachra gali'</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i> Rs. 120,000 monthly</p>		<p><i>8. Current Income (monthly)</i> upto Rs. 15,000</p>
<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i> 2 months lost.</p>		<p><i>10. Allotment</i> None.</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i> Fruits were bought from the sabzi mandi.</p>		
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Used to pay Rs. 5000 to the KMC per shop per month</p>		<p><i>13. Future Plans</i> None. Willing to accept a place in a good market.</p>

No. 48	1. Name Muhammad Qasim	2. Residence Ibran Center
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Owner, Chai hotel, chappal shop, tailor shop, and a date store		4. No. of Shops & Size 4, 4x4 shops.
5. Previous Location Chai hotel was at the umar farooq cloth market. Chappal, tailor, and date shops were inside the empress market.		6. Current Location Opp. jahangir park 'kachra gali'
7. Previous Income Rs. 150,000		8. Current Income (Daily) Rs. 15,000
9. Time/ Income Lost 2 months lost. Most income lost as he is now a fruit vendor whereas previously he had a variety of businesses.		10. Allotment None.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Kharboozas are bought from the sabzi mandi. 'Everyone I know went back to Quetta'.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) currently Rs. 300 per cart per day (he owns 1), Rs. 6000 per month per shop previously to the KMC.		13. Future Plans none.

No. 49	1. Name Naseebullah	2. Residence Al Burhan Center
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Rented a hotel at umar farooq cloth market which his father had bought from the KMC 42 years ago.		4. No. of Shops & Size 14, 4x4 shops converted into a hotel. Rs. 300,000 6 month rent to KMC.

<p>5. <i>Previous Location</i> Umar farooq cloth market</p>	<p>6. <i>Current Location</i> Rainbow Market</p>
<p>7. <i>Previous Income</i> upto Rs. 200,000 monthly</p>	<p>8. <i>Current Income (monthly)</i> unemployed</p>
<p>9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i> 6 months</p>	<p>10. <i>Allotment</i> none 'even though parking plaza is empty'.</p>
<p>11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Employed 25 people. All items for the hotel were bought from the surrounding markets in Saddar on cash. Iqbal Kakar was the union president, we protested together, but then the union fell apart. Studied at St. Pauls. No new markets have been made for them. The Plaza under construction behind the empress market was promised to everyone by Mustafa Kamal but its construction has stopped. Crime has increased in the environs of the empress market 'kyunke ab sannata chaa gaya hai'. More than 50% of the people who used to come to Saddar do not come anymore.</p>	
<p>12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> None.</p>	<p>13. <i>Future Plans</i> None.</p>

No. 50	<p>1. <i>Name</i> Rafiullah</p>	<p>2. <i>Residence</i> Rainbow Center</p>
<p>3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Rented shops to sell crockery inside the empress market. Has had the shop since 1965, still has the documents.</p>		<p>4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 14, 4x4 shops.</p>
<p>5. <i>Previous Location</i> Inside empress market</p>		<p>6. <i>Current Location</i> Rainbow center</p>

<p><i>7. Previous Income</i> Rs. 50,000 monthly</p>		<p><i>8. Current Income (monthly)</i> Nothing, I took a loan to pay for the advance on the new shop. Rs. 15,000 monthly.</p>
<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i> 2 months lost</p>		<p><i>10. Allotment</i> none</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i> 12 people were employed in the shops. Nobody was renting the current shop I'm in even at Rs. 40,000 per month. Right now I pay Rs. 110,000 per month. The stock is ordered on credit from Gujranwala, Punjab. The las are beneficial to shops as they attract a crowd which then walks into other shops.</p> <p>'Yesterday an old lady walked into our store and cried because it was taking her much longer to get all her shopping done now'.</p> <p>We had a meeting with waseem akhtar at the chamber of commerce where waseem akhtar said to our faces that he was very proud of himself for cleaning the area up since he was able to get rid of all the pathans. Current banners put up at the entrance of the empress market invite all shopkeepers to participate in their jalsas so that they can have their rights given to them. MQM party workers constantly tell all the shop owners to join the party so that they can get their shops back.</p> <p>Over 50% decrease in public frequenting saddar.</p> <p>Apartment rents and prices have also increased by up to four times.</p> <p>The hawkers are never in one place anymore, the police keeps harassing them and so they keep moving around.</p>		
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> Previously paid Rs. 50,000 monthly for all shops to KMC as rent.</p>		<p><i>13. Future Plans</i> Want to be relocated to either the parking plaza or the plaza being constructed behind the empress market.</p>

<p>No. 51</p>	<p><i>1. Name</i> Muhammad Iqbal</p>	<p><i>2. Residence</i> Lines Area</p>
-------------------	--	---

<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Owned crockery shops.</p>	<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i> 16 4x4 shops</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i> Inside empress market</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i> none</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i> Rs. 15,000 - Rs. 20,000</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i> nothing</p>
<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i> 6 months lost</p>	<p><i>10. Allotment</i> none.</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i> Dar, the land director, and Nadeem, KMC officer told the shopkeepers to pay Rs. 80,000 each and arrange for a 'kunda' and they would get legal documents and be allowed to open their shops again on the empress market grounds on the condition that they would share 50% of their profit with Dar and Nadeem.</p> <p>The stock is ordered on credit from Gujranwala, Punjab.</p> <p>MQM workers keep asking us to join them by promising them their shops back.</p> <p>Waseem Akhtar's brother has the contract for the park thats being made on the empress market grounds, he sends police mobiles here and extracts money from hawkers, I tried to report him but I was told by the police that the mayor's brother is running this operation.</p> <p>KMC officers, the police, and the city wardens are currently charging hawkers a daily fees for their carts.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> none previously, no shop currently</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i> None. Want the old setup back.</p>

No. 52	1. Name Munir Ahmed	2. Residence Cafe Student
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Vegetable shop		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop
5. Previous Location In front of Umar Farooq Cloth Market, 2 shops		6. Current Location Shahabuddin Market Block C, 1 shop
7. Previous Income Rs. 250,000 per month		8. Current Income (monthly) Right now we are operating at a loss.
9. Time/ Income Lost 3 months.		10. Allotment None. Rented new shop at Shahabuddin Market Block C back side, but then moved to the front because business was slow.
11. Supply Chain & Notes Lost all my old customers. Stock is bought from Sohrab Goth mandi. The hawkers attracted people, now that they've gone, we are also suffering. When we were at the empress market, this shop we are currently renting for Rs. 60,000 a month was Rs. 16,000 a month.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) None.		13. Future Plans To build the business at the new shop.

