GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN

Task Force Report on Urban Development

Planning Commission

February, 2011

GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN

Task Force Report on Urban Development

Planning Commission

February, 2011

Foreword

As the economy of Pakistan transforms away from agriculture to industry and the services sector, the towns and cities are increasingly assuming the role of engines of economic growth and social change in the country. The past reluctance to accord urban development its due place in policy planning has led to a large urban deficit, adversely affecting all dimensions of the cities, such as liveability, competitiveness, financial viability and good governance. The government is now committed to make progress towards achieving a "developed, industrialized and just Pakistan". For several reasons the investment in the urban sector is not growing beyond an abysmally low level to meet this commitment. Additionally, for lack of governance, the cities have not been able to manage their affairs well. For instance, they are confronted with immense challenges of prioritizing areas where investment may yield the best social and economic returns and also trigger enhanced productivity.

The period of next two decades would be momentous in our history. By the year 2030, Pakistan would be largely urban with more than half of its population living in a few mega cities and urban clusters around them. The pattern of urban development in these cities is already changing to high density and mixed land-use because of its overwhelming advantages. But often this change is resisted and opposed by powerful lobbies and interest groups, leading to chaos and haphazardness. Pursuing such a pattern of urban development will make cities more liveable, functional, egalitarian and well managed entities. Instead, the cities are confronted with a myriad of challenges: urban poverty, congestion, pollution, inadequate and deficient infrastructure, social conflict, strife and discontent and ecological degradation. Meanwhile, the small and medium sized towns are losing vitality due to the outmigration of their elite and educated citizens and an absence of investment and infrastructure for the expansion of local commerce. As such, they are constrained to contribute their full potential towards national development. Hence, sound urban policies must be evolved to address the variant nature of issues confronting large as well as small towns and cities.

A Task Force on Urban Development was, thus, constituted in June 2010 by the Planning Commission to review the prevailing urban conditions and establish principles that provide sound underpinnings for a consensus national urban policy. The Task Force comprised of eminent professionals in urban planning and management and was headed by Mr. Arif Hasan, chairperson of the Urban Resource Centre and a renowned architect and urban planner. The Task Force held several meetings hosted by the Planning Commission and un-daunted by the complexities of the issues involved, have been able to come up with a comprehensive precise

and valuable report. I have found this report interesting and useful. It is hoped that it would open a much needed dialogue amongst various stakeholders on urban issues as it also provides a sold basis for policy prescriptions at all levels – federal, provincial and local.

I express my admiration and gratitude for the valuable contributions made by the members of the Task Force and its Chairman that have made the preparation of this report possible.

Nadeem ul Haque

Deputy Chairman

Planning Commission

Acknowledgements

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

The Task Force on Urban Development was constituted in June 2010 by the Planning Commission, Planning and Development Division, Government of Pakistan, to review existing urban conditions in the country and establish broad principles for formulating a national urban policy. Headed by Mr. Arif Hasan, the Task Force, comprising eminent professionals from various urban development disciplines, has explored major challenges confronting the cities and framed broad parameters to address the issues.

In the introduction, the report highlights the biggest urban challenge facing Pakistan as the accelerated population growth of towns and cities. It is estimated that 55 to 60 million more people will be added to urban areas by the year 2030. The growing urbanization has positioned cities to play exceedingly important role in the national economic and social development and, therefore, the process needs to be supported and managed efficiently. The cities have been visualized as places of culture, learning and ideas whose development is based on principles promoting harmony, productivity, efficiency, creativity and equity.

Exploring the state of urbanization in the country, the report states its impacts both in terms of its costs and benefits. The cities are now contributing overwhelmingly to the country's GDP (over 78 per cent). But accelerating urbanization has also aggravated urban deficit which is eroding livability, productivity and efficiency of urban areas and degrading urban ecology. Additionally, urban poverty is on the rise and the increasing gap between rich and poor is leading to growing social instability and discontent among a large segment of society, particularly the youth. The report suggests reframing urban strategies aiming at inclusive and holistic urban development.

The changing structure of the economy indicates that in Pakistan economic growth has been increasingly driven by the manufacturing and services sectors based in large cities where informal sector dominates. According to the Competitiveness Report 2009, Pakistan ranks high in the cost of 'doing business'. It has, therefore, been suggested to improve the business environment and competitiveness and promote local urban economy through expanding inner-city markets, promoting cluster development, improving urban governance, providing skill development, allowing autonomous local governments and managing power shortages.

A high unemployment rate, increase in food and fuel prices and a deteriorating law and order situation in urban areas have been the major contributing factors of urban poverty. The report

recommends tackling urban poverty through sustained initiatives with a focus on technical education, vocational training and skill development of its youth and the workforce.

Almost all the cities in the country are faced with acute shortage of land which has resulted in extremely high land prices and, thus, stalled the pace of urban development. The raw land is held by influential groups who tend to hoard it for speculative purposes. Additionally, dispensation of available land is often wasteful due to flaws in existing land use regulations, planning standards and the prevalent informal processes. The report argues that other sources of urban land supply should be explored for efficient use of existing land resources such as unlocking land in the custody of government and resorting to high density compact city development/re-development.

In view of the legal context following the 18th Amendment in the Constitution, it has been argued that urban development would now largely be undertaken by the local/city governments. Therefore, efforts should be made to bring greater administrative and financial autonomy for the local governments in the on-going restructuring process.

Evaluating the efficacy of planning and zoning regulations, development standards, land registration/transfer procedures, rent control laws, property taxation, etc., it has been brought out that the flaws in the regulatory framework have severely constrained land supply and abnormally raised its prices given the strong demand for businesses and residences to locate in cities. Also, these have seriously affected the quality of architecture and urban design and suppressed initiatives for design creativity and excellence. The Task Force recommends a thorough review of the existing laws and procedures and suitable amendments where required.

The analytical review of urban infrastructure services shows that the problem is not as much of quantitative shortages as of inequitable coverage, where principal sufferers are poor and low-income groups. Besides, there are also problems of defective infrastructure, poor quality of service delivery and low level of cost recovery. The review argues that the present focus on expanding urban infrastructure should shift to increasing productivity and efficiency of the existing networks by reforming the institutions that manage the infrastructure and facilitating them to adopt innovative engineering and maintenance techniques.

The Task Force notes that the cities are losing the infrastructure that supports and promotes social, cultural and entertainment activities such as art galleries, theatre, cinemas, exhibition halls, fair and festival grounds, parks and playing fields, public meeting places, city halls, tea and coffee houses, art schools and libraries. The cultural space has greatly shrunk for common citizens excepting the elite. It is thus crucial that city development strategies should

focus on creating multi-class public spaces by way of promoting high density and convivial living.

