MIGRATION AND SMALL TOWNS IN PAKISTAN

IIED Workshop, London, 18 – 19 November 2008

Arif Hasan
Email: arifhasan@cyber.net.pk
PAKISTAN: POLITICAL STRUCTURE

- Federation of four provinces
- Provinces divided into districts
- Districts (103) divided into union councils
- Union council (6,022) population 5,000 to 70,000
- Larger cities: city districts divided into towns
- Districts, sub-districts, union councils headed by elected nazims (mayors) and naib (deputy) nazims
- 33 per cent of all seats reserved for women
Pakistan: Population Size, Rural – Urban Ratio and Growth Rate, 1901-1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Population (in '000)</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
<th>Annual Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>16,577</td>
<td>14,958</td>
<td>1,619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>18,805</td>
<td>17,116</td>
<td>1,689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>20,243</td>
<td>18,184</td>
<td>2,058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1931</td>
<td>22,640</td>
<td>19,871</td>
<td>2,769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1941</td>
<td>28,244</td>
<td>24,229</td>
<td>4,015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1951</td>
<td>33,740</td>
<td>27,721</td>
<td>6,019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>42,880</td>
<td>33,240</td>
<td>9,640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>65,309</td>
<td>48,715</td>
<td>16,594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>84,253</td>
<td>61,270</td>
<td>23,583</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>130,580</td>
<td>87,544</td>
<td>43,036</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Prepared from Population Census Reports, Government of Pakistan
POVERTY

• Human Development Index (UNDP 2006) : 134 out of 177 countries

• National poverty line : 32.6 per cent

• Poverty incidents has increased post-1992

• Gender related development rank (UNDP 2006) 105 out of 177 countries

• Gender empowerment measures rank : 66 out of 177 countries

• Impact of structural adjustment, WTO regime and globalisation

• Unequal development
GOVERNMENT POVERTY ALLEVIATION PROGRAMMES

- Katchi Abadi Improvement and Regularisation Programme
- Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund
- Khushal Pakistan Fund
- Khushali Bank
- Peoples Housing Programme
PAKISTAN – A COUNTRY OF MIGRANTS

The development of the Punjab canal colonies:

• British developed perennial irrigation schemes: 1872 – 1929
• 4.5 million hectares brought under cultivation
• Local pastural population rebels and are suppressed
• 1.2 million peasants imported from Eastern Punjab
• Repercussions:
  - Marginalisation of local people
  - Change in language, food and dress
  - Differences between “locals” and “settlers”
  - Loss of forests and pasture lands along all the major river
THE 1947 MIGRATION FROM INDIA

• 4.7 million Sikhs and Hindus leave Pakistan

• 6.5 million poor Muslims migrate from India to Pakistan

• In 1951 Census 48 per cent of urban population were migrants from India

• Massive increase in urban populations in Sindh and Punjab

• Massive de-urbanisation in NWFP and Balochistan

• The special case of Sindh
THE IMPACT OF THE 1947 MIGRATION

• The socio-economic impact
  – Break-up caste and community organisations
  – Social and economic mobility (challo culture)
  – Ethnic tensions and their political repercussions
  – Challenging of the old feudal system

• The physical impact
  – Degradation of inner cities
  – Informal settlements and tolerance towards them
  – Occupation of shamlaat lands
  – Destruction of built-heritage

• The case of Sindh
  – The battle for turf
Karachi: Demographic Change Due to Partition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1941</th>
<th>1951</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>1,137,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi spoken as mother tongue (percent)</td>
<td>61.2</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu spoken as mother tongue (per cent)</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindu population (per cent)</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim population (per cent)</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Prepared from *Population Census Reports*, Government of Pakistan
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>12.08</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>78.68</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>78.18</td>
<td>73.6</td>
<td>80.12</td>
<td>78.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pushto</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baluchi</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahvi</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindko</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siraiki</td>
<td>14.90</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>17.90</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>6.28</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>22.64</td>
<td>21.05</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>49.68</td>
<td>41.48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>7.69</td>
<td>6.99</td>
<td>4.38</td>
<td>2.68</td>
<td>12.05</td>
<td>11.52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pushto</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>6.48</td>
<td>7.96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi</td>
<td>52.40</td>
<td>59.73</td>
<td>78.23</td>
<td>92.02</td>
<td>18.28</td>
<td>25.79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baluchi</td>
<td>4.51</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>5.63</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>2.74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahvi</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindko</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siraiki</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>5.97</td>
<td>4.93</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>8.65</td>
<td>8.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N.W.F.P.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>2.24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pushto</td>
<td>68.30</td>
<td>73.9</td>
<td>68.64</td>
<td>25.07</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baluchi</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>36.31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahvi</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>20.68</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindko</td>
<td>18.13</td>
<td></td>
<td>18.14</td>
<td>8.29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siraiki</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>7.59</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>8.77</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Prepared by Masooma Mohib</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MIGRATION AS A RESULT OF INDO-PAKISTAN WARS