No. 53	1. Name Bashir Ahmed	2. Residence Punjab Colony
-----------	-------------------------	-------------------------------

3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Rents a flower shop on preedy street, Rs. 6000 rent for 6 months.		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 shop
5. <i>Previous Location</i> -		6. <i>Current Location</i> Preedy Street
7. <i>Previous Income</i>		8. <i>Current Income (monthly)</i>
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i>		10. <i>Allotment</i>
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Hawkers are bad for shops because they don't leave space for people to walk and park their cars. Hawkers are good for shops only if they leave some space open for pedestrians and vehicles. This used to be the flower section under the British. We don't have a 'parchi' - we have a computerized receipt from the bank which proves that we are legal tenants of the KMC. They demolished the shops around the empress market because that's what the world bank wants.		
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> None.		13. <i>Future Plans</i> To stay at his current shop. But there is an uncertainty in the air as to what might happen to other shopkeepers.

No. 54	1. <i>Name</i> Rizwan Bashir	2. <i>Residence</i> Nazimabad
-----------	---------------------------------	----------------------------------

3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Worker, jeans shop	4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop
5. Previous Location -	6. Current Location Raja Ghazanfar/Bohra Bazaar
7. Previous Income Rs. 12,000	8. Current Income (monthly) Rs. 6,000.
9. Time/ Income Lost	10. Allotment
11. Supply Chain & Notes Lighthouse We now have to wait for customers, it has been 3 hours and I have not had a customer yet Hawkers are bad for us because they block the street and don't pay rent or taxes	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) None.	13. Future Plans

No. 55	1. Name Omar	2. Residence Sohrab Goth
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Rent, 35,000		4. No. of Shops & Size 1 shop

5. <i>Previous Location</i> -	6. <i>Current Location</i> Raja Ghazanfar/Bohra Bazaar
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Rs. 8000 profit from daily sales	8. <i>Current Income (monthly)</i> Rs. 4,000 profit from daily sales
9. <i>Time/ Income Lost</i>	10. <i>Allotment</i>
11. <i>Supply Chain & Notes</i> Bolton Market Hawkers are good, 'raunak barhti hai' 'pathaanon ko dukaanein nahi detay ya bohot mehengi detay hain'	
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> None.	13. <i>Future Plans</i>

No. 56	1. <i>Name</i> Faizan	2. <i>Residence</i> Liaquatabad
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Rent 65,000, electronics		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 shop
5. <i>Previous Location</i> -	6. <i>Current Location</i> Raja Ghazanfar/Bohra Bazaar	
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Rs. 6000 profit from daily sales	8. <i>Current Income (monthly)</i> Rs. 2,000 profit from daily sales	

<i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i>	<i>10. Allotment</i>
<i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i> Bolton Market, Abdullah Haroon road Hawkers are good for us because they attract people but they need to be properly placed so that they do not block anyone's way/parking space	
<i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> None.	<i>13. Future Plans</i>

19.04.19

No. 57	<i>1. Name</i> Mohd. Irfan	<i>2. Residence and Commute</i> Lines Area / -
<i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Footpath peddler. Bananas/ other fruit.		<i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i> -
<i>5. Previous Location</i> On the roadside edge of Empress Market, outside the entrance to Pan Market		<i>6. Current Location</i> Inside the courtyard
<i>7. Previous Income</i> Rs. 1500 - 1600 per day		<i>8. Current Income</i> Rs. 400 - 500 per day
<i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i> Could move immediately.		<i>10. Allotment</i> No shop – no allotment.
<i>11. Notes</i> Has been on site for the past 55 years. "Most hawkers are unwilling to share too much personal info, Irfan is an EM stalwart, very comfortable and open in our exchange at the EM courtyard.		

12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)	13. Future Plans
Yes	To continue here.

No. 58	1. Name Indra	2. Residence & Commute Lighthouse, Garikhata / Ricksha, with stock.
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Hawker. Dry Fruit.		4. No. of Shops & Size Roadside
5. Previous Location Main gate, Emp Mkt. Along Sharah-e-Liaquat		6. Current Location Same as before
7. Previous Income Rs. 5000 – 6000 per day		8. Current Income Rs. 1500 – 2000 per day
9. Time/ Income Lost 1 month		10. Allotment None
11. Supply Chain & Notes Has been on site for 17 years, all the women in her family have been in the same line of work. After evictions, sat in front of the buildings across EM and discreetly sold dry fruit from a few small bags. There are about 10 – 15 women from her community in the same line of work.		
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others) Been a month that harassment decreased		13. Future Plans Wants to stay here.

23.04.19

1 May 2019

No. 59	1. Name & Location	2. Residence & Commute
-----------	--------------------	------------------------

	Musa Khan Preedy Street (South side)	Behind Khyber Hotel (Preedy St) / Walking
3. <i>Typology & Time spent on site</i> Watches sell/ repair. Has spent 17 years here, brother was here before, between 1995 – 2002.	4. <i>Material supply/ Stock?</i> Malik Watch House/ Usmania Market (both very close)	
5. <i>Storage at night</i> Leaves his stall tied up and covered in an adjacent (Ashraf Bhaie) street. Cleans his area himself at the end of the day.	6. <i>Cleanliness</i> Previously in a godown, cannot afford anymore (Rs. 1200 – 1500/ month).	
7. <i>Harassment by authorities</i> Everyday, especially in the mornings. Sets up at 2 – 3 pm.	8. <i>Income (per day)</i> Rs. 500 – 600. Monthly house rent Rs. 6000.	
9. <i>Impact of Evictions</i> Income has halved.	10. <i>Future of space?</i> Park at Empress.	
11. <i>Notes</i> Musa was in agriculture before, said it was too expensive to continue: working on <i>thaika</i> , cost of fertiliser, irregular harvest, etc. Came to Karachi/ Empress as brother was already on site. About 15 - 16 years ago, the KMC had all hawkers fill a form and attach NIC copy, for registration and relocation: nothing came of it. “Mustafa Kamal keh dor mein itni bhaag dor nahin thi, phir bhi sukoon tha.”		