Analyzing the housing situation it has been noted that towns and cities face huge housing shortage of about 2.7 million housing units. It is argued in the report that government's role in meeting the housing shortages should be supportive. The state needs to promote the housing process in the private sector (formal and informal) through ensuring availability of properly serviced housing sites and access to housing finance and building technology, promoting high density and mixed land use housing and relaxing taxation and rental restrictions.

Exploring urban transport, it is observed that while commuting between and within cities has increased manifold, an efficient public transport system has not been developed. Public bus service has deteriorated over time due to low returns. A phenomenal growth of personal motor vehicles and small commercial vehicles has followed to meet the demand which has outstripped the carrying capacity of the urban road systems resulting in congestion and increased level of air pollution. It has been suggested that the solutions to traffic and transport problems need not to be sought in building costly urban freeways and unaffordable rail-based mass transit systems but by managing traffic better through simpler solutions and putting in place good quality and affordable bus-based public transport system.

Assessing the state of environmental degradation in urban areas, it is felt that increasing urbanization, motorization and industrialization has placed urban environment, built as well as natural, under tremendous stress. The growing degradation has adversely affected all environmental elements such as air, water, noise level, sanitation, aesthetics and ecology. A number of green remedial initiatives have been suggested such as making buildings energy efficient, use of cleaner fuel (e.g. CNG) in transport, promoting compact urban pattern.

Security of life and property, including security from accidents (fire, disaster, building collapse, terrorism, etc.) has deteriorated due to a breakdown in law and order. Due to governance failure, besides other socio-economic factors, various interest groups and mafias, sectarian and ethnic groups have emerged in urban areas. They fragment society, cause conflicts and encourage violence and disturbances. The Task Force calls for making urban governance system more responsive, efficient and accountable, and identifies two essential prerequisites-- political power to administer and trained manpower to run the system. Additionally, the report points out, the society must be convinced of the importance of these reforms and should endorse the measures.

Task Force Report On Urban Development

1.   Introduction

Demographic trends show that the country's population has been rapidly urbanizing, with an average annual rate of urbanization exceeding 4 per cent since 1951. It is estimated that by the year 2030, Pakistan will be predominantly urban with 45.6 per cent of its population living in urban areas and about 12 cities housing more than one million people.

The urban population recorded during the 1998 Census was nearly 43 million and is currently (2010) estimated at 63.1 million. The tremendous challenge of absorbing such a massive number of people in urban areas and providing them with shelter, food, employment, healthcare, education, municipal services and recreation facilities is made more difficult given shortage of urban facilities and resources, skilled manpower and good governance. Despite the challenges, urban areas demonstrate immense economic potential to generate growth in the country. Economic activity in urban areas produces at least 78 percent of the national wealth (GDP) of Pakistan and can be instrumental in enhancing prosperity and increasing per capita income.

Although urban development is a provincial issue and urban planning a local one, the immense contribution and, indeed, economic potential, of urban areas to the national trade and economy gives the Federal Government of Pakistan good reason to focus on and address challenges of urbanization and suggest areas for reforms.

It is against this background that the Deputy Chairman (Dr. Nadeem ul Haque) of the Planning Commission of Pakistan constituted a Task Force on Urban Development on 28 June 2010[1]. The Task Force was assigned to review the existing urban conditions in the country and establish broad principles for formulating a national urban policy. Headed by Mr. Arif Hasan, the Task force comprised well accredited professionals from different disciplines. Broadly speaking, the Task Force was to devise a consensus agenda for realization of the following objectives:

---

[1] The composition of the Task Force and its Terms of Reference are available at Annexure A.

- make urban areas livable, prosperous and functional in all dimensions--physical, social, economic--and well governed;

- facilitate urban areas to become competitive and perform their role as centers of economic growth and development;

- develop quality infrastructure that facilitates urban development;

- review land-use and building regulations as well as laws and policies relating to urban planning and development to determine if the framework enables the cities to develop as inclusive, competitive, growth compatible and investment-friendly cities;

- ensure that cities are empowered, well-managed and governed by institutions that promote equitable and socially inclusive development, and;

- create a knowledge-base to understand and resolve urban issues.

This report is an outcome of the deliberations of the Task Force extending over several meetings held at the Planning Commission in Islamabad.

The Task Force visualizes urban areas as self-sustaining and economically vibrant centers characterized by availability of capital, especially real estate, in open markets where high-density and mixed land use areas are inclusive and the well-being of citizens--irrespective of class and ethnicity--is protected. The Task Force believes that ideal urban areas are places of culture, learning and ideas whose development is based on promoting livability, harmony, productivity, efficiency, creativity and equity.

2.   The State of Urbanization in Pakistan

In 1981, about 24 million people were living in urban areas that represented 28 per cent of country's total population. In the 1998 Census, the urban population increased to 43.5 million, constituting 32.5 percent of the total population (143 million). The total population of the country has now (2010) reached 173.5 million and the urban population 63.1 million, increasing the level of urbanization to 36.3 percent. The urban population is estimated to surpass 121 million by the year 2030. The level of urbanization of 45.6 percent would then be the highest amongst the South East Asian countries.

These figures have been questioned in relation to the urban population for three reasons. Firstly, at the time of 1981 and the 1998 Censuses, the definition of urban was changed to mean only those human settlements which had municipal governments. In the definition used in the first three censuses (1951, 1961, 1972), settlements of 5,000 and above population which had urban characteristics could be considered as urban. As a result of this change, 1,483 settlements of over 5,000 were not considered urban in the 1981 Census. Secondly, administrative boundaries of most urban areas do not include their peri-urban settlements. And thirdly, "ribbons of development along highways, between major centers and industrial satellite areas have developed, largely due to accessibility to transport links, availability of skills and services and tariff incentives"[2]. These developments have urban characteristics but are not classified as urban.

Features and Repercussion

The urbanization in Pakistan is characterized by several distinguishing features. Firstly, the urban areas have become major contributors to the national economy, generating and diffusing growth across country. Urban areas contribute 78 percent of the country's gross domestic production (GDP). The rising per capita income in the country is mainly due to increasing productivity of the urban economy. Secondly, the pattern of urbanization across provinces exhibits large variation. Thirdly, more than half of the total population of the country is clustered in and around eight cities i.e., Karachi, Lahore, Faisalabad, Rawalpindi, Multan, Hyderabad, Gujranwala and Peshawar.[3] The fourth important feature of urbanization is an expanding middle class comprising young generation seeking skills and a better lifestyle. The number of employed women is also increasing.

Twenty per cent of the urban population of Pakistan is under 25 years of age. As such, urbanization has to cater to the needs of a young population. The social indicators of the age group 15–25 years in urban areas have changed considerably over time. Literacy in this age group, of both males and females, has increased between the inter-census years. Major changes have also taken place in marriage patterns for this age group. In 1981 Census, 16.07 per cent men and 41.54 per cent women were married as opposed to 11.15 per cent men and 29.86 per cent women (28 per cent for Karachi) in 1998. Urban policies related to education, entertainment, culture and recreation are required to cater to this changing population needs.