- The 1948 Kashmir war
  - The end of feudal control
  - Social and economic mobility
  - Migration to the UK
  - Migration to Karachi and dependence on remittances

- The 1965 and 1971 wars and the Pakistan and India occupation of areas of the Thar Desert
  - Migration of Hindu upper castes
  - Collapse of traditional community organisations and punchayats
  - Social economic mobility and rise of the artisan castes
  - Environmental degradation
  - The role of NGOs
  - Occupation of over 30 per cent of pasture lands
THE AFGHAN MIGRATION AND ITS REPERCUSSIONS

- Between 1981 – 1994 3.7 million Afghan refugees came to Pakistan
- Repercussions
  - Peshawar growth rate increased to 9.2 per cent (1961-72) from 1.9 per cent (1961-1972)
  - Quetta growth rate increased to 7.2 per cent (1961-1972) from 3.44 per cent (1961-1972)
  - The khashinof and heroine culture
  - Link of real estate and drugs
  - Subservience of the state to it
  - The Koochi (Pavanda) issue
  - Afghan control on earth works and transport
  - 600,000 Afghans settled in Karachi
  - The Afghans and the garbage recycling business in Karachi
  - The fundamentalist liberal conflict
BENGALI AND BURMEES MIGRATIONS IN KARACHI

• 300,000 Bengladeshis and Burmees live in Karachi

• They work in the fishing industry

• They are resented by the locals and discriminated against by the administration

• 200,000 Bengladeshi women trafficked to Pakistan in the last 10 years

• Illegal migrants from Bangladesh and Burma elected as councillors in 2005 local elections

• 50 per cent live in informal settlements along the coast
MIGRATION SCALE AND PATTERNS

Scale:
- 10.8 million Pakistanis or 8 per cent of total population are migrants
- 36.7 per cent have migrated to urban areas
- 25 per cent have migrated to Karachi, Lahore and Rawalpindi
- 13 per cent have migrated to Karachi alone
- Migration to other countries is 23.99 per cent of total migrants

Patterns (migration from deprived areas):
- 14.72 per cent from Punjab though Punjab is 55.6 per cent of Pakistan’s population
- 11.67 per cent from NWFP though NWFP is 13.4 per cent of Pakistan’s population
- 2.6 per cent from Sindh though Sindh is 23 per cent of Pakistan’s population
- Migration population in Punjab from other provinces was 1.6 per cent, Sindh 7.4 per cent, NWFP 3 per cent and Balochistan 5.1 per cent
- The large migrant figures in NWFP and Balochistan are because of Afghan refugees
### SOURCES OF URBAN GROWTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Natural Increase</th>
<th>Re-classification</th>
<th>Internal Migration</th>
<th>Total Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1951 – 61</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>40.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961 – 72</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972 – 81</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>78.4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>70.3</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>74.2</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>70.6</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>NWFP</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>43.7</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>37.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981 – 98</td>
<td>Islamabad</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Iffat Ara and Arshad Zaman, Asian Urbanization in the New Millennium, Country Chapter, Unpublished work, August 2002
## CAUSES OF MIGRATION