No. 60	1. <i>Name & Location</i> Shahnawaz Ali Preedy Street (South side)	2. <i>Residence & Commute</i> Behind the LRBT Eye Hospital in Korangi / Bus.
-----------	--	---

<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Wallets.</p> <p>30 years, roughly the same location.</p>	<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Bolton Market. Unsold stock from local factories.</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Leaves his table and wares in a friend's shop close by.</p>	<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Previously in a godown, cannot afford anymore (Rs. 1200 – 1500/ month).</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Yes, by the KMC, traffic and regular police.</p>	<p><i>8. Income (per day)</i></p> <p>Rs. 400 – 500.</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has halved.</p>	<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Park at Empress.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Used to deal in watch repair before. There are a total of 20 wallet sellers on Shahrah-e-Liaquat btw Dr. Daudpota Rd and Zaibunnisa Street.</p> <p>"This market never closes except for on certain religious holidays (10 days of Muharram, 2 days of Eid, etc.)"</p>	

No. 61	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Zahid Khan</p> <p>East corner of RGA & Preedy St.</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>North Nazimabad / Bike</p>
	<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Unboxed perfumes.</p> <p>Been hawking on Preedy St. for 25 years.</p>	<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Bolton Market. Containers that arrive at the port.</p>
	<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>In godown close by. Pays rent Rs. 50/day.</p>	<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Helper cleans the area around stalls over the</p>

	course of the day.
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Everyday, especially in the mornings. Sets up at 2 – 3 pm.</p>	<p><i>8. Income (per month)</i></p> <p>Rs. 15,000 – 16,000</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has halved.</p>	<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Park at Empress.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Claims that the area is still full of <i>khush-haali</i>, business is going strong and people still come to the area after the evictions. This is probably because Khan hawks a block from EM, closer to the still busy Regal Bus Stop, and many more, denser markets as they continue south towards the 'Lighthouse'.</p>	

No. 62	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Anees.</p> <p>Outside bakery on Preedy St (south)</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Burns Road / -</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Sindhi hats, used to sell vests, socks, etc (mens hosiery). Been on site since 1956 – for 60 years. See Notes.</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Abdullah Market and from near Lighthouse.</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>In a godown near home @ 50/day</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>No trash, is mobile with portable cane basket.</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Regular</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per month)</i></p> <p>Gets by.</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has halved since evictions.</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p><i>Bagheecha</i> /garden</p>

11. Notes

Born in Delhi, moved to Karachi, near Burns Road, at the age of 3 – 4 years old.

Believes that shopkeepers benefit from the presence of hawkers, without the latter the street is silent/dead; people in cars don't stop to buy what they came to thinking the market is closed.

No. 63	1. Name & Location Wali Khan. Rehri and boards at the corner of Somerset St/RGA Road and Preedy St/ Sharah-e-Liaquat.	2. Residence & Commute Manzoor Colony / -
3. Typology & Time spent on site Clothes and Hosiery/ Socks, Vests, Underwear etc 25 – 30 years.		4. Material supply/ Stock? Near Lighthouse.
5. Storage at night Locks up on a street in Bohri Bazar (adjacent market). Communally pays a guard Rs. 50/day.		6. Cleanliness No trash, is mobile with portable cane basket.
7. Harassment by authorities Regular		8. Income (per day) Rs. 800 – 1200
9. Impact of Evictions Income has halved since evictions.		10. Future of space? Park.
11. Notes Has 8 household members, children grown up now. Has to supplement income at home. Plans to also set up at Night Bazaar (during Ramzan) on RGA Road.		

Also drives Qingqi/ Ricksha to supplement income. Less often now.

No. 64	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Sikander</p> <p>Kiosk and tables in front of Eduljee Dinshaw Charitable Dispensary.</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>In the Chappal (selling) street adjacent to Jahangir Park. This street is around the corner from his location / -</p>
	<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Newspaper and variety of books.</p> <p>3 years. Sold fruit on rehri in the area before this but faced with successive financial loss decided to give up the business.</p>	<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Urdu Bazar and other smaller markets in the area.</p>
	<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Locks the kiosk up on main Preedy Street.</p>	<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Cleans area at the start of the day -</p>
	<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Regular</p>	<p><i>8. Income (per month)</i></p> <p>After rent (Rs. 4000), is left with Rs. 2000 – 3000. Approximately Rs. 6000 – 7000.</p>
	<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Shoppers in the area have decreased.</p>	<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Park. Has seen a poster with a map of a park inside Empress Market.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Lost both hands to a fodder cutting machine 28 years ago, blames his bachelorhood on this. Has been unable to find a place to sleep since he doesn't have 'family' with him. Abandoned by family as well, he has been homeless for 28 years.</p>		

No. 65	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Syed Arif Hussain</p> <p>Kiosk and tables at the North corner of Zaibunnisa and Preedy Streets.</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>Near Numaish / On bike.</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Newspaper and digests.</p> <p>Has been here 20 years, this is a supplementary job and a place to meet friends and people. Has own office on front facade of building, also has kiosk on corner of same building.</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Frere Road, Akhbar/Newspaper Market</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Locks the kiosk up on main Preedy Street.</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Cleans area at the start of the day -</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>"It's their job." (Sarcastically)</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per month)</i></p> <p>After rent (Rs. 4000), is left with Rs. 2000 – 3000. Approximately Rs. 6000 – 7000.</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Shoppers in the area have decreased.</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Park. Has seen a poster with a map of a park inside Empress Market.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Has spent a lot of time working with leather goods (Servis shoes franchise) from his office in the bldg on location.</p> <p>The Newspaper Union fell apart following the demise of the last brave leader (Pehlwaan). Claims that no one has the guts and resolution to be in that position anymore.</p>		

<p>No. 66</p>	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Mohd Umer s/o Mehboob Ali Khan</p> <p>Stool and empty paint bucket to support two surfaces, on the footpath by the fence of Eduljee Dinshaw Charitable Dispensary/ Parsi heritage.</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>Musarrat Colony since children bought a house, used to live in Baldia Town before. Has spent much of his life living in Baldia and working in Saddar / -</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Posters of local tourist areas and fruit displays, frankinsense, snacks /religious favours (small packets of channa/sugarballs)</p> <p>Used to sell gajak (snack). Been on site since 1957/58.</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Near Baloch Park on M.A.Jinnah Road / in Saddar.</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Locks up in one of the flower shops behind. his spot.</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>KMC</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>No one harasses him.</p>		<p><i>8. Income</i></p> <p>A couple of hundred per day.</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>-</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Park. Has seen a poster with a map of a park inside Empress Market.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>There was a Hawkers' Union around the time of Ayub Khan.</p> <p>Umer is old and frail, comes here seemingly out of habit, especially since his set up is very low-key (and quite sparsely stocked) and he has spent his entire life – from childhood till current old age – on site, and within its close environs.</p>		