---

[2]. Raza Ali; *How Urban is Pakistan*, November 1999
[2]. UN World Urbanization Prospects, 2009
[3]. ADB poverty assessment, 2008
[3] Examples are Karachi and Lahore City districts, the Gujranwala, Faisalabad and Lahore triangle, and the Mansehra to Hassan Abdal corridor interspersed with medium and small towns.

Important changes are also taking place in settlement patterns. In 1981, 38.8 per cent of Pakistan's population lived in three cities with population of over one million. In 1998, 49.7 per cent of Pakistan's urban population lived in eight cities of nearly one million people. Populations living in the cities ranging between 500,000 and 999,999 declined from 14.5 per cent to 4.9 per cent but there was an increase in the population of the cities between 200,000 and 499,999 from 4.5 per cent to 9.1 per cent. Most of these smaller towns are located in the neighborhood of the one million plus towns and along the National Highway. This means that the government will now have to plan for urban regions, agglomerations and clusters rather than individual towns and cities.

Migration to the urban areas is also increasing and has to be taken into consideration in economic and land use planning. According to the 1998 Census, 10.8 million Pakistanis, or 8 per cent of the total population, were migrants. Over 63.7 per cent of them have migrated to urban areas and 25 per cent of total migrants migrated to large cities like Karachi, Lahore and Rawalpindi, where job opportunities are available. Thirteen per cent of the total migrant population migrated to Karachi alone.

Given the above statistics, planners will be dealing increasingly with large and mega cities in the next decade, especially those of populations of 500,000 and above and containing a large percentage of migrants. Job opportunities if generated in the smaller cities will spread out migration more evenly. This can be done by supporting local level production (crafts, foods, small industries) trade, commerce and tourism through infrastructure, credit, advice and public-private partnership.

There are important repercussions of growing urbanization in the country: one is the poverty issue which centers on unemployment, absence of housing, education, health, transport and security. Secondly, the lack of an environmental, social and economic ambiance in the medium and small urban centers has forced the better educated and enterprising individuals and communities to migrate to the larger towns and cities. As a result, towns have lost their political importance. Thirdly, local trade and commerce, which are the backbone of the economy, have been neglected in small urban centers and town.

The growing urbanization has also placed enormous demands on financing of urban development activities. The local governments continue to depend on fund transfers from the provincial governments and have not attempted to mobilize their own resources or attract private sector investment. The provincial governments' transfers can only meet salary costs and little is left for new development. The existing legal framework (a mixture of local government

and development authorities) is unable to cope with challenges of large cities and growing urban areas.

3. Urban Economy

Issues

In most developing countries the emphasis in recent years has been away from policies that inhibit urbanization, control internal migration or evict the urban poor residents and resettle them elsewhere. There is now increased focus on proactive urban planning strategies that rely on providing infrastructure and services to accelerate economic growth in urban areas.

Global trends in urbanization show a strong relationship between urbanization and GDP growth. Pakistan is also poised for a major urban demographic transition as the population of its major cities is growing. More recently, this growth in the economy in most countries is driven by urban-based services and growth in the industrial sector. In Pakistan, lack of disaggregated statistics on the urban economy and regional GDP make it difficult to assess the role of cities and urban centers in economic growth of the country. The cities are growing fast and contributing to economic growth. For example, Karachi alone accounts for 60-70 per cent of the national revenue and 40 per cent of value-added in the manufacturing sector. The changing structure of the economy indicates that in Pakistan the economic growth has been increasingly driven by the manufacturing and the services sector.

The informal sector also plays a major part in developing economies absorbing some 30 to 70 per cent of urban labor force, reflecting an inability of the modern formal sector to absorb the growing urban labor force. Sectors like construction, wholesale and retail trade, transport and communication and, even manufacturing, operate with high levels of informal employment.

According to the Competitiveness Report 2009, Pakistan ranks high in the cost of 'doing business'. There is, therefore, an urgent need to improve the business environment, competitiveness and to promote the urban economy.

Guidelines and Recommendations:

The following recommendations are made to improve the business environment, competitiveness and to promote the urban economy in the country:

- **Expand Inner City Markets**
  There are substantial market potential and marketing opportunities in the inner-city areas. Market intelligence can help cities attract investment in often overlooked inner-city areas. The Inner-city Market Assessment piloted in Bogota and Johannesburg, which uses data-

mining techniques to uncover under-served markets in urban areas and attract investment, broaden retail services and create jobs, should immediately be undertaken in Pakistan.

- **Promote City Cluster Development**

  The city cluster economic development process can be useful in accelerating economic growth in urban areas through infrastructure development, provision of financial inputs and creating better environmental conditions.

- **Build Capacity of Local Government**

  Capacity building (and appropriate research) to improve local government management of urban areas is essential without which the city cluster development concept cannot work. Local government management and control must be supported by a competent bureaucracy.[4] The scheme of bureaucracy and its support of urban governance need to be redefined with a focus on urban planning and management.

- **Provide Skill Development Opportunities**

  Urban development and redevelopment cannot be undertaken in equitable and environmentally sensitive manner unless the people are adequately skilled. Most polytechnics and vocational schools in the country have been closed down. Polytechnics and vocational training schools should be revived to impart skills and training in a variety of areas including medicine, textile, building, construction and other related industries which desperately require para-professionals and technicians.

- **Encourage Sub-National Government Financing**

  The local governments should be given financial autonomy and encouraged to raise more revenues from local taxes. Taxes on alternative energy components, which are very high at present, should be removed.

- **Manage Energy Demand**

  Alternate energy sources need to be explored (solar, wind, etc.). Research should be undertaken to minimize cost of use of such energy.

---

[4] At present, the bureaucratic structure takes more experienced officers and moves them to the provincial and federal capitals and removes them from the local level.

4.   Urban Poverty

Issues

A high unemployment rate, increase in prices (especially of fuel and food items) and a deteriorating law and order situation in urban areas have increased the incidence of urban poverty in the country. Immediate steps need to be taken to reduce poverty.

Guidelines and Recommendations:

The difference between rural and urban poverty must be understood before any action can be taken to overcome urban poverty.   Rural poverty should be managed by providing infrastructure, links to markets and roads, education and healthcare facilities. For urban areas, following measures are recommended:

- Improve employment opportunities for the poor in key sectors through technical education, vocational training and skill development in line with market demands;

- Strengthen and universalize social protection programs for workforce by expanding coverage, enabling access to benefits and monitoring the progress of the programs;

- Provide quality and affordable healthcare infrastructure to combat urban poverty. This can be done through the promotion of affordable insurance cover and through the establishment of public sector utilities subsidized by local government taxes. Good healthcare infrastructure will ensure that meager incomes are not spent or diverted to medical expenses. Improvement in the physical environment will also reduce expenditure on healthcare since the overwhelming majority of diseases are related to noise, air and water pollution and the absence of sanitation.