**Migrant Population by Reason of Migration: 1998 Census**

(In Percent)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administrative Unit</th>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Marriage</th>
<th>Move with Head</th>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Employ-ment / Transfer</th>
<th>Returning Home</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>17.10</td>
<td><strong>42.78</strong></td>
<td>8.75</td>
<td>12.08</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>16.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>24.54</td>
<td><strong>38.39</strong></td>
<td>9.84</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>21.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>12.88</td>
<td><strong>45.28</strong></td>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>16.70</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>14.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.W.F.P.</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>8.87</td>
<td>57.51</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>16.53</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>7.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>9.58</td>
<td>61.8</td>
<td>10.19</td>
<td>5.03</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>11.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>8.37</td>
<td>54.53</td>
<td>5.02</td>
<td>24.53</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>4.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>22.64</td>
<td>38.00</td>
<td>8.72</td>
<td>9.06</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>19.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>28.35</td>
<td>34.27</td>
<td>9.46</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>23.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>17.41</td>
<td>41.41</td>
<td>8.04</td>
<td>14.75</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>15.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>8.67</td>
<td>49.13</td>
<td>9.12</td>
<td>15.78</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>15.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>7.05</td>
<td>58.53</td>
<td>10.95</td>
<td>7.80</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>14.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>8.85</td>
<td>48.09</td>
<td>8.91</td>
<td>16.66</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>15.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>5.33</td>
<td>43.85</td>
<td>12.34</td>
<td>24.15</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>12.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td>37.07</td>
<td>17.41</td>
<td>23.02</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td></td>
<td>16.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>5.75</td>
<td>47.43</td>
<td>9.67</td>
<td>24.75</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>9.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamabad</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>53.42</td>
<td>7.06</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>8.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>5.86</td>
<td>54.94</td>
<td>11.82</td>
<td>9.93</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>52.99</td>
<td>5.76</td>
<td>25.03</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>7.42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Reference to a very small proportion.

Source: Pakistan Census Organisation, 1998
SOCIO-ECONOMIC CAUSES OF RURAL-URBAN MIGRATION

- Change from a barter to a cash economy
- The green revolution technologies of the 1950’s and 1960’s
- The collapse of the caste system and the socio-economic mobility of the artisanal castes
- The Suzuki revolution and its repercussions
- New power structures in the rural areas
- Industrialisation and public works in the urban areas
- Education of children and freedom from social stress and marginalisation
- Going back to buying land in village of origin (case study)
PROCESS OF MIGRATION

• Vast majority helped by friends and relatives in the urban areas

• The role of employers in supporting their employees

• Initially they live with family members, then rent accommodation

• When job is secure they may invite family and look for a space in a katchi abadi

• Tribal people seldom bring their families

• Domestic servants have problems bringing their families

• With savings they establish small businesses and so their children become urbanites

• Ethnic organisations establish reception centres, food and jobs for people from their area. This strengthens their political power
PHYSICAL, SOCIAL AND POLITICAL IMPACT OF MIGRATION

Physical Impact:

- Formation of katchi abadis and informal settlements in urban areas

- Environmental degradation of inner cities where wholesale markets and built-cultural heritage co-exist in urban areas

- Building of improved housing in the rural areas changing the rural built-environment; moving from village to farmlands

- Piped water schemes, drainage schemes, development programmes, pushed by the more affluent families
THE SOCIO-POLITICAL IMPACT

• On rural society
  - Greater social and economic mobility
  - Products produced by artisanal castes replaced by industrially produced goods
  - Major changes in folk festivities and traditions
  - Changes in gender relations
  - Families receiving remittances no longer interested in agriculture
  - Educated people migrate for good
  - Changed in crockery, food, dress, dowry
  - Weakening of feudal hold on the economy

• On urban society
  - “Ruralisation” of urban areas
  - Very little difference where the society is not multi-ethnic
  - Where societies are multi-ethnic like in Karachi, strong ethnic organisations emerge to protect the interests of their members
  - They seek support from the public representatives of their places of origin to solve their problems
  - They become powerful players in the political process in the city
EMIGRATION

Causes of Emigration:

Majority from the poorer districts of Pakistan but substantial minority from the intermediate districts

Emigrants not the poorest of the poor since to migrate you require funds, information, higher level of education, access to networks

Most emigrants have non-farm livelihoods unlike migrants

Young Pakistanis wish to migrate (reasons)

Demand for Pakistani doctors and IT persons in USA and UK

per cent (4,359 persons) of all doctors trained in 2001-02 migrated in 2005

per cent of IT graduates applied for jobs abroad

People migrate to escape from the religious intolerance
SCALE

- Number of Pakistani emigrants is 3.83 million
- Major differences in estimates
- Official figures for US 200,000, unofficial figures 700,000
- Highest migration from NWFP rainfed areas
DESTINATION