No. 67	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Emmanuel D’Souza</p> <p>A sheet on the footpath, a couple of stools in front of Servis Shoe Store on Dr. Daudpota Road.</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>New Maryam Square near Khi Cantt Station / -</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Wallets.</p> <p>12 years on site. Used to be a wireman, eyesight weakened and decided to start working for self. Changed line to hawking.</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Bolton Market</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Godown nearby @ Rs. 600/month.</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Cleans area at the start of the day -</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Police in plain clothes collect Rs. 50 – 100 /day. Has a table for wares, doesn’t bring it out for fear of it being confiscated (commonplace) by the authorities. Need Rs. 5000 to reclaim.</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per day)</i></p> <p>Rs. 800 - 1000</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has less than halved.</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>The KMC and Police only allow us to set up and sell after 3 pm.</p> <p>Has cordial relations with the shop owner, outside of where he sets up shop. Used to know the previous owner as well. They do not harass him.</p>		

No. 68	1. Name & Location Ataullah In and around Dr. Daudpota Road	2. Residence & Commute. Sohrab Goth, Bus: travels with his showcase packed with rings of semi-precious stones.
3. Typology & Time spent on site Rings with semi-precious stones, can extend to pendants or loose stones. 12- 13 years		4. Material supply/ Stock? Bolton Market and Joona Bazaar.
5. Storage at night Takes showcase/box home everyday.		6. Cleanliness Mobile
7. Harassment by authorities Yes, by the KMC, traffic and regular police.		8. Income (per day) Rs. 700 - 800.
9. Impact of Evictions Income has halved, used to be Rs. 1500-1600 per day.		10. Future of space? -
11. Notes		
No. 69	1. Name & Location Mohammad Ashraf, Dr. Daudpota Rd	2. Residence & Commute Landhi/ Bus
3. Typology & Time spent on site Weighing Machine and small, light plastic ware, on this day: small spiographs		4. Material supply/ Stock? Weighing machine is Ashraf's own
5. Storage at night Takes machine home on the bus		6. Cleanliness Keeps his area clean
7. Harassment by authorities Not harassed		8. Income (per day) Claims it is very erratic, and very little but he

	gets by.
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has halved.</p>	<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Used to work at a thread factory before, seems he had to retire but still needs the income.</p>	

03.05.19

No. 70	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Sonam</p> <p>Main gate, Emp Mkt. Along Sharah-e-Liaquat</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Lighthouse, Lea Market</p> <p>Ricksha, with stock</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Dry Fruit</p> <p>Since she was a baby</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Jodia Bazaar</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Takes stock home in ricksha</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Yes, by the KMC, traffic and regular police. Pays no bhatta.</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per day)</i></p> <p>Rs. 400 – 1500</p>

<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has become erratic and decreased. In the winter (dry fruit season) it used to be Rs. 10,000 – 12,000 a day. In the summers, Rs. 1200 – 1300 per day.</p>	<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Has heard there will be a park.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>Sonam is part of the Gujrati Hindu community of dry fruit selling women, their location has remained consistent for decades. She has been coming to EM with her mother, who had the same job, since she was a baby. She is a third generation dry fruit seller.</p>	

No. 71	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Gulab Khan</p> <p>Watch stall Dr. Daudpota Road</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Saddar, near Preedy St /-</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Watch sale and repair</p> <p>30 years</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Bolton Market</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>Used to pay Rs. 5000/month rent for godown, cannot afford it anymore and looking for an alternative.</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Yes, regular.</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per day)</i></p> <p>Rs. 300 - 400.</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Income has quartered</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p>		

"The evictions were illegal, the shops here were legal."

No. 72	1. Name & Location Tanveer (daily wage salesboy) Outside Ghadiali Bldg, Sh-e-Liaquat	2. Residence & Commute. Shireen Jinnah Colony/ Bus
3. Typology & Time spent on site Wallets 1 year (Tanveer is less than 15 years old)		4. Material supply/ Stock? Seth buys stock from Bolton Market
5. Storage at night In building right behind stall		6. Cleanliness Cleans own area
7. Harassment by authorities Yes, by the KMC, traffic and regular police.		8. Income (per day) Rs. 500 (daily wages)
9. Impact of Evictions Pre-evictions sold stock worth Rs. 6000 -7000/ day, now makes Rs. 2000/ day.		10. Future of space? -
11. Notes A resident of the building where Tanveer stores his table and stock came out to state that the evictions caused a lot of destruction besides the demolition of shops at Empress Market. The KMC with the support of the Police and Rangers broke shop shutters and signage. This has resulted in many shopkeepers previously on this strip having closed shop, walled up the front and leaving the area, there was a lot of damage to the structure and the evictions have impacted the life of the area, where at night the place is now silent while before the shops were open till 2300.		

22.05.19

No. 73	<p><i>1. Name & Location</i></p> <p>Mohammed Mehboob. Fruit vendors across Parking Plaza</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>Lines Area/ On foot.</p>
<p><i>3. Typology & Time spent on site</i></p> <p>Fruit. 50 years.</p>		<p><i>4. Material supply/ Stock?</i></p> <p>Buy at New Sabzi Mandi. Collectively deliver on truck.</p>
<p><i>5. Storage at night</i></p> <p>On site. Guard takes Rs. 50 per rehri</p>		<p><i>6. Cleanliness</i></p> <p>Sweeper takes Rs.50 per rehri.</p>
<p><i>7. Harassment by authorities</i></p> <p>Pay a total of Rs. 150/rehri in bhatta (incl KMC/KDA, traffice police, police). KDA authorities came and threatened with eviction at the end of the month.</p>		<p><i>8. Income (per day)</i></p> <p>Rs.300 – Rs.600</p>
<p><i>9. Impact of Evictions</i></p> <p>Used to earn a lot more selling on the road along EM, removed to this site, now being removed from here as well. No alternative provided.</p>		<p><i>10. Future of space?</i></p> <p>Unclear.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes</i></p> <p>There are a little over 100 rehri selling fruit on the empty plot across the LARP Parking Plaza. They moved here after the evictions – about 6 months ago.</p>		

No. 74	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Hameedullah</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Ibran Center/ -</p>
-----------	--	--

<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Seasonal fruits hawker for 15 years.</p>	<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 rehri</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>Adjacent to empress market, opp. rainbow center</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>opp. Jahangir park, price road'</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>upto Rs. 60,000</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i></p> <p>Rs. 15,000</p>
<p><i>9. Time/ Income Lost</i></p> <p>2 months lost.</p>	<p><i>10. Allotment</i></p> <p>No allotment.</p>
<p><i>11. Supply Chain & Notes</i></p> <p>The fruits were bought from sabzi mandi on cash. Where we are currently used to be called 'kachra gali'. We quettawalas got it cleaned up and moved here. The police does not let us setup shop on the street anymore, but the problem is that nobody notices us if we are in the gali. There has been an 80% decrease in the amount of people who used to come to the empress market to purchase items.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>100 rs a day previously and currently to the KMC. One KMC worker collects the money from all the fruit hawkers and gives it to the KMC.</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>None. Want old setup back.</p>