5.   Urban Land

Issues

Almost all cities in the country are faced with acute shortage of land which has resulted in extremely high land prices. Land at appropriate scale and price is not available for industrial and commercial enterprises or housing and infrastructure projects. The available land is also being used inefficiently due to extravagant nature of existing land use regulations and planning standards and prevalent informal processes.

Inability of cities to meet the land and housing shortage has led to large scale encroachment on public and private land and the proliferation of *katchi abadis*. The land shortage and

consequently its high price have rendered investment in land more lucrative than any other type of capital investment.

Land use in urban areas is controlled by multiple government agencies and political interests. There is very little coordination between them. As a result, there is little by way of cohesive urban planning. Individual agencies and interest groups pursue their agendas within their own jurisdiction resulting in haphazard urban growth.

Land in many of the medium and smaller towns is manipulated by a powerful agriculturists' lobby and acquiring it for planned development is difficult. There are no proper mechanisms to bring to the urban market enough agriculture/revenue/pastural/waste land for urban use to meet increasing requirements.

In large towns, land is a hotly contested commodity and is planned and disposed off through powerful, and often compromising, planning agencies and through political and economic pressure of powerful interest groups. These interest groups develop land for sale and lease it to the urban elite middle classes and overlook, often entirely, the needs and demands of the majority. The result is low density elite middle-income colonies creating an uncontrolled and automobile-dependent urban sprawl. Meanwhile, ecologically unsafe waste lands are informally converted into increasingly smaller lots for low-income groups.

In medium and intermediary towns, planning and controlling agencies are weak. Expansion takes place along the corridors leaving and entering the cities. Much of the development caters to the housing needs of middle, lower-middle and lower-income groups through informal subdivision of agricultural land. There is a need to support and direct this growth through appropriate road and infrastructure projects.

Wholesaling and related warehousing and storage, retailing and other services sector activities are not planned: they develop in an ad-hoc manner. Commercial activity of all types are increasing in the cities and new lobbies representing transporters, market operators and the real estate lobby have emerged as powerful players in determining the form that these cities are taking. These lobbies need to be involved in decision making and the development they undertake needs to be guided by professional advice.

In smaller towns there is almost no expertise with the TMAs: no maps, no modern surveying equipment and no future vision for the town. The TMA has to be strengthened and the expertise for it has to be developed.

Holistic urban development is also not taking place in cities. Cash-strapped city district governments turn to provincial and federal sources funding for infrastructure projects. Provincial and federal governments, in turn, obtain the capital to undertake large urban development projects from multilateral funding organizations. Thus, urban development is limited to the projects that can be financed and implemented. There is no comprehensive urban planning, only 'project-based', ad-hoc development.

Transport has not been factored into land use policies and schemes. As a result, the right to mobility, especially of women, children, senior citizens and the handicapped is severely curtailed, amounting to a violation of fundamental right. Lack of public transport and a restricted choice of transport options make mobility--and the economic activity it has the potential to unlock--difficult.

Recommendation

- Review unregulated conversion of peri-urban agricultural/waste land in to housing for identifying the environmental and social damage it is causing. Initiate, on the basis of this review, changes to facilitate the process in a more sustainable and non-bureaucratic manner.

- Expand land supply in urban areas through renewal (high density and mixed use) projects in the inner areas and promote densification in new development projects.

- Formulate procedures for the provincial revenue departments and urban local governments to work together for a smooth process for the conversion of agricultural/ government/ community lands to urban use.

- Reserve state land with metropolitan areas for low-income housing and deliver this land through market mechanisms.

- Halt the use of the Land Acquisition Act 1894 for the acquisition of land for housing. Instead of resorting to compulsory land acquisition to provide housing schemes for the rich, procure land from land owners either on market rates or through land sharing strategies using market mechanisms for providing housing for low and lower-middle income groups[5].

---

[5] This step alone will accomplish the important goal of reducing low-density automobile dependent urban sprawl.

- Release large tracts of state land held by federal and provincial governments at prime locations in the urban areas to augment supply in the market.

- Create a supra authority in which the representatives of all the other agencies participate in arriving at a consensus on development plans and their implementation procedures while maintaining their financial and administrative autonomy.

6.   The Existing Legal Framework and Its Negative Repercussions

The responsibility of urban spatial planning rests with local governments (and, in larger urban areas, with city district governments) and development authorities (DAs). Urban local governments and DAs were intended to work in tandem, with local governments responsible for macro issues such as planning, governance, administration and enforcement and DAs responsible for developing urban areas in response to the needs of the urban population. After the promulgation of the Local Government Ordinances 2001, some urban areas integrated their respective DAs with their local governments (Karachi is an example where the Karachi Development Authority and Karachi Building Control Authority were brought into the fold of the City District Government of Karachi). However, in urban areas where local governments and DAs continue to exist and operate side by side, they are not working in tandem.

Guidelines:
- Identify and address political issues arising out of the 18th Amendment.

- Merge DAs into urban local governments.

7.   Building Byelaws and Zoning Regulations

Issues
Existing laws, byelaws, zoning regulations and policies impede an efficient and economical use of land. Principles of healthy and safe environment, social cohesiveness and pleasing aesthetics are often violated. These laws and regulations are mostly anti-street, anti-pedestrian, anti-mixed land use, anti-high densities and anti-public space. They do not provide sufficient space for amenities such as schools, health facilities, parks and playgrounds. Increasing requirement for appropriately located warehousing, storage, transport and cargo terminals, for high density housing, especially for low and lower-middle income groups, are not being met. Often the regulations are in conflict with the requirements for the protection of the built heritage of the urban areas.

The rigidity of existing laws, byelaws and regulations has seriously affected the quality of architecture and urban design and has suppressed initiatives for design creativity and excellence. Additionally, the inflexibility of regulations makes the process of securing building permissions/no objection certificate tedious, expensive and time consuming. In addition, the absence of a non-utilization fee on land and property has skewed the land market and affected the development process.

One of the important principle on which these laws and byelaws are founded is land use segregation. This segregation is primarily responsible for the development of automobile dependant and sprawl inducing stand-alone houses, generating low density and unsustainable communities.

Urban local governments and DAs have also begun resorting to enforcement of byelaws for the purposes of revenue-generation rather than as a means of adopting better practices and ensuring safety standards.

There is no 'condominium law' in Pakistan that sets out the rights and obligations of the tenants or residents of apartment buildings, town-houses or high-rises. Often, because of negligence on the part of building owners or landlords, apartment buildings appear unattractive for the purposes of family living and, as a result, a bungalow in sprawling private housing schemes are preferred even for commercial activity.