- Saudi Arabia 60.96 per cent
- Gulf 28.128 per cent
- Europe and Far East 1.47 per cent

Reasons for destination:

- Major industrial zones being developed in Saudi Arabia and Gulf
- Demand for skilled and unskilled Pakistani labour and professionals
- In 1991, Pakistani migrants 78,093. In 2006, Pakistani migrants 184,279
- Strong religious and social bonds which create friendships
- Well received even though there are no laws to protect them
- Emigration to Europe mostly illegal and dangerous
- New openings in Japan, Korea and Malaysia
IMPACT OF REMITTANCES ON PAKISTAN’S ECONOMY

• Worker’s remittances have played an important role in Pakistan’s real GDP growth

• Years when remittances were low, such as 1999, (1.7 per cent of GDP) real GDP growth was also low (3.9 per cent)

• When they were high such as in 2002-03 (6.7 per cent of GDP) real GDP growth was also high (5.1 per cent)

• GDP growth is positively related to worker’s remittances which are the third important source of capital for economic growth in Pakistan

• Without worker’s remittances, the exchange rate, monitory and fiscal policies would come under pressure

• After 9/11 sharp increase in remittances from the US from 8.1 per cent of total remittances in 1999 to 12.4 per cent in 2000 to 32.6 per cent in 2002

• This was because of US crack down on informal processes of remittances and because the Pakistanis in the US felt insecure
SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPACT OF FOREIGN REMITTANCES

• No long term benefit
• Much of the remittances spend on gadgets for the house (flush toilets, washing machines)
• Physical improvements and additions to the house
• Better food for the family while the emigrant is away
• Better education for children if private schools are available
• Surveys in two poor districts show that remittances are the third most important source of livelihood
• Artisans are the only ones who seem to have invested in their businesses when they return
• Break-up of extended families
• Change in gender relations (wife or mother manage the funds)
• Remittance money and knowledge had played an important role in natural disaster mitigation and reconstruction
• Serious issues: camel-kids and prostitution
• 95 per cent of all emigrants are men
• The Makran Coast phenomena
• Emigrants are seem as role models
• Buildings on farmlands in rural areas and small towns
EMIGRANT ORGANISATIONS

• Doctors’ associations abroad, example, Association of Pakistani Physicians of North America. Big investments in health care and schools but almost all of them in the major towns

• Ethnic organisations such as the World Sindhi Congress working for promotion of their languages and culture and against the centrally organised Pakistan state

• Overseas Pakistanis Foundation; an autonomous organisation which works with the Government of Pakistan and has a large membership. It helps the families of migrants, runs schools and health-care systems for them, has investment programmes and newsletters and radio
EMIGRATION AND REMITTANCE PROCESSES

- **Legal Emigration:**
  - Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment (since 1970)
  - Recruiting agencies do not follow laws
  - Overseas Employment Corporation (company)
  - Has a resume bank of over 192,000 CVs. Also does training
  - Sanctioned jobs for emigrants in UAE/Gulf

- **Informal Means:**
  - Go to visit a friend, go on pilgrimage, get a job, get a permit
  - Better terms less costs
  - 46 per cent of migrants took this route in 2004

- **Illegal Emigration:**
  - To Europe through North Africa and Turkey and the role of pilgrimage in it
  - Deaths and fraud common
  - Through Thailand to the Far East. Safer
  - Relations worry
  - Photo change passports

- Informal systems preferred
  - Hundi
  - Hawala
  - Friends carry cash
  - Informal agents provide this service
THE RESPONSE OF THE STATE

- Bureau of Emigration and Overseas Employment
- Overseas Employment Corporation
- Overseas Employees Promoters
- Overseas Pakistani Foundation
- Foreign Exchange Bearer Certificates
- No bank charges on remittances
- Exemption for custom duties
- Introduction of the National Identity Cards for overseas Pakistanis
SMALL TOWNS IN HISTORY

• Small towns developed along the trade routes between large towns that were usually on rivers at a location where crossing was possible.