No. 75	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Talib</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>Manipur /-</p>
<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Fruit Hawker</p>		<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 cart</p>

<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>On the road: Shahrah-e-Liaquat/New M.A. Jinnah</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>Empty Plot opp. Parking Plaza</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 1600 daily</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i></p> <p>Rs. 500 a day</p>
<p><i>9. Who cleans the area you are in?</i></p> <p>Privately hired cleaner. The hawkers on the plot collectively pay him Rs. 20 a day, each.</p>	<p><i>10. How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i></p> <p>There used to be 600 hawkers, now there are hardly 200.</p>
<p><i>11. Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i></p> <p>Our customers were pedestrians, but we are no longer on the road. How do we access them? 70% of our customers have disappeared. The plot we are currently on has been sold to someone else by the KDA, they will remove us from here too.</p> <p>Shops always benefit from hawkers because hawkers attract customers, they first come to us, and then enter shops.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>150-200 Rs. everyday to the Police</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>None. Waiting for an opportunity to set up shop on the street again.</p>

No. 76	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Muhammad Saeed</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Lines Area / -</p>
<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Fruit Hawkers (tarbuza)</p>		<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 cart</p>

<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>On the road: Shahrah-e-Liaquat/New M.A. Jinnah</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>Empty Plot opp. Parking Plaza 3 months</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 1000 a day</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i></p> <p>Rs. 400 a day</p>
<p><i>9. Who cleans the area you are in?</i></p> <p>Privately hired cleaner. The hawkers on the plot collectively pay him Rs. 10 a day, each.</p>	<p><i>10. How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>11. Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i></p> <p>Chowkidar is paid 50 rs a day to look after goods at night.</p> <p>Almost all of us are now in some kind of debt due to the fruit we had taken on credit and were unable to sell, some of us just took loans to run the household because there was no other source of income. Hawker debt ranges between Rs. 30k and Rs. 60k, some of us sold our fruit in a loss so that it would not go bad. I personally had a loss of Rs. 40k.</p> <p>When we were on the road, at least 10 out of every 50 passing cars would stop and buy from us. Now, hardly anyone comes to buy our fruits as you can see.</p> <p>Ask any shopkeeper how they feel about us hawkers, they all miss us, we attract customers.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>150-200 Rs. everyday to the Police</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>None. Waiting for an opportunity to set up shop on the street again. OR will just keep going to wherever we get pushed to go to.</p>

No. 77	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Saeed Rehman</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Garden / -</p>
-----------	---	---

<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Collecting, refining, and re-selling empty pallets</p>	<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 donkey cart</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>Empress Market Area for 18 years</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>Mainly the empty plot opp. Parking Plaza 6 months</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 2000 a day</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i></p> <p>Rs. 500 a day</p>
<p><i>9. Who cleans the area you are in?</i></p> <p>-</p>	<p><i>10. How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i></p> <p>-</p>
<p><i>11. Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i></p> <p>Hawkers who were already in debt ran away after the anti-encroachment drive. The hawkers will be removed from this empty plot too because they will be developing a petrol pump on this plot.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>-</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>Waiting for markets to be setup on the road again.</p>

<p>No.</p> <p>78</p>	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Nawab</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute</i></p> <p>-</p>
----------------------	------------------------------------	---

<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Fruit Hawker.</p>	<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 cart</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>4x4 shop at Umar Farooq Cloth Market for 7 years</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>Empty Plot opp. Parking Plaza 3 months</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 40,000 monthly</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 20,000 monthly</p>
<p><i>9. Who cleans the area you are in?</i></p> <p>Privately hired cleaner. The hawkers on the plot collectively pay him Rs. 20 a day, each.</p>	<p><i>10. How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i></p> <p>There used to be over 2000 hawkers, now around 200</p>
<p><i>11. Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i></p> <p>The KMC says that this plot belongs to someone so they are going to remove us from here soon. Ask the shopkeepers! They will tell you.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>150-200 Rs. everyday to the Police</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>None. Waiting for an opportunity to set up shop on the street again. OR will just keep going to wherever we get pushed to go to.</p>

No. 79	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Imran</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Golimar / -</p>
-----------	------------------------------------	--

<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Fruit Hawker</p>	<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>1 cart</p>
<p><i>5. Previous Location</i></p> <p>In front of Empress Market for 18 years, before him his father managed the cart for 35 years</p>	<p><i>6. Current Location</i></p> <p>empty plot opp. Parking Plaza 6 months</p>
<p><i>7. Previous Income</i></p> <p>Rs. 1500 a day</p>	<p><i>8. Current Income (Daily)</i></p> <p>Rs. 500 a day (daily wage)</p>
<p><i>9. Who cleans the area you are in?</i></p> <p>Privately hired cleaner, Rs. 20 a day</p>	<p><i>10. How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i></p> <p>2,000-3,000 - 2 workers per cart</p>
<p><i>11. Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i></p> <p>The shopkeepers don't like us because they're rich and we're poor, but they benefit from us because we attract customers.</p>	
<p><i>12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i></p> <p>Rs. 50 at previous location</p>	<p><i>13. Future Plans</i></p> <p>Waiting for markets to be setup on the road again.</p>

No. 80	<p><i>1. Name</i></p> <p>Faisal Janan</p>	<p><i>2. Residence & Commute.</i></p> <p>Korangi / -</p>
<p><i>3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i></p> <p>Helper</p>		<p><i>4. No. of Shops & Size</i></p> <p>-</p>

5. <i>Previous Location</i> Empress Market for 20 years		6. <i>Current Location</i> empty plot opp. Parking Plaza 6 months
7. <i>Previous Income</i> Rs. 1000 a day		8. <i>Current Income (Daily)</i> Rs. 500 a day
9. <i>Who cleans the area you are in?</i> -		10. <i>How many hawkers were in the Empress Market area?</i> - There used to be at least 50 helpers like me in the Empress Market area now there are hardly 20
11. <i>Notes - Do shops benefit from hawkers?</i> The shopkeepers don't like us because they're rich and we're poor, but they benefit from us because we attract customers.		
12. <i>Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)</i> None.		13. <i>Future Plans</i> Waiting for markets to be setup on the road again.
No. 81	1. <i>Name</i> Muhammad Sabir	2. <i>Residence & Commute.</i> Lines Area / -
3. <i>Owner/ Tenant History & Typology</i> Newspaper stall. 5am-10am, 2pm-7pm Since 1950		4. <i>No. of Shops & Size</i> 1 stall
5. <i>Previous Location</i> -		6. <i>Current Location</i> Bohra Bazaar Main Rd