Further, the existing byelaws have also negated the concept of a high density urban centre and the economic and social benefits that come with nodal or area-based commercialization.

Recommendations:

- Create a governing body to maintain and monitor standards and practices among property developers, regulate property dealers and agents and enforce professionally set standards.

- Amend the zoning and building regulations and match the market preferences at different locations and zones to support high density, high-rise and mixed land use patterns.[6]

- Regulate zoning bylaws making it mandatory for developers to provide certain facilities to the city in return for the use of land (e.g. auditoriums, cultural centers and related public spaces).

---

[6] This realization is also supported by the contemporary research which has established, ".....that land use interventions can hurt business as well as consumers." (Brueckner 2007).

- Review byelaws, such as those levying commercialization charges, as these have become severe constraint on development of rental premises for residential and commercial purposes.

- Develop a 'condominium law' that sets out the rights and obligations of occupants of apartment buildings.

- Introduce certification process for the property dealers in the formal sector that ensures a minimum knowledge of property law, property transference and the dynamics of property markets. Emphasize the importance of certification through the media so that these practices infiltrate into the informal sector as well.

8. Physical Infrastructure

Issues

Physical infrastructure continues to be a serious problem in urban areas. Generally it is poor in quality and its coverage limited and inequitable. Underground sources of water supply are fast depleting due to heavy withdrawal and surface water is threatened with municipal sewage and waste water discharges and pollution. Cities are increasingly faced with scarcity of water and poor quality of supplies. Additionally, 35 to 40 per cent water is wasted through leakages and theft in the water distribution networks. Water treatment facilities are also limited.

Sewage is collected through open drains in most of the cities and discharge into rivers, streams, lakes and canals without treatment. These channels often become sources of urban water supply schemes. The collection through piped networks is limited to very few large cities where the coverage is selective and sewage treatment rare. Additionally, in small towns incidence of open defecation is not uncommon.

Only 5 per cent households have proper access to municipal garbage collection systems. Often there is no arrangement for its disposal at properly developed landfill sites. The uncollected garbage accumulates on streets and open spaces between houses from where scavengers extract the usable material for recycling and leave the rest to rot.

Management of service delivery is also a big issue. An important deficiency in this regard has been lack of capacity of local governments. For major projects, local governments are dependent on the assistance of provincial and federal governments. Moreover, funds are often mismanaged and costs of provision excessive. There is lack of accountability and transparency in service management and finance.

Guidelines and Recommendation:

Sewage:
- Give priority to gravity flow systems even if their design requires many disposal points instead of one. This will considerably reduce O&M requirements and improve efficiency.

- Divert sewage to treatment plants in large parks so that it can be used for horticulture purposes (as it is being done in Karachi). Similarly, in small towns, divert sewage for use in agriculture to generate revenue from its sale.

- Lay trunks on either side of the natural drainage channels to pick up sewage and build treatment plants at appropriate locations accordingly.

- Initiate solar pumping for sewage disposal to save on energy costs and disposal failures during periods of load-shedding.

- Discontinue building open drains for sewage disposal in small towns. Make all sewage flow through an underground system.

Policies:

- Provincial governments to initiate the required processes for implementing the sanitation, water and environment policies of the federal government since these have a direct bearing on infrastructure provision, maintenance and operation.

Water:
- Consider gravity systems as O&M costs in the long run would be lower.

- Install bulk water metering for specific purposes and areas so that water theft and usage can be easily monitored.

- Initiate solar pumping for water supply to save on energy costs and cater to disposal failures during periods of load-shedding.

Solid Waste:
- Shift all recycling activity in large towns to landfill sites. Informal sector will thus transfer recyclable waste to the landfill sites and/or relocate their activities to the landfill sites.

- Explore private sector involvement in solid waste management.

- Develop environmentally safe incinerators and composting for smaller town.

Roads and Pavements:

- Make pavement construction an integral part of all road construction within towns.

- Support all road construction and street paving through an effective, open and paved drainage system so that road surfaces are not damaged.

- Make pavements large enough for comfortable movement and free from obstruction from trees, sign posts, street lights etc. to make walking on pavements easy and enjoyable.

- Pave the pavements, community spaces and roads in burnt brick where concrete construction is not available or is costly.

The above recommendations need to be implemented through:

- A comprehensive, continuous research, training, and monitoring system that develops and sustains the TMAs, WASAs and other development agencies.

- Better management of local government funds, TMA and other departments dealing with infrastructure through research and extension by the academia, professional institutions and NGOs.

- Training of manpower in IT for surveying, mapping and digitalization.

- Integration of existing research into government planning/training.

9. Social Infrastructure:

Issues

Socio-cultural and entertainment activities in the cities tend to play a leading role in economic diversification, enhancing social integration and engaging the younger generation in healthier activities.

Cities are losing multi-class social, cultural and entertainment activities and the infrastructure that support and promote them, such as art galleries, theatres, cinemas, exhibition halls, fair and festival grounds, parks and playing fields, public meeting places, city halls, tea and coffee houses, art schools and libraries: all are close to extinction except for the elite. Any urban development strategy should focus on development of cultural public spaces. One way to do

this is to promote high density, mixed land use in urban areas with opportunities for public recreation.

Folk culture surrounding shrines during religious events exists in all the urban centers of Pakistan. However, it is badly organized and the venues do not have the infrastructure to cater to the activities and the traffic generated. Cinemas, parks and theatres do not cater to the requirements of all sections of the urban society. Cinema tickets are too costly, parks do not cater to hawkers and performers who are an essential part of entertainment and recreational activities. In addition, there are a number of neighborhood cultural activities that are difficult to organize due to the absence of public spaces.

Libraries, clubs and local sports facilities are initiated by neighborhood organizations and civic-minded citizens in neighborhoods all over the country. However, these are not adequately supported by local government, NGOs, private sector and charity organizations. The older urban areas of Pakistan contain extraordinarily beautiful architecture which is slowly being replaced by substandard concrete construction. We are losing our heritage and identity.

Museums, art galleries, theatres, seminars, workshops, film festivals, etc are organized and attended by the elite, academia and middle-classes only. While small and medium cities lack cultural, recreation and entertainment facilities and, as such, do not cater to the aspirations of an emerging middle class.

Guidelines and Recommendations:

- Undertake planning (after thorough research) that cater to the physical/spatial demands for cultural, recreational, entertainment and educational activities.

- Study physical and social issues related to existing cultural events so that these can be better organized and administered to cater to all classes in the town/city.

- Develop and implement guidelines for an aesthetically pleasing, energy efficient, socially responsive architecture, signage and street furniture. Seek support of academia and professional organizations in this regard.

- Integrate heritage conservation into the overall cities/towns planning and development process.

- Identify and remove/modify all laws, regulations and procedures that prevent the promotion of culture, contemporary values and expression of ideas.