• After colonisation the India-Central Asia and over land Middle East trade came to an end so the small trade route towns died.

• As a result of colonial policies, there was massive de-urbanisation.

• With perennial irrigation new market towns developed on the railway links created by the British and port cities became important and developed due to trade with Britain.

• Exploitation of forests and mining for commercial purposes by the state ended the control communities over these resources.
THE FUTURE OF SMALL TOWNS

- Demographic changes have had an impact on the political and economic power of small towns

- In 1951, 45.10 per cent Pakistanis lived in 198 cities of less than 50,000 while 17.7 per cent Pakistanis lived in cities of above one million

- In 1998, 49.7 per cent Pakistanis lived in million plus cities and only 27.7 per cent lived in 418 cities of less than 50,000 or below

- Figures show that the political and economic power of small towns is on the decline
THREE TOWNS CHOSEN FOR THE STUDY

• Three towns are very different from each other

• Mithi is a town in the deprived desert region of Tharparkar and has a population of 50,000. It is expanding because of the creation of a road network that is linking it with nearby Karachi.

• Uch is an ancient town linked to important religious mystic universities and shrines. It has been bypassed by the new highways. Its population in 1998 Census was 20,350.

• Chiniot is also an ancient town and the centre of furniture and carpentry. It is booming in economic terms and is located in a rich agricultural zone in the Punjab. Its population in the 1998 Census was 169,282.

• Growth rate of Uch and Chiniot is well below the urban national average.
SIMILARITIES BETWEEN THE THREE TOWNS

• Before British rule all land belonged to the state. It was divided into agricultural land, community land, non-productive land and sub-categories related to these definitions.

• All productive land was given to dignitaries for the farming of revenues with the support of the state bureaucracy. This position was not hereditary.

• Community land was managed by the punchayats or jirgas.

• The British made the old dignitaries and those who were loyal to them into hereditary landlords and the once independent peasants became the new serfs.

• The nexus between the new landlords and the deputy commissioner became the new power structure.

• The merchant community (castes) who had considerable power before also became subservient to the new political system.
MITHI

Demography:

- Mithi was established as a settlement some 500 years ago
- Its population in 1998 was only 19,524. Today it has a population of more than 50,000
- The reason for this increase is that Mithi was declared the headquarters of the newly created desert district of Tharparkar in 1992
- The reason for declaring it a district was because of pressure from its politicians who justified such a move on the basis of an increase in population and on difficulties of travelling to Mirpurkhas, the district headquarters before the Tharparkar district was created
- Population of Mithi has also increased because of road building projects that have linked the town with the other desert settlements and the irrigated areas of the Indus plains
- Due to this, jobs have been created and a large number of businesses and desert tourism has developed
Socio-political Change

• Because of the war with India, due to which large areas of Tharparkar were occupied by Pakistan in 1965 and by India in 1971, the old Hindu dominated caste and feudal system collapsed, with the result that the artisanal castes were freed from serfdom.

• Since they, unlike the peasants and herdsmen, possessed skills that were required by the urban economy, many of them became economically well-off and have subsequently become doctors, lawyers and NGO activists who are involved in the political and development affairs of Mithi.

• The breakdown of the old feudal system has also meant that families are now free to migrate to Mithi from the rural areas.

• Due to famine because of recurring drought (the result of the collapse of the old feudal system of resource management) rural families are heavily indebted.

• Jobs in the urban areas have been a way of repaying the debt. Migration to Mithi has also been triggered due to the desire of rural families (now freed from serfdom), especially the artisanal castes, to educate their children and have better civic facilities, especially for the education of girls, which are not available in the rural areas.

• There are cases of migration where entire clans have migrated enmass to Mithi for these reasons.
Land Ownership And Migration To Mithi From Rural Areas

- Migration has also been facilitated by the fact that considerable amount of land around Mithi is controlled by the state.

- This makes it easy for migrants to negotiate with government officials to occupy land for the creation of informal settlements.

- The migrants feel that if they make sufficient investments in building their homes and in acquiring utilities (such as electricity) it will be difficult for the state to evict them.

- State control of land has also made it possible for bureaucrats and elected representatives to allocate land for different civic functions without going through the long, difficult and legal process of land acquisition.