7. Previous Income	8. Current Income (monthly)
-	-
9. Time/ Income Lost	10. Allotment
-	-
11. Supply Chain & Notes	
<p>The stock is stored in a warehouse.</p> <p>'Sannata' - less than half of previous customers now visit Saddar</p>	
12. Harassment (Police / KMC / Others)	13. Future Plans
Nobody creates trouble for the newspaper hawkers because they have a union called the Anjuman-e-Imdad-e-Akhbar Farosha	-

No. 82	1. Name Iftikhar	2. Residence & Commute Punjab Colony/-
3. Owner/ Tenant History & Typology Jeans Hawker, Food Street/Mir Karam Ali Talpur Road		4. Contract with Government/Rent? Rs. 50 per day to KMC

<p>5. <i>How long on site?</i></p> <p>3 years</p>	<p>6. <i>Part of union?</i></p> <p>'everyone's political party is their union'</p>
<p>7. <i>Where is the stock stored at night?</i></p> <p>Rs. 50 per day paid to a chowkidaar</p>	<p>8. <i>Cleanliness on site?</i></p> <p>KMC</p>
<p>9. <i>Impact of evictions on income?</i></p> <p>Previously a daily revenue of approx. Rs. 13,000 now, 'we look at each others faces'</p>	<p>10. <i>Future of space?</i></p> <p>We don't know, sometimes they kick us out of here too.</p>
<p>11. <i>How many hawkers in this area?</i></p> <p>1000, they keep changing locations.</p>	
<p>12. <i>Ramazan expectations?</i></p> <p>We have good expectations for ramazan.</p>	<p>13. <i>Are hawkers good for shops or are they not?</i></p> <p>Yes they are, customers first come to us and then go to shops.</p>

Group Interview With 5 Sindhi Rehri Hawkers On Dr. Daudpota Road.

(info on bhatta)

There are about 200 to max 250 rehri on Daudpota Rd and 700 on KAT Road as per the conversation with the rehri hawkers'.

On Dr. Daudpota Road, all rehri hawkers pay bhatta to each authority (traffic/ police/ KMC). Rehri are randomly confiscated, penalty of Rs. 5000 when one goes to the KMC office to

retrieve it. If one pays less bhatta, the police registered an FIR against the hawker on grounds of qabza/ encroachment. Since, the rehri is by virtue of itself considered illegal.

With the shifting of the bus stop, the construction of an open gabled structure for a currently-halted project (Food St) and the subsequent pedestrianisation on KAT Road, a lot of hawkers have come to the area and all must pay bhatta to the KMC.

No. 83. Sajjad has been here 18 years – 2001. Residence Hijrat Colony. Works for daily wages. Operates rehri hosiery – storage in warehouse nearby. Bhatta is determined by the size of the hawkers set up and what they are peddling.

No. 84. Irshad Hussain sells vests/hosiery. Gets stock from Bolton Market and other shops in Saddar. Bhatta is included in daily expense of Rs. 1000. Not allowed to put up shop in the morning, faces regular harassment.

No. 85. Mohammed Azam lives in the Jultand Lines area. Sells hosiery. Earnings have quartered since evictions. He works for daily wages, spends Rs. 400 – 500 in bhatta.

No. 86. Ahmed Raza – 03152421477 - has been on site 10 years, sells pants and jeans. Buys his stock from Works for daily wages, his seth determines where he stands his rehri. Earnings have decreased by 20%.

No. 87. Zameer Hussain owns his rehri. Lives in Saddar and sells jeans and pants. Has been on site for 10 years. Income has halved since evictions.

No. 88. Nabi Baksh hardly earns Rs. 200 a day. He says there used to be around a hundred porters before the encroachment drive and that now there are only about 15, the rest of them have gone back to their villages. He also says that he has earned nothing in the last 10 days. Mushtaq will now have to take a loan from someone to go back to Mansehra. Nabi Bakhsh lives in old golimar, he comes to the empress market

by bus, he has been a porter for 22 years, his father was a porter before him for 12 years. He hails from Somiani, Balochistan. He used to earn Rs. 500 a day and now earns upto only Rs. 200 and some days he earns nothing.

No. 89. Wali Mohammed lives in Mangopir, he commutes by bus and has been a porter for the last 10 years. He used to earn upto Rs. 500 and now earns Rs. 200 on some days and on some he has to pay for his fare home from his own pocket. He hails from Somiani, Balochistan and is worried about how he is going to pay his rent as his income has suffered.

No. 90. Zafar Khan is homeless, he sleeps in a park where he works as a chowkidaar earning Rs. 3000 a month. He is from Swat and has been a porter for 10 years. As a porter, he would earn at least Rs. 500 a day and now it is difficult for him to earn enough to pay for his daily meals.

No. 91. Akbar lives in Lines area, he hails from Mingora. He has been a porter for 60 years and would earn upto Rs. 1300 a day and now earns hardly Rs. 300 a day. He says he has made only Rs. 160 in the last 10 days. He lives in Al Burhan center with 4 other people and they collectively pay rent which is Rs. 16,000. He says when he first came to Karachi it costed him Rs. 50, now it costs Rs. 3,000 and he does not have the money to go home for Eid.

No. 92. Muhammad Mushtaq lives in Baldia Town and hails from Mansehra. He has been a porter for 17 years. He used to earn upto Rs. 600 a day and now earns upto Rs. 200 a day.

Proposal based on conversation with Karachi's bureaucracy and laws in other countries.

8.0 Policy Statement for Facilitating Hawkers, Vendors, Street Enterprises, and Small Scale Commercial Operators in Karachi by Dr. Noman Ahmed

Introduction

In the recent past, civil administration in Karachi has caused removal of vendors, hawkers, street enterprises, small scale commercial establishments and moving carts from various locations. The drive began in compliance to various orders of Supreme Court of Pakistan in cases heard for liberating the footpaths in some locations from illegal encroachments. The process of removal continued with various frequencies and intensities. Many studies undertaken by urban researchers informed that vendors, hawkers and street entrepreneurs are an integral contributing entity of the city's economy. The first phase of Street Economy Study by the World Bank is an example. They provide affordable goods and services to the lower income segments and general public. In addition, they support in providing livelihood opportunities to a wide cross section of labour force without any direct burden on the state exchequer. These operators add social, cultural and economic value to the overall urban landscape of

the city with many innovative ways and means to access their clientele. However this important segment of urban economy is not provided any legal, administrative and operational support and remains at the disadvantage of evictions, confiscation of assets, fines, arrests and other penalties. Based upon the studies conducted for assessing the characteristics of hawkers, vendors and street entrepreneurs, and the review of policy and operational framework developed and applied in other countries in South and South East Asia, this draft policy document is prepared.