- Allocate space for educational/academic, entertainment and recreational activities based on a study of demand. Develop and strictly enforce laws to protect land earmarked for these activities.

- Develop in and around shrines, parks, transport and cargo terminals, sports facilities etc., hawkers' zones and places for other informal economic and recreational activities so as to make them a part of the formal planned environment. Develop byelaws to accommodate accordingly.

- Develop, in all small towns and in the sub-central district business (CDBs) of the larger cities, cultural precincts with pedestrian areas and space for recreational and cultural activity and organize cultural events in these spaces (such as inviting local musicians and singers to perform, artists to paint wall surfaces, weekly book fairs, weekly bazaars, etc.).
- Create a special fund in city government for support to associations/community groups that promote/support the creation and running of libraries, neighborhood clubs and sports activities.

- Curtail through traffic in institutional areas to enhance their environmental quality and social ambience, and provide aesthetically designed pavements, street signage and furniture.

10. Housing and Real Estate and Its Relationship to Land, Industry and Finance

Issues

Urban areas are confronted with enormous housing deficit, estimated to be 2.7 to 3 million units (House Building Finance Corporation 2008). The supply side is extremely weak, meeting about one-third of the requirements. Public sector housing schemes are few and take very long to develop. Hence the deficit is aggravating. In the recent floods nearly half a million housing units have been affected in the urban areas making the housing situation worse. In addition, the quality of housing is generally poor: 30 per cent of the housing units are old, without permanent roofs and need replacement and improvements. The room occupancy is 3.2 persons (Census 1998), which is twice more congested than the limits prescribed in international standards.

The National Housing Policy 2001 prescribed the role of the government as a facilitator in the housing sector. As such the federal and provincial governments have stopped financing the construction of houses for their employees and, instead, have been promoting housing schemes on an ownership basis.

The proportion of rental housing in urban areas was around 22 per cent in 1998 (census 1998). It is estimated that demand for rental housing is increasing at a rate of 8 percent per year. To respond to such a huge demand, there are a few rental housing projects launched and that too, in large cities like Karachi. The tenant-favoring Rent Restriction Laws are a major hurdle in the growth of the rental housing projects.

Non-availability of affordable and serviced land is the principal constraint for housing. Urban land markets suffer two problems: one, enough agricultural/waste land is not being converted for housing needs and, second, the available land is being used for uneconomical, low density housing.

The housing finance level in the country is as low as 1 percent of GDP as compared to 10 to 15 percent in other developing countries (McKinsey 2009). The traditional source of housing finance has mainly been the House Building Finance Corporation (HBFC) whose disbursements are inadequate compared to an annual demand of approximately Rs 8 billion. Meanwhile, the private banks have expanded their involvement in housing finance in recent years and have captured about 67 per cent share of the total disbursed amount but they serve only the needs of middle or higher-income groups.

Vague land titles, unclear property tax and other related laws, lack of transparency in allotment of land in public sector schemes and unregulated activities of private housing societies/developers are other factors contributing towards increasing housing shortage and/or its unaffordability.

A large number of *katchi abadis* have sprung up in all the major cities as a result of available housing going beyond the affordable level of most of the urban population. It is estimated that 40 to 45 per cent of population is living in *katchi abadis* in major cities.

Housing sector has a great potential for generating employment opportunities and expanding industry and trade activities and can be helpful in achieving an economic recovery.

Guidelines and Recommendations:

Government's role in supporting and promoting the housing process should be in ensuring availability of properly serviced housing sites, access to housing finance and building technology (including appropriate design and construction services), provision of urban utilities and services, supportive zoning and building regulations and relaxed taxation and rental restrictions.

- Undertake land and housing appraisal at the district level to act as the baseline inventory of housing situation.

- Establish Housing Price Index (HPI) and Housing Access Index (HAI) with the assistance of Federal Bureau of Statistics.

- Developm a Housing Resource Centre in each district beginning with major cities such as, Karachi, Lahore and Rawalpindi/Islamabad.

- Re-vitalize HBFC by encouraging it to venture into new avenues such as community mortgage programs, housing credit assistance to public and corporate organization employees and support to bankable housing projects in the private sector.

- Identify laws, byelaws, zoning regulations and procedures that constrain the delivering of housing, especially to low and lower-middle-income groups, and modify them to make them consumer- and market-friendly

- Subsidize government land within metropolitan areas through market mechanisms for low-income housing (see Appendix).

The Real Estate Market Approach:
- Take steps to remove impediments in the free and secure transfer of title.

- Roll back the benefits and exemptions conferred on urban elites (specifically, the exemption from property tax enjoyed by land owned by the provincial governments).

Measures to Meet Housing Needs of the Poor
- Allow low-income housing on 60 square meter plots, long and narrow, width to depth ratio 1:3, with permission to build ground plus 2-1/2 floors. The built-up area of the plots should be a maximum of 70 per cent and a density of 1500 to 2500 persons per hectare may be achieved

- Permit non-polluting commercial activity in the homes which does not generate heavy traffic.

- Create independent neighborhoods around open spaces rather than along streets through planning. Each neighborhood should not exceed 300 households.

- Take steps to lower land per unit costs, reduce infrastructure capital costs, increase densities and provide a better social environment such as:

- o Subsidized cost of low-income housing (through market mechanisms) through installments payable by poor households over a 15-year period.

- o Provision of core housing which can be increased incrementally by the owners. Alternatively, houses and/or apartments can be built which are finished externally and with properly completed water use areas. The rest of the house (plastering, flooring, painting, internal doors and windows) can be left to the owners

- o Strict enforcement of rules and regulations for proper targeting and prevention of speculation for a period of 15 years.

- o Initiating cross subsidized low-income housing/high-income commercial and residential development.

- Develop (and locate) low-income housing within the city through incentives to developers and landowners, and a market based approach for providing subsidies to low income groups.
- Follow the principle of providing better living and socio-economic conditions than what exist in the settlement at the time of its relocation for relocation of communities whose land is required for infrastructure development or urban projects. Follow the guidelines of the government of Pakistan's lapsed ordinance on this subject.

- Make the cut-off date rational and enforceable for all *katchi abadis* except where land is required for infrastructure. For relocation of affected *katchi abadi* dwellers, allocate land as near as possible to their original locations. To make this financially viable, a process of land sharing with developers and/or NGOs can be initiated on the pattern of the CODI and/or SPARC initiated programs in Bangkok and Bombay. *Katchi abadi* improvement and regularization must now move from provision of infrastructure to improving livability. This can be done by making these settlements more aesthetic and by providing government investments for improved social infrastructure (health/education). Provision through NGOs is not an option as its scale will never be able to cater to the need/demand. Many of the older settlements have already acquired water, sanitation and energy networks. The need here is for their improved management and operation.