- In this case, Mithi is luckier than many other small towns.
Governance Issues

• Before decentralisation and devolution in 2003, the Mithi merchant and the newly created professionals and NGO representatives had a good working relationship with the local bureaucracy.

• After devolution the elected representatives became more powerful and the involvement of “civil society” in the affairs of Mithi has declined.

• Many positive decisions were taken by the bureaucracy and government land in key locations for important civic facilities was allocated.

• The elected representatives, in some cases, shifted the allocation to less valuable sites and sold the old allocations to their families and supporters at throw away prices.
Migration From Mithi To Other Urban Areas

- Families and individuals have migrated from Mithi to Karachi and other Sindh cities

- This migration has catered to the demand created by the building of roads, petrol and CNG stations, and small tea shops and utility stores that have sprung up to serve the newly created transport sector

- A large number of Tharis are also working as tailors in the garment industry in Karachi and as domestic servants in the larger Sindh cities

- In addition, people send their children for higher education to Karachi and other Sindh towns

- An increasing number of educated Tharis are now working in the NGO sector in Pakistan
Repercussions Of Migration

• Because of the trends mentioned above, there has been a major social revolution in Tharparkar

• People of different castes now eat together in violation of Hindu religious requirements and local Muslim tradition. Kohli (an aboriginal caste and hence untouchable) girls now work in the homes of the upper castes

• Money from the larger cities has not been invested productively

• Most of it has been used for building or improving houses and in creating shopping “plazas” whereas previously only neighbourhood shops existed

• In the rural areas agriculture has declined and there too much of remittance money has been spent on building urban style homes, acquiring crockery and gadgetry, especially mobile phones and motorbikes which are fast replacing camels and donkeys

• Families who do not receive remittances are the “new” poor. They are increasingly being employed to work the land for the new rich who because of remittance money have lost interest in agriculture and herding

• Dress and food has also changed and is becoming similar to that of the urban areas

• As one Thari put it “before we ate what we produced, now we sell what we produce and buy what we eat”

• Traditional festivities such as music, dance and weddings and religious celebrations have also undergone a change and have acquired urban characteristics
UCH

History:

• History goes back to 800 BC
• By the 12th century, the city had become one of the most important cultural and religious centres of the Islamic world and attracted Sufi scholars and thinkers to its seminaries.
• The town is divided into two main quarters.
• The oldest quarter is Uch Bokhari. It is named after Hazrat Syed Jalaluddin Bokhari, a Sufi saint of the 13th century. His shrine is located in the quarter and his descendents are its keepers.
• The other quarter is known as Uch Jilani after another important Sufi saint who taught in Uch in the 15th century. His descendents are the keepers of his shrine.
• The town is visited by pilgrims and for festivities related to the birthdays of the saints by people from all over Pakistan and also from India.
• The descendents of the two pirs (saints), Bokhari and Jilani, have dominated the political and spiritual life of the town and the adjoining areas.
• The shrines bring them considerable income and they own large agricultural estates gifted by the British on the outskirt of the town.
Process Of Change And Migration:

• In the decade of the 1960’s, green revolution technologies were introduced in the Punjab. As a result, middlemen pushing loans, fertiliser and pesticide agencies, tractors, mechanised transport and tube wells came into existence.

• The traditional merchant classes (Shaikhs) benefited as a result since they became the agents and financers to the smaller producers in the rural areas. They established businesses in Uch.

• These businesses required extension agents, mechanics, vehicle drivers, links with the larger cities from where the supplies of the green revolution technologies originated and accountants.

• As a result an increasing number of people, mainly from the merchants and artisanal castes, from the rural areas migrated to Uch.

• The increasing affluence of the Shaikhs encouraged them to send their children to school and for higher education.

• Migration of artisans from the rural areas was also the result of the introduction of industrially produced agricultural implements, textiles, shoes and utensils.

• Goldsmiths, which were present in all rural areas and in Uch also migrated to other cities. This is because gold jewellery was a form of savings and was pawned for acquiring loans in times of need and for agriculture. Bank loans and bonds in the 1970’s replaced this ancient system.
Merchant Communities

• The merchant communities have become increasingly affluent due to education (which have given the younger generation lucrative jobs in other cities) and because of the expansion of cotton cultivation and production around Uch.