Guiding Principles

Rights and Privileges

The street hawkers, vendors and street entrepreneurs participate in an integrated economic activity. Their existence, right to operate and access to public spaces according to laid down principles must be legally and administratively acknowledged, as generally provisioned in Chapter 1 (Articles 8-28) of the Constitution of Pakistan. This core statute enshrines equal rights and privileges for all the citizens irrespective of social and economic status. The rights to enterprise are guaranteed in through Article 18 (Freedom of Trade, Business and Profession). However the Article demands appropriate translation into proper laws for enabling such business professionals and operators to function in complex situations. Vendors and hawkers are entrepreneurs with unclear relationship with the public space in which they operate. The Commissioner Karachi Division, while addressing a seminar in Karachi on 04 October 2019 on the issues faced by street vendors, stated that the hawkers and vendors are not illegal. He further informed that necessary framework for enabling them to legally function shall be prepared by the government soon. This intended move by the government to legalize vendors need to be actualized in an effective and mutually acceptable manner at the earliest possible instance.

Safeguards

Adopting an inclusive process of documentation and registration, the street enterprises and entrepreneurs must be registered with the Karachi Metropolitan Corporation or respective cantonment boards that possess jurisdiction in the area. A proper list of parameters may be prepared for conducting this exercise with an aim to include all types and scales of street enterprises and allied public spaces. Moving vendors with push carts and/or other adopted modes of mobility, sellers manually carrying the goods, hawkers temporarily positioned at threshold of streets/footpaths, vendors using common parked vehicles for displaying and selling goods and many similar typologies covered in this study may be

carefully categorized to formulate an inclusive document. It may be considered that future innovations and variations in vendor operations must be accommodated in the proposed policy without any administrative and legal prejudice. Support and assistance may be provided by well experienced resource organizations and relevant university departments to the municipal agencies for conducting documentation. Results of documentation must be put on open display through digital and non-digital means in a manner where the concerned vendors are able to review them and offer changes/modifications in case of inaccuracies. Apart from the websites of the municipal agencies, this information shall be displayed in the offices of the KMCs, DMCs and respective Cantonment Boards.

Policy Directions

Spatial Standards and Allocation

Based on the documentation and registration exercise, the spatial allocation and individual and collective standards must be derived for facilitation of the vendor activities. To enable the operationalization of vendor activities, neighbourhoods' vendor plans must be prepared and notified by the concerned municipal / land management agency. A vendors management committee must be notified in each of the six districts of Karachi. The proposed composition of this committee has been described in **Section 7** of this report. The distribution of spaces, terms and conditions and other details of the operations, including dispute resolution, shall be the purview of this body. The crucial responsibilities of the committee shall also include the communication of the notified terms and conditions to all the stakeholders related to vending activities. Local police, municipal officials, judicial officials, traffic police officials, shop keeper associations, transporters associations and elected members of assemblies are some mentions. Once these stakeholders accept the right and privileges of vendors to operate according to prescribed conditions, the conduct of vending operations shall become sustainable. In other words, the institutional strength and acquired capacity of the committee shall be an important pre-requisite in operationalizing the vendors operation in the respective districts.

Rent, Utilization Charges and Utility Connections

The hawkers, vendors and street entrepreneurs shall pay a rent/space utilization charge on a monthly basis to the municipal/land management agency, rates of which shall be notified by the same and revised on a periodical basis. The mechanism of payment shall be kept through banking channels on the same pattern as utility bills are paid. Besides, by virtue of possessing the registration certificate, the

vendors shall have the opportunity to acquire legal connection of water supply, sewerage, electricity or gas as they may require, depending upon the nature of their enterprise and spatial considerations. The concerned utilities shall be approached to prepare a connection protocol to enable vendors access such services in a convenient manner. It may open the avenue for innovative approaches for provision of services to targeted vendors community. For instance, group access to certain services may be considered. KWSB may provide water through bowsers to vegetable sellers and other water based vendors with mobile storage vessels in appropriate public spaces. Electricity utility may consider devising energy access options either through grid based connections to stationary vendors and battery/storage devices to mobile vendors. For effective implementation of innovations, a sequence of need analysis of different vendor categories in different locations is a fundamental pre-requisite. Besides, the full access to utilities shall enable vendors gradually comply with regulatory requirements of the concerned authorities. If a food seller possesses access to a working deep freezer, he may be able to effectively satisfy the requirements of food authorities.

Regulation

The vendors' activities shall be under the regulatory purview of the respective regulatory authority as per nature of enterprise. For example, vendors selling food shall be regulated by the Sindh Food Authority. As per the prescribed conditions, food businesses are mandated to register with the authority, comply with food preparation, storage and distribution standards, submit to periodic inspections by the assigned inspectors and rectify the observations made by the authority. Obviously, in the present stage, vendors do not follow any regulatory regime. Therefore, before enforcement, every vendor shall be required to receive a capacity building support to understand the regulatory requirements, operational assistance and training to enable him comply with the regulatory framework. The Local Government Department, Government of Sindh shall periodically notify a Schedule of Locations where vendors shall be allowed to operate and also locations where such activities shall be prohibited.

Capacity building assistance

The vendors shall be empowered to access formal credit and other financial and operational assistance they may require to scale up, diversify or add to their services. The government shall inform and engage the formal banking sector to help create opportunities where the vendors can benefit from usual

support such as banking and insurance options. As stated above, the need analysis shall determine the specific avenues where capacity building input shall be required. However common evidences from across the region inform that capacity building can be extended in a manner compatible to the social, cultural and working conditions of the street vendors. While the modalities may be worked about by vendors management committees, the local operational groups and active leaders amongst the vendor cadres may be frontline initiators of capacity building initiatives. The flavor of social conduct of this capacity building must remain conducive to the profile, strengths and weaknesses of the vendor community.

Prevention from evictions

In cases where the removal of vendors/hawkers from the places of their operation becomes unavoidable, a rehabilitation plan shall be prepared to accommodate them in the same neighbourhood. In cases where a suitable locational option is not available, the land management agency shall relocate them in a place that possesses similar commercial features and locational advantages where the hawkers can run their business without any further loss. There are many challenges that need to be overcome in this respect. A significant number of vendors are moving entities. They move around to access their clientele to facilitate services as well as fetch business. The allocation of space for operation must incorporate this essential characteristic feature of vendor operations. In other words, strict physical demarcation of spaces may be avoided and replaced by flexible designation of vendor zones in identified locations. Secondly, the regulators of the public spaces must be educated to accept this new reality of vendor operations to conserve the enabling operational environment. Thirdly, in cases where unavoidable conflicts and obstructions are caused due to any vendor operation, a gradual process of adjustment may be adopted through the vendor management committees. Re-siting may be delegated as a distinct administrative privilege to be exercised by this committee, when an unavoidable need may emerge.