High Density Mixed Housing Development

- Remove restriction on height of apartments for lower-middle and middle-income groups allowing a minimum density of 1,500 persons per hectare.

- Plan all commercial and office complexes mixed use with 30 per cent of the floor area reserved for residential and recreational purposes. Regulations for such areas should be developed as a result of an urban design exercise specific to the area in which such complexes are to be located. The urban design should develop recommendations for infrastructure, density, traffic and transport related issues. It is understood that expertise for urban design exercises are not available with most development and planning agencies. For these exercises help from relevant academic institutions should be sought.

- Do not allow any development scheme to have plots of over 400 square meters. If such plots are created then these should be heavily taxed to discourage such developments.

11. Urban Transport

Issues

Urban transport is a key factor in improving living conditions and lowering the cost of transportation and of doing business in the cities. Faced with numerous problems the sector is currently in a state of chaos. Briefly, the main issues are:

- Travelling between and within cities have increased manifold due to growth of population, increased economic activities and low density haphazard sprawl segregating homes from places of work.

- Due to bad traffic management, roads have become excessively congested. A striking feature is the increasing proportion of motor cycles (59 per cent of the total motor vehicles).

- The quality and quantity of public bus services has deteriorated since deregulation, and fares have become increasing unaffordable to the commuting public. The predominant mean of transport now is private vehicles (about 82 per cent).

- Inappropriate land use policies, mixed local and through traffic, road encroachments and use of poor quality fuel have aggravated congestion, delays and air pollution.
- Grandiose road building works take precedence over simpler traffic management solutions and often create more problems than resolving them.

- Inter city transport (goods and passenger) is overtaken by exceedingly costly and less efficient road transport than the railways.

- Public and public-private partnership programs have shown that without some form of subsidy, comfortable transport cannot be made affordable to the lower and lower-middle income groups in the cities.

The provision of public transport must be equated to the right of mobility and the non-availability of public transport or adequate public transport options must be understood to be a violation of fundamental rights. There should be coordination and harmony between land use planning, transport planning and traffic management.

Guidelines and Recommendations:

Due to an absence of affordable, flexible and comfortable transport, the number of motorbikes as an option is on the increase in Pakistan. The number of motorbikes, for example, in Karachi, has doubled in the last six years. The only problem with the promotion of motorbike use is that women do not drive motorbikes in Pakistan. This restriction can be overcome by the promotion of new societal values. In addition, there is a need to promote environmentally-friendly motorbikes and rules and regulations to cater to their traffic safety and parking related issues.

- Segregate local and through traffic, not only in large cities, but also in the intermediate and medium towns such as Sukkur, Gujranwala, Mingora, not through building bypasses alone, but by creating one-way systems and protecting institutional and cultural areas from through traffic and ensuring better enforcement.
- Segregate vehicular and pedestrian movements to remove congestion. For this, proper pedestrian-friendly footpaths are required in addition to car and motorcycle parking arrangements. However, public money should not be employed in building parking infrastructure for the benefit of private automobile owners. Instead, local governments should be encouraged to raise parking fees and promote taxi/public transport services.

- Adopt/consider Bus Rapid Transport options as opposed to rail-based systems on account of lower cost and the flexibility in selection and change of routes. Replace rolling stock for bus systems every six to seven years as opposed to thirty years for the train system.

- Consider floating of municipal bonds to raise funds for the financing of transportation systems.

- Give priority/precedence to transport projects/investments over road projects.

- Subsidize public transport fares for the urban poor. This can be this can be done by raising road tax on over 1300cc vehicles, adding an insurance surcharge for vehicles of over 1300cc,

removing duties on the import of buses, charging for advertising on transport vehicles and on bus stops.

12. Urban Environment

Issues

Increasing Urbanization accompanied by economic growth under 'growth first' strategy has placed urban environment--both built and natural--under tremendous stress. The growing degradation has adversely affected all environmental elements such as air, water, noise levels, sanitation, aesthetics and ecology. Human and nature have been affected in many ways. For example, health and safety has been threatened by air pollution--ambient as well as indoor-- water pollution and inadequate sanitation and drainage arrangements. Traffic congestion and pollution have impacted the urban economy and competitiveness. The level of urban amenity has scaled down due to air and water pollution, traffic congestion and unsanitary conditions. Diminishing agricultural land, loss of trees and green cover, and rampant encroachment on natural assets i.e., rivers, lakes, sea fronts and wood land, have caused irreversible loss to ecology.

A large number of poor people residing in informal settlements, *katchi abadis* and sub-standard *nai abadis* which do not have adequate access to clean water, sewage collection, waste disposal, safe household fuel, decent housing and healthcare facilities, are worst prey to environmental deterioration.

Changing life style, 'growth first' economic strategy and subsidized energy pricing have led to over use of energy resources in urban areas. Cities are now responsible for bulk of carbon gas releases in the atmosphere and rise in atmospheric warming.

Lack of effective application of environmental management techniques e.g., Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and (NEQSs) and deficiencies in the institutional and legal structures as envisioned under National Environment Policy 2006 have made cities 'havens of pollution'. On the one hand the polluters do not pay for the pollution they spread and, on the other, public investment tend to support their economic activities rather than clean their polluting consequences.

Guidelines and Recommendations

- Integrate Environmental Considerations in Urban Development Plans:
  This would not only mean incorporating environmental information, prevalent environmental policies, rules, regulations, EIA requirements in development plans but also subjecting urban

development plans to detailed environment impact assessment, including public hearing and scrutiny.

- Invest in Healthcare:

This would entail substantial increase in public funding in water and sanitation sectors and in the preventive and primary healthcare. This would also involve mobilizing public awareness against pollution and seeking public participation to control it.

- Recover Full Cost of Energy and Other Utility Services:

Measures in this regard are necessary to stop overuse and wastage of precious natural resources. Foremost measures include establishing correct and non-subsidized prices at national level and enhancing the level of cost recovery at local level.

- Make buildings more energy efficient by reducing the use of air-conditioners in summer and promoting solar water heaters in winter. Also, put in place CNG buses and mass transit systems in major cities to meet the mobility needs of the public and to reduce pollution caused by private vehicles. Since motorbikes are being added to urban roads in a big way, the manufacture and import of green motorbikes should be promoted.

- Promote compact, high density, mixed land use urban pattern, which is less automobile dependant, less expensive to serve with infrastructure and puts less pressure on surrounding green areas and other natural assets.

- Create urban eco-system by following practices such as the promotion of kitchen gardens, reuse and recycling of waste, provision of livelihood close to residents, rain harvesting, protection of gardens, parks, open spaces and green areas, and the creation of proper pathways for pedestrians and cyclists.

- Formulate environment management plan of towns and cities (covering DRR concerns as well) and mandatory environment impact assessment of all urban development projects.