• However, they have not been able to wrest political power from the old elite. This has been an additional disincentive for them to develop social and community facilities in the town.

• A number of persons have also emigrated to France, Australia, Saudia and the UAE. The reasons for migration of the business classes are for education and for better financial options.

• There has been a large scale migration of artisans to the UAE for working in the building industry as electricians and masons. According to rough estimates about 5 per cent families in Uch have persons working abroad.
Remittance Investments

- Local remittances have been invested in improving homes and acquiring household gadgetry, furniture and crockery. Foreign remittances have been invested in building lavish new homes in the housing estates being developed by the pirs on their lands adjacent to the city.

- According to estate agents, more than 40 per cent of the plots in these housing estates have been purchased by remittance from abroad.

- Even larger investment has been made in real estate by Uch emigrants in the larger Punjab cities and in the provincial capital.

- What has emerged from conversations with various Uch residents is that migrants within Pakistan normally do not save enough to make such investments.

- These investments are also made by persons who are not emigrants but are involved in the lucrative fertiliser and pesticide business or by middlemen engaged in financing the agriculture of the cotton crop, its storage, transportation and sale. These are few in number.
Land

- Since land around the city is owned by the influential families, badly needed civic facilities can only be acquired if they donate that land.

- A land use and structural plan prepared for the city by the NGO Conservation and Rehabilitation Centre, can only take place if land donation takes place or it is acquired through the land acquisition act.

- As the two influential families are the local government representatives of Uch, they are unlikely to undertake the process required for land acquisition.

- In the absence of a rational land use plan which has legal authority, the town continues to expand haphazardly, mostly consisting of real estate developments catering to the better-off residents (many of whom receive remittances from abroad) and informal settlements on unproductive land.
History and Social Relations:

• Chiniot is one of the oldest towns of the Punjab and is famous for the folk romances of Sohni-Mahiwal and Heer-Ranjha

• The town has a continuous recorded history since the Sanskrit epic Mahabharta was penned in 800 BC

• In history the town is famous for its wood carving, ornate masonry and brass work

• Due to the absence of families like the pirs of Uch in the district, there are less caste barriers and much more social mobility than at Uch and its surroundings

• However, there are powerful landlords established by land grants from the British
• The town has always had a very affluent merchant class of Muslim Shaikhs and Hindu Banias, born out of centuries of trade and commerce, especially related to the timber business

• Today, the Shaikhs dominate the textile industry in Pakistan but their mills are in Karachi and Faisalabad where better infrastructure and investment policies were available and where they could be free of the domination of the landlords
The Timber Business

- The masons and carpenters of Chiniot belong to the traditional artisanal castes

- Their profession has been hereditary but today through an apprentice system people of other castes are also becoming carpenters and masons

- However, the businesses and investments related to these trades are financially controlled by the Shaikhs

- The Chinioti workshops and investors produce furniture for the elite of Pakistan and receive orders from Europe, Middle East, Japan and the USA. They participate in international exhibitions. As a result of this, there are a number of foreign banks and insurance companies in the town

- The Middle East construction boom in the 1970’s led to a big demand for carpenters and masons in the UAE and later in Saudi Arabia

- Chiniot artisans migrated to these countries in large numbers and as a result lifestyles changed and an affluent class of artisans was created leading to the setting up of shops and workshops in Karachi, Islamabad and Lahore

- Artisans who migrated have invested their savings in the purchase of mechanised tools for their workshops. This has improved their production capacity and capability but it has created problems for those artisans who do not have mechanised tools

- In the 100 plus workshops in Chiniot more than 2,000 artisans are employed which does not include unskilled labour or those working in the transport related activities
Reasons for migration to chiniot and its repercussions

- People from the rural areas and the small towns have come here to learn carpentry and masonry skills or to work as labour in the building industry.

- The other reason is for the education of children.

- The biggest problem people face is that since there is no government land, it is difficult to form katchi abadis where they can live.

- As a result, densification of the existing low income formal settlements and katchi abadis is taking place and rental accommodation is very much in demand.

- In the inner city which has beautiful traditional architecture changes are taking place. Since the old timber market and workshops are located in the inner city, their expansion is also taking place over there.