Right to association

The hawkers shall be encouraged to form their locality and / or trade based association as per proviso of the law. This shall enable them retain their bargaining power and empower them to negotiate for individual and collective issues. This attribute must be taken as a capacity building pre-requisite. Collective upgradation of operations, ability to comply with the regulatory conditions and overall

upward mobility are few goals that can be achieved through the formation of effective associations. The support may be acquired from organizations such as Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research (PILER) to install capable and effective association for mutual benefit of vendors and the regulatory authorities.

Preserving gender roles

Many street enterprises in Karachi are run by women and transgender people. These enterprises have a useful connection with respective clientele and add cultural value to the respective trade. Through this policy, efforts shall be made to support, promote and enhance the enterprises run and managed by such people without any prejudice in the respective places. The vendor management committees must ensure a reasonable representation of women and transgender people to address the specific issues confronted by them. Whereas few vending enterprises are traditionally run by women, space may be created to enable more of them to set up enterprises where women have a skill advantage. Food and garments are two prominent mentions in this regard.

Assistance to differently abled people

In continuation to the above section of this document, the enterprises run and managed by differently abled people shall receive support and assistance, especially retaining them in locations where they exist. The municipal agency shall make arrangements where these people are able to access their clientele and place of work in a barrier free manner. A special relief may be negotiated with utility agencies, municipal agencies and regulators for those vendors who are differently abled. However it shall require a careful monitoring not to let stakeholders misuse this possible relief.

Dispute resolution

The vendors management committee shall be authorized to act as the dispute resolution platform for all such matters that may emerge between competing vendors, between vendors and government institutions and utilities. In order to empower the vending committee to discharge this important function, appropriate capacity building assistance shall be extended. This may include record keeping,

mapping, understanding administrative and legal system of vendors' operation, basic financial and audit procedures, documentation and business potential analysis. Public universities with relevant professional experience and capability shall be invited to extend this input according to a laid down framework.

Legality of this policy

The elected council of Karachi Metropolitan Corporation shall be requested to ratify and endorse this policy through a Council Resolution as prescribed in the law. The elected councils of each of the six districts shall be requested to consider and endorse the same according to laid down statutory provisions. Legal advice shall also be sought from Law Department of Government of Sindh in respect to upholding, notifying and enforcing this policy with the other tiers of government, including Cantonment Boards that are directly or indirectly engaged with vendor operations in Karachi.

Implementation Framework

Vendor and hawker management is essentially a municipal task. Evidences from the past inform that the erstwhile City District Government Karachi (CDGK) and its leadership began many vendor supporting initiatives. Properly demarcated spaces with rudimentary structures were developed and allotted to vendors in Karimabad, Gulshan-e-Iqbal and some other locations during the tenure of Nazim Naimatullah Khan (2001-2005). The next municipal regime under Syed Mustafa Kamal (2005-2010) enhanced the scale and sophistication of vendor structures. Tailor made cabins of fibre glass material were pre-fabricated and installed in several prominent public locations in the city. They also acquired electricity connections. The current distribution of functions between the various tiers of government allows the municipal bodies to look after and manage the urban public spaces. Therefore this policy document recommends that this arrangement should be retained. The crucial challenge arises in relation to the capacity of municipal agencies. Due to rapid institutional transformation within the municipalities, tense inter-governmental relations between the provincial and municipal administration, gradual eroding of working capacity, decline in the ability of available human resource, shortage of financial resources and lack of recent working experience in dealing with vendor affairs, there shall remain an institutional vacuum. This challenge can be addressed in two ways. It is possible to create a semi-autonomous vendor management committee at Karachi division level with its offices in each of the six districts. With its human resource strategically hired, the committee shall chalk out its strategic

working plan to implement the policy framework laid down in this document. The other option could be to carve out a vending management committee from the existing ranks of the municipality. Necessary discussion and deliberation may be done to take a decision on this issue.

As of now, thousands of vendors, hawkers and street entrepreneurs have been evicted from their places of operation since November 2018. Despite the passage of more than a year, the promised exercise of rehabilitation and provision of a working alternative has not been provided. Whereas these hawkers and vendors belong to various districts in the city, the single largest group hails from Karachi District South. Under this policy arrangement, a rehabilitation programme and plan must be worked out as an immediate action task to extend the much needed existential relief to this affected group.

An implementation road map of this policy document must also be prepared and notified by the Local Government Department, Government of Sindh. After preparation of this draft policy along with its statutory approval, a pilot scheme of vendor facilitation must be developed. It may be undertaken in Karachi District South where a sizable concentration of vendors is already visible. The vendor management committee, after its creation, should be tasked to conduct a vendor listing and registration; physical survey of suitable locations for vendor placement (in negotiation with concerned officials); operation plan for placing vendors; rates and conditions of revenue; time zones and locational restrictions (places where vendor operations shall be prohibited due to traffic or other reasons); liaison with concerned regulatory authorities and access to utilities. After operationalization of this pilot initiative, its performance should be examined for rectification. This model can then be introduced in other districts of the city. Finally, once this policy is enforced, a transition management framework may be specified to enable the vendors community complies with the laid down prescriptions. Registration of vendors, physical and social surveys, founding the vendors management committees, association building initiations, dialogue with regulators for smooth enforcement of the policy and identification of technical support institutions are few tasks that can be taken up during the time and locations identified for priority implementation of this policy.

Arif Hasan's views

1. This is what will be demanded as a result of the existing laws and institutions of governance in Pakistan.
2. However, this process will be long and inconclusive because of the complexities involved and the conflicts within departments on the ownership of space.
3. The process of regularization should be quick and as free of legal and administrative processes as possible.

4. I suggest the following:

- Identify where the hawkers can go so that they can earn a living and allocate such space for them that does not hinder pedestrian or vehicular movement. A line should be painted on the road or pavement and they should not cross that line.
- A hawkers committee should be set up in different areas to identify hawkers that have been evicted so that they can be rehabilitated within the marked zones.
- Each zone should have a hawkers committee that is responsible for collecting fees and depositing it with the KMC. This used to be done previously by the newspaper hawkers union all over Karachi so it is possible.
- Water and mobile toilets should be created for the hawkers and a janitorial system should be developed and managed by them. This should be monitored by the KMC to see that it functions efficiently.
- Other health-related requirements mentioned by Dr. Noman should follow over a period of time and much of the governance-related responsibility will be taken care of by hawkers' organizations.