- Pursue objectives of the 'Green City' initiative of Ministry of Environment as part of the UN Green Cities Declaration and Urban Environment Accord 2006.

13.   Urban Security

Issues

Security of life and property is one of the most basic functions of the state. This security is also related to prevention of accident through any form (fire, disaster, building collapse, terrorism

etc.). Human security in urban areas has worsened. This is due to a breakdown in law and order as well as a result of societal transformation from caste-based to class-based social structures. This situation has been further complicated by rent seeking urban elites and status seeking conservatives who have forcefully denied emergence of popular and regional institutions (especially cultural and political), and withheld the majority from enjoying human rights and liberties. Subsequently, legislation and implementation of new laws have suffered, leading to administrative failure.

Pakistan's patriarchal leadership is challenged by the young and women. This is a major cause of domestic violence and strife, including gender violence. There is direct conflict between the aggressively upwardly mobile lower-middle class and the entrenched rent seeking rich, which to a large extent is manifest in manipulation of the land and labor markets.

In response to a governance failure, interest groups, mafia and sectarian groups have emerged and made hostage majority of the people who have little or no resort to formal sector protection and services. The infighting among these groups over turf rights, extortions, etc., is major cause of security concerns.

International and strategic movements to secure international trade and capture local resources and markets clash and compete with each other in Pakistan. They fragment society, cause internal conflicts and encourage violence and disturbances.

Clan and ethnic relationships, in most cases, provide linkages with government institutions and political parties. This prevents the development of a truly democratic society and it also supports the development of vigilantes and gangs. It is common that young people are implicated in false cases and gang leaders bail them out and make them participate in gang activities.

Guidelines and Recommendations

- Provide a responsive governance system and efficient and accountable line departments. The creation of such a governance system and line departments cannot take place without political will and the creation of required and trained manpower, leadership and knowledge of the problems the people of Pakistan face in their daily lives.

- Review security arrangements provided to the officials of Pakistan's establishment so as to minimize the socio-economic disruption and alienation that the current procedures are creating. These arrangements cause hardship to urban dwellers, affect their livelihoods and healthcare systems.

Concluding Note

The Task Force vision is for the creation/transformation of Pakistan's urban areas into economically self-sustaining entities with high density mixed land-use areas. Furthermore, the Task Force believes that urban areas are places of culture, learning and ideas whose development is based on promoting livability, creativity, harmony and the well-being of citizens irrespective of class, gender and ethnicity. This vision can be achieved by removing constraints to investments and growth; creating job opportunities and the skills; providing space for culture, recreation and entertainment; developing affordable facilities for health, education, housing and transport; and creating democratic and participatory governance systems. The recommendations of the Task Force aim at promoting this vision and removing the existing constraints to make the implementation of this vision possible.

The Task Force is very well aware that for the implementation of its recommendations a federal urbanization policy will have to be enacted and followed up by the creation of provincial policies. The Task Force is also aware of the fact that policies in themselves do not bring about change. They require the development of rules, regulations and procedures and of governance institutions that can implement them. The creation of appropriately trained manpower is also required for the implementation of the recommendations of the Task Force. It is hoped that academic institutions dealing with administration, law, different aspects of urban planning, architecture and engineering, will come together to devise necessary courses for producing appropriately trained professionals, technicians and managers.

Continued research (especially field-based) is an important element in developing an understanding on how the Task Force recommendations can be implemented. For this, institutions that can involve interest groups and communities need to be created, nurtured and their procedures institutionalized over time. In addition, this research has to lead to informed decision making on the part of politicians and policy makers. For this, the role of the media, political parties and civil society is important. The space for their interaction needs to be created and made effective.

Institutions for the implementation of the Task Force recommendations already exist in most of the urban areas of Pakistan. However, they need to be managed by an appropriately trained and well-paid staff. They also require greater autonomy, freedom from damaging political and bureaucratic influence and interference, and a closer link with communities and interest groups that can make them transparent and accountable to the citizens of Pakistan.

Appendix

TO BE PUBLISHED IN THE GAZETTE OF PAKISTAN EXTRAORDINARY
GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN
PLANNING COMMISSION
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DIVISION

Islamabad, the 28th June, 2010

NOTIFICATION

No. 1(183)Admn-VI/PC/2008. The Deputy Chairman, Planning Commission has been pleased to constitute a Task Force on "Urban Development" with the following composition:

Mr. Arif Hasan	Chairman
37-D, Mohammad Ali Society, Karachi	
Mr. Ahmed Rafay Alam	Member
Advocate High Court	
1-Bawa Park, Upper Mall, Lahore.	
Mr. Shahid Kardar	Member
46-B, Gulberg-III, Lahore	
Ms. Nafeesa Shah	Member
Chairperson, NCHD, 14th - 15th Floor Shaheed-e-Millat Secretariat, Islamabad.	
Mr. Ghulam Mohy-ud-Din Mari	Member
Member Infrastructure, Planning Commission, Islamabad	
Dr. Noman Ahmed,	Member
Head of the Department of Architecture, NED University, Karachi.	
Arch. Shaukat Ali Sharar	Member
Shaukat Associates, Near Girls College, Saidu Sharif, Swat.	
Mr. Maqbool Ilahi,	Member/
Urban Development Specialist, Planning Commission, Islamabad	Secretary

2.　　　Terms of Reference (TORs) of the above said Task Force are at Annexed. The Task Force may co-opt by consensus any other member.

(Ayaz Hasan Zuberi)
Section Officer

The Manager
Printing Corporation of Pakistan Press
University Road, Karachi - 5.

Co-opted Members:

1. Prof Dr. Nuzhat Ahmad
   Director, AER Center, Karachi.
2. Mr. Muhammad Fazal Noor
   Urban Development Specialist, UNDP, Islamabad.
3. Dr. Asif Qayyum Qureshi
   Specialist Environment, Planning Commission, Islamabad
4. Mr. Imitaz Ahmad Vohra
   Chief, PP&H Section, Planning Commission, Islamabad.

National Task Force on Urban Development

Terms of Reference

Planning Commission has established a Task Force on Urban Development to devise a consensus urban reform agenda and list of priority projects, whose implementation in the coming years shall ensure realization of the following national objectives:

Cities to become strong: livable, prosperous and functional in all dimensions- physical, social, economic and improved governance.

Cities to become competitive and perform their historic role as engine of economic growth.

Develop quality infrastructure that supports urban development.

Review land use, building regulations, governance and planning to see:

how competitive cities are;
how compatible they are with growth;
how attractive they are for investment;
how inclusive they are.

Cities to be well managed and governed with empowered institutions to enhance business, community and knowledge.

Creation of new knowledge to understand and resolve urban issues.

Other national objectives.

The Task Force will also review available analytical work on urban development sector for Pakistan, including the work done by the Working Group on Urban Development constituted by the Planning Commission for the preparation of 10th Five Year Plan.