- As a result, the affluent residents of the inner city are moving out to the new housing estates in the suburbs and their homes are being taken over by workshops and storage for timber and furniture.
Reasons For And Process Of Migration From Chiniot

• The major reason given for migration and emigration from Chiniot is the demand for carpenters in the Middle East, Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad

• Also, since large orders are being received from these larger cities of Pakistan, Chiniot entrepreneurs have established workshops and showrooms in these larger cities. In these workshops Chiniot artisans are employed and many of them have taken their families with them

• The process of migration in Chiniot is through family, friends and agents. It is all well-organised since the process and systems related to it are understood and the links with the Middle East and with the larger cities of Pakistan well established through a long association
Land And Labour Issues

- Industries are being established on the outskirts of Chiniot. Most of these are agri-industries and are of small and medium size.

- The labour for the new industries in Chiniot is being imported from the northern districts of Punjab or from the NWFP.

- The reason for this is that the industrialists fear that local labour will organise trade unionism and will press for the minimum wage law to be imposed. Most of this labour is male only and in the slack season returns home for a few months.

- Almost all of it is accommodated in make shift huts within the factory premises or in its immediate vicinity on privately-owned land informally rented for this purpose by the factory owners or belonging to them. As such, there is no question of security of tenure for these make shift homes.

- A number of housing schemes are being built on the outskirts of Chiniot as joint ventures between developers and the owners of agricultural land.

- The middle classes and the wealthier artisans are investing in them. Real estate agents claim that a sizeable number of plots in these schemes are being purchased by remittance money.

- The new schemes are not clan, caste or ethnically homogenous unlike the old traditional neighbourhood of Chiniot since allocation in them is primarily commercial in nature.
BROAD CONCLUSIONS

- Remittances from abroad have had a positive impact on Pakistan’s economy. Without these remittances the exchange rate and monetary and fiscal policies would come under great pressure.

- These remittances have not had much of an impact on the local economy and have been used mainly for building real estate, improving lifestyles, purchasing gadgetry and for better education purposes.

- In locations, such as Chiniot, where skills and entrepreneurship already existed, they have been used for tools for business purposes, but in the less developed areas of Pakistan from where most emigration has taken place, this is not a case.

- Pakistanis from abroad have invested in the social sectors but this has not made any substantial difference to the provision of social sector facilities in the areas from where people have migrated.

- The connections that the migrants have created in the urban areas, help them out in times of crisis such as floods, earthquakes and droughts.
• The connections that the migrants have created in the urban areas, help them out in times of crisis such as floods, earthquakes and droughts

• Remittances have reduced the importance of and interest in agriculture and created a new underclass of agricultural landless labour who now work on the farms of the migrants

• Emigration and migration has promoted education, more liberal values, emancipation of women and promotion of NGO activity

• They have led to the break-up of the extended family and clan institutions, promoted a rich and poor divide at the local level and also an immense desire in the population to go abroad since migrants and their families have become role models for the rest of society

• Due to in-migration from the rural areas, under-serviced informal settlements are developing in the small towns. Where these settlements are on state land, there is hope for their regularisation
• In towns where state land does not exist, densification of katchi abadis and the inner cities is taking place and causing environmental degradation and social fragmentation

• Local government of towns which have state land can also plan their development and expansion. However, towns that do not have state land have to go through the long process of land acquisition which is not supported by the powerful landowning political families

• With the inculcation of education and better lifestyles, the younger generation of families whose members have migrated or emigrated, wish to live in the larger cities because of the better physical and social environment over there. As a result, the areas from where they move lose political power, future civil society leadership and professionals

• In spite of a change of values and the emergence of an economically more powerful business community in the small towns, political power rests firmly with the traditional land owning elites
• A number of issues need to be addressed regarding the processes and repercussions of migration. These include:
  
  – Corruption by agents needs to be controlled and costs of migration need to be reduced
  
  – Trafficking and the processes leading to bonded labour needs to be controlled and the problems associated with illegal migration, which results in deaths and exploitation require efforts by both the countries where the migrants come and the host countries
  
  – Much more needs to be done in opening avenues for productive investment of remittances and for the protection of the human rights migrants in the countries to which they migrate

• And the most important aspect of migration is summed up by an Urdu couplet

  “Those who have gone to the towns to study have forgotten Whose mother sold how much of her jewellery to make it possible”