

Presentation on Local Government

Aurat Foundation, Karachi Workshop Held on 21 November 2011

By
Arif Hasan

When Mehnaz asked me I told her that I was

- No expert
- Cannot present a solution
- But I worked all over Pakistan with local government
- Documented development, demographic and social change issues. They are present in a number of my books
- I said I would talk about ground realities in a short talk and then we could have a discussion

A. KARACHI-SINDH RELATIONS

1. Karachi 1998

	Lahore
- 62% of Sindh's urban population	22% of Punjab's
- 30% of the province population	7% of Punjab's
- 22% of the urban population of Pakistan	12% of urban Pakistan
2. Karachi-Sindh Economy: Karachi dominates
 - Large scale industrial sector employs
 - 71.6% of total labour force in Sindh
 - 74.8% of total industrial output is produced in Karachi
 - 78% of formal private sector jobs are in Karachi
3. Federal Government Interests: KPT / Customs / CAA / Port Qasim / Armed forces/ Railways
 - Contains 32% of total Pakistani industrial establishment
 - Generates 15% GDP
 - 25% federal revenues
 - 62% income tax

In addition most important health and educational public and private institutions are in Karachi. So is the provincial headquarters.

- Strong city means city / province conflict in the best of countries. Bombay was pointed out

B. DEMOGRAPHIC CONFLICT

1. Karachi

	1941	1981	1998
- Local languages	73%	11.03%	13.67%
- Urdu	6.2%	54.34%	48.52%
- Pushto	-	8.7%	11.42%
- Punjabi	2.8%	13.64%	14%

2. Sindh
 - Local languages 92% 60.27% 62.64% (R=93 U=30)
 - Urdu 2% 22.64% (U=50) 21.05% (U=42)
 - Pushto 3.06% 4.19%
 - Punjabi 7.69% 7%

3. Other Provinces
 - Sindh: Local languages 63% Urdu 21.05%
 - Punjab: Local languages 94% Urdu 4.5%
 - NWFP: Local languages 92% Urdu 1%
 - Balochistan: Local languages 82% Urdu 1.37%

4. Migration (1981-1998): 38% population increase was due to migration of this 39% from Punjab and 30% from NWFP.
 - Punjab migration to: 50.46% (6.3 m) from other provinces:
 - Sindh: 81.43% (2.7m)
 - NWFP: 55.21% (500,000)
 - Balochistan: 46.36% (264,500)

5. Repercussions
 - Sindhis fear becoming minority: Culture, language, identity, control of government
 - Urdu speakers: Consolidation in areas where in a majority
 - Pushto speakers: political power in relation to their numbers, economic power

6. The partition similarity

C. SOME PRINCIPLES

1. Constitution
 - Under it it is a provincial subject (fiscal, administrative)
 - The indirect election ethos
 - Indirect elections: The case of Karachi: Issues involved

2. Buffer between elected representatives and the people
 - To make representatives accountable
 - Institutions of participatory democracy
 - An effective bureaucracy

3. Declination of districts, talukas, union councils
 - History
 - Ecology
 - Revenue (Sadar, Lyari) (Octori, 2-1/2% sales tax)
 - Similar size

4. Uniformity
 - No differences: Town/cities if large should have districts
 - Similar union councils

D. SEPARATION OF SERVICE DELIVERY AND ADMINISTRATION CONTROLS REQUIRED

- Service delivery
 - Aware decisions
 - Autonomous planning and implementation agencies
 - Strong, unbending rules, regulations and procedures (what went wrong was nazims' power and political influence)
 - Massive unequal development under Mushrraf (promotion of bradari etc). LUMS studies show bureaucrats' decisions were far more equitable
 - UCs have delivered. People feel closer to power
 - CCBs case: Contractors take over (attempts at participatory development) due to lack of trust
 - Lapsing of budgets – ADPs / Education
 - Disaster: Where line departments better, relief and rehabilitation better
 - The situation today (departments do not function. TMAs too weak)

E. ADMINISTRATION / CONTROL: Revenue Department

- Bureaucracy should control itself through a proper system. Nazims should use it
- Revenue Department – most important as it controls land and hence land use. Land has replaced gold
- BoR lands, gowcher, shamlaat, agricultural land conversions, all come under Revenue Department
- When Deputy Commissioner (DC) had magisterial power, his department could and did prevent encroachments / forced conversions. Prevention made easier because police was under him
- Police under him made political repercussion easier. Now of course it is done by the intelligence agencies
- Since the DC lost magisterial power, massive encroachments on all variety of lands. DCOs say they cannot do anything as they are DCOs and not DCs
- Personal experience: Things get done. The Police reform issues: Jameel yousef

F. SOCIAL AND CULTURAL CHANGE

- Gender relations and family structures: Some statistics
- The new urban migrant: University Road settlement
- Lobbies of power: All different views on governance: Transporters, mandi, operators, CBOs, shopkeepers' organizations, farmers' organizations, informal entrepreneurs (hawkers)
- Support to and involvement of local commerce in governance (articulation of demands)
- Shrinking per capita resources
- Changing patterns of trade: Case of Dhan Mandi
- Para professionals / vocational schools
- Education / health / recreation / entertainment / culture – where does it belong?

G. BASICS

1. City – Province conflict has to be avoided. Karachi and all of Sindh's assets are for every citizen of the province

2. Fear of becoming a minority: Ethnic ghettos which are being promoted should not be supported by governance systems. Serious debate required: Generosity, trust
3. Service delivery systems: Autonomous but subservient to elected representatives
4. The Revenue Department: Freedom from political manipulation
5. Police reform